WOMEN’S REPRESENTATION IN AFGHANISTAN
Economic Empowerment and International Agencies

Oleksandra Turovska

Essay/Thesis: Master Thesis
Program and/or course: Master Degree Project in Gender Studies
Level: Second Cycle
Semester/year: Spring 2018
Supervisor: Eva Zetterman
Examiner: Juan Velasquez
Report no: xx (not to be filled in by the student/students)
Abstract

Essay/Thesis: Master Thesis
Program and/or course: Master Degree Project in Gender Studies
Level: Second Cycle
Semester/year: Spring 2018
Supervisor: Eva Zetterman
Examiner: Juan Velasquez
Report No: xx (not to be filled in by the student/students)
Keyword: women, economic empowerment, gender equality, Afghanistan

Purpose: This thesis examines the level of effectiveness of the Women Economic Empowerment Projects in Afghanistan in a certain period, especially from 2001 onward, and in accordance to the availability of the required data. The study has benefited from various sources of information on the policies and goals of governmental and non-governmental agencies, implementation of the projects, mid-term evaluation data, and overall available outcomes. The thesis further studies the effectiveness of the projects on gender equality as a priority of the society.

Theory: The theoretical standpoint of this study is based on some points that behind the women empowerment in Afghanistan there is neoliberal rationality, the Western privilege of representation and the lack of room for arguments of the effectiveness of the programmes which creates non-performativity from gender theoretical perspective.

Method: The research has been conducted in the light of the existing documentation on Women Economic Empowerment Programs in Afghanistan. In this study, the empirical data has been found through the process of collecting first-hand and secondary sources such as governmental and non-governmental publications.

Result: The results of this study introduce accumulated data and draw the importance of transparency concerning international donor agencies activities in Afghanistan. In addition, the empirical data will be interpreted together with theoretical perspective for acknowledgment of the presence of incompatible gaps in the effectiveness of the projects and its transparency.
1. INTRODUCTION 1
2. METHODOLOGY 6
   2.1 Limitations 7
3. THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES 9
   3.1 Neoliberal rationality 9
   3.2 Representation 13
   3.3 Performativity/non-performativity 14
4. DEVELOPMENT AGENCIES 16
   4.1 USAID 17
   4.1.1 USAID: Afghan Women in the Economy (WIE) Program in Afghanistan 19
   4.1.2 Mid-term performance evaluation of Afghan Women in the Economy (WIE) Program 20
   4.2 DFID 21
   4.2.1 DFID’s contribution to the Women Empowerment projects 22
   4.3 SIDA 23
   4.3.1 SIDA’s contribution to the Women Empowerment projects 24
   4.4 WORLD BANK 26
5. CONCLUSION AND ANALYSIS OF RESEARCH RESULTS 28
6. Reference list 33
Appendix 1. List of figures and images 37
Appendix 2 38
Terms and abbreviations

AID Agency for International Development
ANDS Afghanistan National Development Strategy
DFID Department for International Development (UK)
GBV Gender-based violence
IDP Internally displaced person
ISAF International Security Assistance Force (UN program)
ISIS Islamic State of Iraq and the Shaam
MoWA Ministry of Women’s Affairs Afghanistan
NAPWA National Action Plan for the Women of Afghanistan
NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organization
SIDA Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency
USAID United States Agency for International Development
WIE Women in the Economy program
WLD Women’s Leadership Development Program
1. INTRODUCTION

In its modern history and especially after late 1970s, Afghanistan, has suffered from war and political instability. Thirty years of war has destroyed 80% of the infrastructure of the country and has also forced about 10 to 15% of the population to flee their homeland and seek refuge abroad. Thousands of internally displaced people IDPs and more than a million disabled nationals are other painful results of war and matters of priority for the country of a poor economy (Fukuyama, 2006).

Mountainous and landlocked Afghanistan is bordered up by Pakistan to the south and east, Iran to the west and Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan, and Tajikistan to the north. In the farthest northeast, Afghanistan has a common border with China.

The war is still part of everyday life there. It has brought the country to bankrupted position and has also prevented any economic social developments as well as other areas of development.

At the time of the beginning of the war (1978-1989), which arose during the interference of the former Soviet Union and occupation of the country by its military troops, women, mainly in the urban areas, had relatively better access to education, health services, work opportunities and other human rights. After the fall of the former Soviet Union’s backed government in 1992 the civil war took place between Islamist resistance groups and continued until 1996 that resulted in the rise of Taliban.

A report of the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance states:
At the time the war took place, women’s freedom of movement was restricted by the threat of physical and sexual violence and by decrees limiting their activity outside the home (International IDEA, 2015).

In 1995, the emergence of the Taliban resulted in the further instability of Afghanistan and after the fall of the capital Kabul in the hands of Taliban and occupation of power by the Taliban, their regime became well-established for their repression of women and dissidents as well as the destruction of the country's cultural heritages. The Taliban imposed strict punishments on any woman who abandons dwelling without a male accompanying and declared restriction to the private space of the home for women. In 2001, the Taliban were overthrown as a result of the international military operations in Afghanistan. (Afghanembassy.us, 2018).
Taliban fled Kabul in 2001 and as the outcome of the Bonn Agreement an Interim Administration was established to lead the country. Bonn Agreement was reached under the supervision of the United Nations in the absence of Taliban and between twenty-five representatives from Northern Alliance (National Front for Freedom of Afghanistan led by Ahmad Shah Masoud National Hero of Afghanistan), representatives of the former King of Afghanistan, US and Europe based Afghan politicians including women. According to International IDEA report (2015), the military presence of NATO and ISAF increased in Afghanistan until 2010. Taliban remained active in southern parts of the country and gradually reorganized their troops and are still organizing suicide attacks in Kabul and other major cities of the country (Rahmani and Hoseini, 2012).

By 2014, the vast number of international combat troops left Afghanistan, therefore terrorist groups such as ISIS, Taliban, Haqqani Network and others become more active in various parts of the country than ever before. According to the BBC News (Dahlgreen, 2018). This created some difficulties to reach security and stability.

Political and security improvements within Afghanistan continue to be a heavy burden for country's poor economy. According to the World Bank, no recovery in the business sphere is being noticed (2018). The government is not proficient enough to provide vital public services, maintain day-to-day economic activities, and enforce needed measures to provide tangible economic and social results (The World Bank, 2018).

Continued war, insecurity, instability and conservative society are the main factors that create barriers in front of any positive changes to reach gender equality in the country. The history of the country shows that as one of the first attempts towards gender equality, in 1923 King Amanullah enacted «personal freedom» to all «subjects», binary genders living in the country, which was the first formal mentioning about gender equality. Since that time, women's emancipation has seen a period of improvement, while Taliban rule, put women's equality far aside (Pain, Rothman, and Lundin, 2015:52 cited in British and foreign state papers, 1923).

After the fall of Taliban in 2001 Afghanistan was called a land without state. The country was considered to present fundamental issues of state building. No governmental institution was able to provide basic services.
Today, the country is governed by a relatively democratic constitution and three pillars of power including legislative, executive and judiciary branches. Regarding the women empowerment and women participation in social and political seen, there are women empowerment and gender equality goals incorporated in the 10-year National Action Plan for the Women of Afghanistan (NAPWA), which are patronized by the government - Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS).

Moreover, the Afghan Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MoWA) was established in 2001 to assist and maintain the implementation of women right as a new ministry within the Afghan Government.

Although, women still do not possess the same rights as men and do not have enough access to basic health and education and other social services in the country, according to the SIDA’s evaluation report, significant improvements gains have been achieved since 2001 (Pain, Rothman, and Lundin, 2015:52).
1.1 AIM of the Study

The aim of the study is to focus on the effectiveness of Women’s Economic Empowerment projects and examine the relevance, results, and outcomes. Due to the limitations mentioned below, the study examines the effectiveness of the Women Economic Empowerment projects focusing on the activities of the international agencies from United States of America, Sweden, United Kingdom as well as World Bank.

Research question:
How effective are the projects of Women Economic Empowerment in Afghanistan?
1.2 Gender Issue

This study represents Women Empowerment Projects in Afghanistan taking into consideration projects, financed or implemented by international donors.

The researcher realizes the importance of the inclusion of non-binary genders in most of the discussion related to equality of rights, although, the study does not cover the issues of non-binary genders in the Afghan society due to the following reasons:

- the standpoint of the study is to discuss the impact of the economy changes on females in Afghanistan
- international donors do not touch the non-binary genders issues in Afghanistan and do not implement a single project concerning this topic
- the role of non-binary genders in Afghan society requires a separate research and online source of the agencies do not provide any information regarding this issue

The need for a separate research is highly recognized, but this research is not covering that part.
2. METHODOLOGY

The research is conducted in the light of the existing literature on Women Economic Empowerment Projects, mostly published by development agencies in Afghanistan. In this study, the empirical data is found through the first-hand and secondary sources.

Taking into consideration various theoretical aspects such as neoliberal rationality, representation, and performativity, the initial purpose of the study was to explore the effectiveness of the Women Empowerment projects in Afghanistan from the gender perspectives. For this purpose, several online and published documents provided by donors and implementing agencies have been used, though the transparency of the data can be questioned. The idea of the study is to seek an understanding of the impact of the income generation projects within the country, focusing on the analysis from the leading governmental organizations (local and foreign) and NGOs.

The study was planned to focus on all of the relevant projects implemented in the country, but due to the lack of access to the required data which will be discussed later in this paper, the study mostly focuses on the agencies from United States of America, Sweden, United Kingdom as well as World Bank.

The aim of the study is to focus on the effectiveness of women’s economic empowerment projects and examine the relevance, results, and outcomes of the projects.
Although by the implementation of these projects a significant number of women have positively benefited from the programs, but due to the lack of access to the accurate and transparent information and reliable resources the effectiveness of the above-mentioned projects in Afghanistan shall not be assessed only based on this study.
2.1 Limitations

Even though several online and published resources provide various data about the design, program and implementation of some projects on women economic empowerment, limitations were also faced in the process of study and research.

First, lack of available and or reliable data occurred during the study and research. The online and published data are provided by either the donor or implementing agencies who naturally try to focus on the success of their projects and not on the shortcomings.

Second, lack of prior studies on the topic and in particular about Afghanistan’s women can also be counted as a limitation for this study. While a small number of previously conducted studies are available in local languages, considering the accuracy of the data collection methods, this sort of documents have not been used in the process of study.

Third, some difficulties were experienced during the process of the analyze of the projects from the gender perspective using theories and previously collected data of online publications. There are numerous amount of published project plans, assessment papers, annual reports (yet, not provided by all organizations) which constitute a considerable platform for analysis of the projects and its complexity, nevertheless, it creates demand for in-depth evaluation papers to be introduced. In-depth evaluation in this paper should be interpreted in a way which introduces to public all kind of experiences related to happy and unhappy practices throughout the project.

Fourth, a different type of limitation has also been faced in the process of this study, especially in the process of implementing the plan for this study. Lack of information provided by implementing NGOs directly work in different and mostly remote areas of Afghanistan can be counted as a serious limitation. Therefore, the initial idea of this study had to be slightly changed.

Due to the lack of publications by local NGOs, the use of a few publications provided by governmental institutions such as Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livelihood of the government of Afghanistan was preferred as a relatively reliable source.

Despite these limitations, while this study is not presenting the result of the activities of all organization involved in the promotion of women empowerment in Afghanistan, the study can
still be considered as a useful gauge for measuring the usefulness of the projects and effectiveness of the performance of a number of governmental agencies.

In order to have an accurate study of the same subject, a first-hand study of the living conditions of the women benefited from the economic empowerment projects and a comparison between their current and previous living conditions may further assist similar studies in the future.
3. THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

3.1 Neoliberal rationality

It has been intertwined and proposed by Michel Foucault to analyse the power relations in a way which requires to admit that relations are an inalienable aspect of subjects; The philosopher presupposes the existence of politicisation within the power and subject, which affects variation between public and private (Oksala, 2011:104). While referring to Oksala, power should be understood as something that generates subject, rather than seeing it from the outside where power is not a part of the subject itself (2011:104). Judith Butler interpreted this idea in a way where category of «women» falls under the «produced and restrained» powers (1999:5).

Michel Foucault explains that economy as the constitutional processes and most of the processes which are taking place in society, where the principal player within the system - population. Political economy as a science brought up out of networks which interact with «population, territory and wealth» (Foucault, 1991:100-101). The concept of the political economy was described as the economy which is “the science of wealth” and “deals with efforts made by man [sic.] to supply wants and satisfy desires” (Eatwell, Milgate, and Newman, 1987:907).

Based on the fact that satisfying the desire is a priority, the government loses its influence on the population. According to Michel Foucault, the society creates its regulations and does not see government as means for the ruling. As opposed to sovereignty, the state does not make an effort to promote government, but instead, contemporaneously, it encourages welfare state using various techniques for affecting people's consciousness. Ahmed regard it as «happiness industry», where the world is constructed around the idea to orient people with the aim of finding work-family balance together with personal balance (Ahmed, 2010, cited in Rottenberg, 2014:432).

For instance, Michel Foucault (1991:92) realizes the similarity between the family and the government of the state, where these two «institutions» should be aware how «exercising power» function. The family model is no more regarded as the guideline which is expected to take the place by society but rather seen as the instrument for population increase and mortality
rate decrease, which Michel Foucault also delineate as «instrumentally relative» (Foucault, 1991:100).

It is correlated with neoliberal feminism, mainly focusing on introduction of the solution to only one type of inequality, where according to Rottenberg «…the production of neoliberal feminism makes cultural sense since it becomes one more domain that neoliberal governmentality colonises and remakes in its own image» (2014:432).

Neoliberalism can be specified as the system which comprehend a maximized competition, and free trading is being deregulated through the marketplace by resulting in no tariffs, which generates encouraging conditions for running enterprises. Within neoliberalism, the state is being controlled by the market which coordinates processes of the country and society.

First of all, the state's primary responsibility is to adopt upon the need of the market for instance immigration policy. Secondly, Brown discloses (2003), most of the practices are being beneficially measured by the state, which determines the government is being less concerned in regard to profit itself. According to the model of the legitimate authority, the government ought to be responsible for the economy of the state, while within the bounds of neoliberalism, the state takes the position on the side (Brown, 2003: 38-42).

According to Brown, market rationality is being spread to almost every aspect of citizenry life/sphere. For instance, based on the Brown’s arguments of neoliberalism, the Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment Policy paper of USAID agency is remaining a part of a market rationality: women are encouraged to make money and to be converted into business owners who are pushed «to give their lives a specific entrepreneurial form» (Lemke, 2002 cited in Brown, 2003:44). In parallel, the foremost purpose of the updated policy paper of USAID agency, which is not only promoting the income generation projects is seen also as a way to maximize profit.

Based on the Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment Policy paper and also on the basis of the policy paper which was released in 1982, aspect of neoliberal rationality within the implementing projects can be traced. Income generation and the boost of the economy are main priorities within all issues and areas of activity.
Wendy Brown indicates in her article «Neoliberalism and the End of Liberal Democracy», political perspective in the US of neoliberal rationality is presented as prevailing one (Brown, 2003:37). Rottenberg (2014:420) describes the neoliberalism as political rationality which requires individuals to turn into active entrepreneurial players.

Meanwhile, the main aim of the intervention of the international agencies projects is to empower and promote women in the economy, which plays a role of intermediary within the process of creating market values, which at the same moment encouraging present or future business owners to reach to stability and resolute in their decision-making process relating to established enterprises.

Moreover, according to the USAID Policy, gender equality in the economy provides a good impact, such as competition, while owning an enterprise promotes people to become competitive and increase their capital.

According to Brown, neoliberalism influences the individuals the way it influences every single sphere of life and makes people more rational, the author states: «...neoliberalism equates moral responsibility with rational action; it erases the discrepancy between economic and moral behaviour by configuring morality entirely as a matter of rational deliberation about costs, benefits, and consequences» (Brown, 2003:42).

Drawing on Rottenberg (2014:428) as well, neoliberalism construct feminism in a way women do not rely on the state and government but embody absolute «self-responsibility».

As previously mentioned neoliberalism policies make women convinced that they are individuals, and this is their responsibility to grasp all opportunities to make the most and be concerned about well-being. Neoliberalism makes people to be players on their own, creating gender marginality.

The situation of being involved in the labour market and still not being paid equally generates a false image of women taking the same level as men. In addition to other responsibilities that they have, working women are financial contributors within the family but they still do not have the same rights and their voices are not heard.
Becoming entrepreneurs does not reveal women from a burden of responsibilities on the domestic level, for instance. It is set as a household structure, not because of the cultural aspects, as well as the contribution of authorities vision of women's role in society.

According to Liff & Wajcman (1996:80), «...range of initiatives cannot simply be categorised as just granting equality by sameness or equal treatment». Most of the societies are facing a boom of self-affirmation of women who are willing to occupy managerial positions, which is not spreading on any other sphere than business and labour due to «...construction of ‘woman as different’ embodies the notion of ‘different from male’» (Liff, & Wajcman,1996:87).

Judith Butler adding up, highlighting the following:

> Women can never “be,” according to this ontology of substances, precisely because they are the relation of difference, the excluded, by which that domain marks itself off. Women are also a “difference” that cannot be understood as the simple negation or “Other” of the always-already-masculine subject (1999:25)

Following the idea of « difference» that leads to the fact that the category of «women» shall be seen as an independent and separate category, not the other way around, inasmuch as it is interpreted this way.

It might be seen as a reason which leaves women with the position in the society as those whose primary responsibility to «protect the household» remains, not taking into consideration their self-realization and achievements at the workplace and other spheres. This also might lead to the radicalisation between women based on class and race, which will add up on inequalities.

According to Liff, Sonia, & Wajcman (1996:91), policies which would focus on minorities and diverse society will lead to transformation within working conditions.

By way of conclusion, drawing on Rottenberg, USA is making a tremendous input with the help of oppressive practices to reach gender equality in Muslim countries by that showing influence and power, which is a false impression (2014:434). This approach is a way to lurk pressing unsolvable problems within a nation turning away criticism from inside.

Taking into consideration USAID Policy and projects context, the neoliberal approach is being actively traceable. Most of the highlights are leading to invoke women start participating and contributing to the economy of the country.
3.2 Representation

Neoliberal rationality influences the perception of the world and directions which we take to develop ourselves. This approach can be also described as implantation of ideas in the specific space place. Implanting of ideas gives a feeling of prevalence or superiority. According to the Hall, in one of the representation approaches, the world is constructed through the representational systems – concepts and signs, whereby construction approach includes following:

we must not confuse the material world, where things and people exist, and the symbolic practices and processes through which representation, meaning and language operate. Constructivists do not deny the existence of the material world. However, it is not the material world which conveys meaning: it is the language system or whatever system we are using to represent our concepts. It is social actors who use the conceptual systems of their culture and the linguistic and other representational systems to construct meaning, to make the world meaningful and to communicate about that world meaningfully to others (1997:25).

Spivak in her essay «Can the Subaltern Speak?» presents the theory of subalternity, which indicates oppressed people or the person of «inferior rank». Spivak demonstrates voices of subaltern which are suppressed «between the imperialist/colonialist object-constitution and the nationalist/patriarchal subject-formation» (Vinayaraj, 2013:5), borrowing the term of «subaltern» from Gramsci. Spivak continues with following:

if in the context of colonial production, the subaltern has no history and cannot speak, the subaltern as female is even more deeply in shadow» (1988:83).

Spivak mentions the representor is always a mass and representing the others is not their privilege; it faces high critique of speaking for them, representing them is seen as an issue (Spivak, 1988:70). Spivak, following Deleuze`s argument, outlines two types of representation that goes hand in hand: one way is to represent by «speaking for», in politics and «re-representation» in art and culture, where no intellectuals can represent «those who act and struggle» (Foucault, 1977:206 cited in Spivak 1988: 70).

To put as a sample the USAID agency help comes from the government of United States as the demonstration of «generosity» of the country and level of development. As Barad states:

Representationalism is so deeply entrenched within Western culture that it has taken on a common-sense appeal. It seems inescapable, if not downright natural (2003:806).
The policy of USAID demonstrates vision and goals, outcomes, operational principles which will be implemented all around inferior nations in the world. Some critical principles in agenda of USAID Policy are to serve as a thought-leader and a learning community, which will help the organisation to work out gender gap.

Taking into consideration that significant part of projects the agency implementing is being focused on various gender issues in the world not without financial hue. For instance, drawing on USAID Policy, women who experienced gender-based violence (GBV) are be like not good earners for the living. It for sure creates the economic effect such as small labour market participation rate, decrease productivity; affects earning, investment and, apparently, savings (USAID, 2012:7).

To give importance to projects that focus on income generation and participation of women in the economy of the specific country can be perceived that women occupy the vulnerable position, where they lack word, and the agency is being privileged for having the right to «speak for».

Power is spread around by the ruling class, which, in particular situation, defined by the interest of the developing agencies and capitalist exploitation in Third World Countries. Spivak also refers to the fact that each place differs from the economic conditions and level of development, which creates not equal and fair approach (Foucault, 1977:214 cited in Spivak 1988: 74-79).

Inculcation of solutions of the social-based issues from one country to the other nation might see as not entirely fruitful and productive due to several reasons, primarily if projects are mostly oriented on one specific economic problem, where neoliberal rationality is observed which interlace with other projects.

3.3 Performativity/non-performativity

Besides keeping in mind subalternity or representation as a way to analyse projects implemented by numerous development agencies, it is also vital to bring up performativity into the context, where one issue is being faced and focused on, while other essential aspects go unnoticed (non-performativity).

As Judith Butler states that gender is performatively established, which means the following: it is a process of repetition where norms create us as a subject in a gender relation. The repetition
of the norms might be oppressive. This might help to interpret activities of the agencies in Afghanistan, which are explained as instruments for the women empowerment projects. In the situation of projects, it might assist in income generation, although, most of the cases might lead to the oppression from the male side.

Judith Butler follows the idea that women are in need of becoming a part of economic development and being involved in income generating projects is also performative. First of all, according to Butler, performativity is a way to think about «effects», where, for instance, state and economy are «...knowable and unified...» due to the outcomes of the specific process (2010:147).

These performative actions (projects implementations, for example) imply the fulfilment of a real engagement that changes the actual situation. Therefore, they can not be considered either true or false. It can also be said that Women Economic Empowerment projects create the identity of individuals where gender identity is a performative education regulated by social sanctions or taboos or, in this particular situation, breaking the social «sanctions». With the help of these social norms, certain «new» prescribed behaviour following Western canons is slowly being applied to other states and societies. Drawing on Butler:

If one remains within the presumption that performativity works (and that we only trace the ways in which economic life is ‘made’), then performativity is assimilated to the notion of cultural construction (2010:152)

While the implementation of projects is taken as the performative act, where construction of the role of women in the society and development of the economy in the country take place, non-performativity, simultaneously, is traced.

The essential characteristics of non-performativity of certain projects of women empowerment the fact that the actions which are being implemented, are not sufficiently prosperous. That follows that «effects», with the help of which Judith Butler describes the concept, are not met. Outcomes of some projects might not be set correctly, or, in the worst scenario, the actions are not the catalyst for the change according to the plan or even policy paper.

Summing up, the concept of non-performativity should be brought up in details while discussing the outcomes of income generation project implementation, which might outline the situation in the best way.
4. DEVELOPMENT AGENCIES

After the fall of Taliban in 2001, international partners under the mission of “fight against terror” rushed to Afghanistan to fight Al Qaida and Taliban and eradicate fundamentalism and terrorist networks.

The list of “must do” was too long. Political, social and economic spheres of the country required immediate assistance and in the other hand, donors also required to reach some sort of coordination amongst themselves.

Maintaining security, dealing with the warlords who resisted against Taliban and had some parts of the country in their control, paving the road for election and a democratic society, maintaining the human rights standards and providing aid to avoid humanitarian disasters in remote areas of the country, were all in the priority list of international partners and donor agencies.

After 2001, Afghanistan has come a long way, but still needs to be supported by the international community to reach self-reliance and stability.

Today, there are a considerable number of international donors which contribute to various areas of development, including gender equality. Some of the agencies provide a significant contribution to the Women Economic Empowerment, while others focus on education, provision of health services and social services including reduction of violence against women.

Several international agencies and institutions such as USAID, SIDA, DFID and World Bank are tremendously involved in various activities and projects that led to the women empowerment, but the approaches are different.

Empowerment, in this research and further discussion of the international agencies, is interpreted as a way to represent, educate, provide the person with a power and expand their role in the fields of economy politics and social life. Empowering is a process through which changes come to life.

Based on the findings below, the theoretical perspectives of Foucault, Butler, Spivak and Brown provide an explanation of numerous processes and help to elaborate the findings in the last section of this paper.
4.1 USAID

United States Agency for International Development, which was launched in 1961 by executive order of the former President John F. Kennedy, is known as one of the largest official aid leading agencies of the United States federal government which is primarily responsible for administering civilian foreign aid and promoting development in different areas.

The motto of the USAID is efforts for and from the American people, which is also a part of «demonstration American generosity» (usaid.gov, 2018). USAID agency is contributing to the global health, global stability, humanitarian assistance, acceleration of innovation and partnership, and empowering women and girls all over the world in approximately 125 countries.

One of the principal projects of the agency is Women Empowerment, which is being launched in around 80 countries all over the worlds. Within Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment, one of the main focuses is boosting women`s economy growth.

According to USAID Opportunities of Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment, the female part of the global population makes up one-half of human capital in any economy, which means gender equality in the economy provides an outstanding impact, such as competition (USAID, 2012). Women's engagement in the economy fosters to build a vibrant and dynamic country's economy and gain access to the capital and other privileges.

The first Policy paper was presented in 1982. The document illustrates the implementation of AID's Women in Development emphasising on positions of LCD women within leading industries such as agriculture development, human resources, and institutions, employment and income generation, health and water.

According to the Policy of Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment, the USAID’s vision of Gender equality is «to enjoy economic, social, cultural, civil, and political rights and are equally empowered to secure better lives for themselves, their families, and their communities; are equally able to access quality education and healthcare; accumulate and control their own economic assets and resources; exercise their own voice, and live free from intimidation, harassment, discrimination, and violence». Among other visions is also to develop and support women's initiatives and leadership, leading them to success in politics, economy, and society in general (USAID, 2012:10).
There are outcome goals of the policy that should be achieved; the first and the primary one is reducing gender gap which does not allow women to benefit from the wealth and such aspects as economic, social, political and cultural opportunities. One of the first operational principles is to provide employment and participation of all genders in the societies. Besides that, it is fundamental to bring the change into women employment and careers.
4.1.1 USAID: Afghan Women in the Economy (WIE) Program in Afghanistan

Over the past 15 years, USAID’s Projects have been contributing to the improvement of the social status of Afghan women considering a number of priorities in the country.

As the largest women’s empowerment program in the history of the Agency, PROMOTE as a five years program aims to advance opportunities for Afghan women to become leaders of the political, private sector and civil society. Promote targets education and training of the new generation of Afghan women and to increase women participation in the fields of economy, decision making process and to provide them the opportunity to take positions within the government and obtain skills required for business management (usaid.gov, 2018).

The five parts of the program are designed to contribute in various areas to promote gender equality:

• Women’s Leadership Development (WLD) Program
• Women in Government Program
• Women’s Civil Society Organizations and Coalitions (Musharikat) Program
• Afghan Women in the Economy (WIE) Program
• Education

In 2015, USAID launched WIE as a four-year programme to promote gender equality and women’s empowerment through long-term investment.

WIE works in five regional economic zones across Afghanistan, with offices in Kabul, Herat, Mazar-i-Sharif, Jalalabad, and Kandahar provinces.

Women in the Economy (WIE) is created in partnership with the Government of Afghanistan to provide the new generation of Afghan women with necessary skills and knowledge for contribution for the development in the economy, governance, and civil society.

The vital aspect of the project is to empower Afghan women to gain skills and resources to contribute to its Afghan economic development (usaid.gov, 2018).

One of the top priorities is to contribute to the expansion of the women-owned enterprises. Besides that, educational training and technical schooling to improve business activities together with the assistance of managers to contribute to women skills growth.
In addition, Women in the Economy (WIE) project is the alliance between private companies, that works on to upgrade workplace environment, which is comfortable enough for women also to join the workplace. The goal behind is to assist women-owned business that hire women to expand and perform in a better way, improving their sustainability. For educated women who are at the age between 18 and 30, WIE provides assistance with finding job, career counselling and developing skills for successful employment according to market demand.

Women’s empowerment has been recognised by USAID as the main foundation for economic growth, peace and security of the country. While the Agency contributes in different programs such as Leadership Development, Representation in Government and Civil Society to promote women’s empowerment, but this study focuses on Women in the Economy WIE or Women’s Economic Empowerment.

4.1.2 Mid-term performance evaluation of Afghan Women in the Economy (WIE) Program

Based on the WIE program goals, there is mid-term project evaluation paper, which not necessarily reflects on USAID views, although, illustrates description and assessment of the project from an independent point of view.

One of the primary goals of this paper is to provide effect estimation of Women in the Economy (WIE) programme which focuses on women’s presence in the economy, the success of which ought to lead to empowerment from the beginning of the project in July 2015 to October 2016.

WIE project is in possession of great networking, particularly business communities, schools, governmental institutions, which might have a «better» coverage regarding economy improvement. Initially, at the beginning of the paper under methods, it states:

the number of beneficiaries who have already received WIE support, and the overall impact of the program are, consequently, somewhat limited (USAID. Mission to Afghanistan, 2017).

Analysing the findings of the evaluation report, a job placement pipeline is used to identify market demand and requirements for successful employment. Within the WIE program, a considerable amount of job placement platforms (search engines) are being launched together with the help of intense marketing campaign for the women employment. One of the principal approaches used is campaign advertisement, which creates and improves awareness of women
of the «safe workplace» and disposing of women's fear of harassment at the workspace (USAID. Mission to Afghanistan, 2017). WIE also highlights influential sides of the agency and program in general which in favour of reaching out the network of partners and connected business networks.

The entire report includes only a few negative aspects which were faced since the day of launching WIE program. In one of these contrary practices 98% percent of survey participants described women-friendly workplaces, while only 2% experienced harassment, feeling of not the safe place or inappropriate behaviour from male colleagues according to surveys and interviews.

Another obstacle which was highlighted is the deficiency in professional skilled management within small and local business in Afghanistan, which prevents the companies to step out to the next level of development. This running business prevents contribution to «outside services», according to report of USAID on Midterm evaluation (USAID. Mission to Afghanistan, 2017).

USAID reports provide a vast scope of information regarding the project, primary areas to focus on and future practices for implementation. The reports outline all positive aspect of the project of Women in the Economy and how beneficiaries will benefit from it.

The mid-term evaluation paper does comprise a few observations concerning obstacles while accomplishing the plan of the project. Simultaneously, observations regarding unsuccessful practices regarding women experience of the project were not highlighted or observed.

4.2 DFID

DFID is the UK's Department for the International Development that was established in 1997 to work on poverty eradication in the world.

DFID recognizes that 40 years of war had a negative impact on Afghanistan’s economy and political stability and have left it one of the poorest and most fragile states. DFID believes that assisting Afghanistan will help to reduce poverty but from the other hand it will have a positive impact on the security of UK, as it will reduce threats of violence and extremism as well as reduces illegal migration.
4.2.1 DFID’s contribution to the Women Empowerment projects

DFID emphasizes on economic growth as a key tool toward poverty eradication and political and social stability in poorest country. As one of the main donors of Afghanistan, DFID spends around 155 million pounds on annual basis to support different development programs in the country. 44% of its annual budget for Afghanistan is allocated for Economic Development, 28% for Governance and Security, 19% for Humanitarian support, 8% for Human Development, but the details of the supported projects are not available on the online publications of the Agency and remain unclear (Gov.uk, 2018).

As long as economic development, humanitarian support and women and girls are concerned, DFID has made a commitment to create 35,000 jobs by 2023 and will improve land productivity by mine clearing programs. Women and girls will receive assistance in the fields of education and health care and 1.7 million people 50% of them women, will have access to agricultural services by 2018 (Gov.uk, 2018).

Over 50% of DFID’s donation to Afghanistan is channelled through WB and approximately 30% of its annual assistance to Afghanistan is delivered through multilateral partners (Gov.uk, 2018).

One of the institutions through which DFID provides a great contribution to women empowerment projects is Asia Foundation. The Asia Foundation is a non-profit organization established in 1954 with the headquarter in San Francisco. The organization is known for its high dedication to the improvement of people's lives across Asia.

According to the report Asian Women’s Empowerment Programs in Afghanistan there are projects which promote women economic participation within the country. Asia Foundation states that the organization`s key goals and promotion capacity features are «strengthen governance, empower women, expand economic opportunity, increase environmental resilience, and promote regional cooperation» (Asia Foundation, 2011).

Besides that, the organization has various areas of activity such as political participation and assistance to the Ministry of Women Affairs, improving education process for women and girls, development of social justice for females within Islamic structure, women labour rights and women`s agriculture production.
Asian Foundation is in cooperation with Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs, Martyrs, and the Disabled (MoLSAMMD) working to expand awareness about labour law and promote women equality at working place. Besides that, various workshops take place in provinces which helps to create awareness about women rights (Asia Foundation, 2011). Taking into consideration a few aspects mentioned in the report regarding the women empowerment, there is no detailed description of the project, outcomes, and happy/unhappy practices. Important to add, the Asia Foundation’s programs receive funding from DFID and U.S. Agency for International Development (Asia Foundation, 2011).

A number of the projects of Afghanaid, a London based NGO, is also funded by DFID. The assistance provided by the organization is directed towards vulnerable families in rural communities and women. Women Economic Empowerment projects delivered by Afghanaid underpin women to gain necessary skills to run their home-based enterprises.

According to Afghanaid online publications, within the four-year project, 14,000 women received necessary training and equipment to run home-based businesses. Outcomes state that 98% of women improved their relations with the male member of the family and eventually, started contributing to the decision-making process at the family level (Afghanaid.org.uk, 2018).

4.3 SIDA

SIDA - the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency - is a governmental agency working on behalf of the Swedish parliament and government, with the mission to reduce poverty and provide development assistance to the vulnerable communities in the world.

With the help and cooperation with other NGOs and global organizations, Sweden’s Policy for Global Development is being supported through SIDA (Sida.se, 2018).
Regarding Afghanistan, Swedish development agency’s aims are to help local people in Afghanistan, particularly taking into consideration women and children’s rights. Besides that, the agency’s goal is to strengthen women`s and men`s positions in the society, including equal rights within the social development.

Considering Sweden’s Feminist Foreign Policy, gender equality is perceived as the important field of Sweden’s activity in Afghanistan.

SIDA promotes and contributes to women's education and protection of their rights, enhancement maternal health care and their participation in decision-making processes in the country. Special attention has been paid to midwives and school teachers, who are being educated to reach successful practices.

Some important changes have also been implemented to assist the reduction of violence against women such as protection through establishing women's shelters in around twenty provinces including legal assistance and support for rehabilitation. In addition to this, Sida states for its contribution to the EVAW Act, which aims to prevent and protect from gender-based violence in the country (Sida.se, 2018).

4.3.1 SIDA`s contribution to the Women Empowerment projects

Based on the publicly available data, Sida is a funder of 32 gender projects, which are run under the broad program, cooperated with UNOPS. The aim of gender projects is to make markets accessible for women who are based in the rural areas of the country.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>USD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government &amp; civil society</td>
<td>33.8 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Multi sector</td>
<td>22.1 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency response</td>
<td>19.4 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>13.7 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and storage</td>
<td>8.9 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other social infrastructure</td>
<td>8.5 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>7.3 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business and other services</td>
<td>5.9 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population Policies/Programmes and Reproductive Health</td>
<td>1.1 m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>380 k</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unallocated/unspecified</td>
<td>249 k</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Projects have been implemented in four northern provinces in Afghanistan. Women are provided with the workplaces in «…tailoring and embroidery, wire basket weaving, knitting, baking, wool spinning and keeping livestock and poultry» (Sida.se, 2015).

Women received training from UNOPS, which helped women to generate revenue in the sum of about $50 per day. According to Shura Ajamal Murdi, women are extremely satisfied with the changes and the way their life is improving (Sida.se, 2015).

Besides the above, Sida has a public available published report from the UNICEF Afghanistan on Basic Education and Gender Equality (BEGE) programme, which was commissioned by the Sida. Based on the report, Sida’s main priority is to provide necessary educational support to children (especially girls). The project focuses on 10 provinces in Afghanistan.

In the report from Sida «Review of Sida’s Support to Afghanistan - Lessons and Conclusions from 7 Evaluations» it has been mentioned that income-generation interventions have brought such changes to the society as «…good social space for networking and solidarity…» (Pain, Rothman, and Lundin, 2015:15). Although, no detailed information and evaluations of income generation are provided in the report itself.
4.4 WORLD BANK

World Bank was established in 1944, from where financial and technical assistance springs to developing countries. Most of the support encompasses in areas such as education, health, public administration, foundation, financial and private sector development, agriculture, and environmental and natural resource management.

As long as Afghanistan and Women’s Economic Empowerment is considered, a national priority program under the name of Women’s Economic Empowerment National Priority Programme (WEE-NPP) Support Project, started in 2017 to provide economic assets for females in Afghanistan. Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs, Martyrs and Disabled (MoLSAMD) implements the project. Investment will go through the citizens of the country, the Agriculture National Priority Program, and the Human Development National Priority Program according to the project information document (PID) (World Bank, 2007:2).

On 15th of May 2018 and with the assistance of the WB under National Agriculture and Livestock Productivity Project the update of the program become available to public, where Gender Empowerment is also considered, and the project is implemented by the Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock of Afghanistan.
Based on this update, the distribution of chicken took place in Southern Afghanistan, Paktia province, where 500 vulnerable women will receive 30 chickens each under economic empowerment program.

They will also receive some accessories for a small chicken form and it is expected that they will receive 540 eggs per month from the form. The price of each egg is 8 AFG and in total it will make 4320 AFG per woman equal to $ 60 a month (mail.gov.af, 2018).
5. CONCLUSION AND ANALYSIS OF RESEARCH RESULTS

The main question that requires to be answered is about the effectiveness of the Women’s Empowerment Projects in Afghanistan and the effect of these project on representation and gender equality with the help of above mentioned theoretical perspectives and concepts.

As it has been discussed in this study, in 2001 after the fall of Taliban and in order to fight terrorism and support state-building in Afghanistan, international partners rushed to Afghanistan. Multiplicity of the donors can be a privilege but meanwhile it can rise the question of coordination amongst donors.

Transparency and prioritization of the programs can also be questioned, but the main limitation is access to larger amount of information about the implementation of project and the exact outcome of the projects. These issues within the agencies might be interpreted with the concept of Butler - performativity, which will be mentioned later on in the conclusion.

All agencies, which have been taken into consideration in this document, stated their priority is to be transparent concerning their projects which imply to be implemented on their behalf. USAID manifest the entire efforts of the agency is for and from the American people, which continues interpreted as «demonstration American generosity» (usaid.gov, 2018). This approach corresponds with Rottenburg (2014:434) where mentioned above American approach correlates with oppressive practices such as showing the power and influence from the West and to keep up with the status of powerful state.

One of the intentions is to provide citizens with relevant information to make them knowledgeable about donation distribution. World Bank Group has published the report to demonstrate the awareness of the mistakes that came into sight during the implementation of projects Women in the Economy. One of the strategic components and lesson learned is to enhance the accessibility and analysis of gender statistics (2017:4).

Since developing agencies have responsibilities for sharing the information about implementation process and achievements, based on this research which has been conducted, the lack of the information sharing can create a great misunderstanding. In addition to the
transparency issues, the lack of in-depth analysis about projects, outcomes, availability of the description of happy/unhappy practices took place during the research, leads to consideration of performativity, which might be elaborated with the help of Butler, where performativity takes places as a process of repetition, where group of women in Afghanistan created as a subject with the help of norms or “projects”. Projects are being implemented one by one, although, no available documentation provided about most of the projects.

Drawing on Butler, performativity is a way to think about «effects», a continuation of the Women Economic Empowerment or performing new projects with the assistance of other donors illustrates one facet of the process and progress, which has been created due to outcomes of the certain activity or outcome (2010:147).

Women Economic Empowerment projects might be interpreted as those that create the identity of individuals where gender identity is a performative education regulated by social sanctions or taboos or, in this particular situation, breaking the social «sanctions» if taking Afghanistan as an example. With the help of these social norms, certain «new» prescribed behaviour following Western canons is slowly being applied to other states and societies such as Afghan society inasmuch the representation is also traceable here. Rottenberg interpretes these practices in developing countries as a way to show the power and influence, which comes from the West (2014:434).

The Women Empowerment Projects with no doubts might assist in income generation, nonetheless, utmost of the cases do not reach the outcomes which were prescribed. The process of implementation is named as a performative act, while fabrication of the role of women within an Afghan society, being an active participant in the economy of the country, is a good way to describe it as non-performativity. The essential characteristics of non-performativity of certain projects of Women Economic Empowerment are the fact that the actions which are being implemented, are not well-to-do enough. In fact, the reason why there is not sufficient amount of publication about the project itself, in the beginning, no detailed mid-evaluations reports (in case of publications), and in-depth analysis/ statistics papers due to its automatic creation of the room for discussion and critiques, which leads to non-performativity. Butler interprets it the way as if the process of performativity is running smoothly, then it is being naturalized with the
cultural constructions (2010:152). Not to mention, projects of Women Economic Empowerment are being sponsored by international agencies, implemented by local NGOs and supported on the presidential level. In 2014 Afghanistan and USA started women’s empowerment project with a budget of $216 million. In the coming five years they will empower women in the field of management and will increase their participation in the government, private sector and will also support their economic empowerment. The President of Afghanistan believes that the project has the capacity to absorb $200 million from other donors (Voice of America, 2014). Rula Ghani, First Lady of Afghanistan, has said in the First National Economic Empowerment Conference that the majority of the people of Afghanistan are working in the field of agriculture and if women are involved and supported in this field they can reach to self-sufficiency and it will also eradicate violence against women (Kelid Network Afghanistan, 2016)

Another crucial point to be made based on the above research is to clarify what is the role of the neoliberalism rationality in the women empowering process; whether women’s positions within the household brings a change as they start to collect money after participation in the Women Empowerment Projects.

Not to mention, income generation projects within Women Economic Empowerment are seen as a considerate initiative to employ more women and improve the economy of the country, which is not necessary brings benefits for creating the gender-equal society in Afghanistan. The donors of these projects do not perceive gender equality to have priority over other goals, it presented as a solution which intensifies other measures, making them more profitable. Since the Foucault describes the economy as “the science of wealth”, then it creates the image of the projects of agencies, where economic empowerment rather deals with process of satisfying economic desires with the focus on certain group of people, but not empowerment itself (Eatwell, Milgate, and Newman, 1987:907).

There are no available in-depth reports, yet, some independent organizations published papers about lessons learned and its real evaluation of the project. Yet the report includes in-depth analysis, utmost of the negative aspects are usually related to business partners and obstacles of the project itself without referring to women who play a key role in the entire project. This
might be beneficial to keep women in the focused group and obstacles should present from the point of women’s view, but it rather would create a process of non-performativity, which is not, based on above mentioned, that beneficial for international agencies.

For instance, the report of Norad incorporates the outcomes of Norwegian-founded NGOs, not to mention, most of the projects are successful enough and the positive outcomes are demonstrated (2014). Despite this, if to the take into consideration the project of the World Bank and the distribution of birds, it turns up women’s facility to exercise influence over their earnings and assets is under question.

The report of Norad about the group of Norwegian NGO`s has concluded after Norwegian Church Aid (NCA) distributed chickens, women did not possess a full authority over birds they have received, birds as a tool were sometimes sold or simply served on the dining table by their husbands. Furthermore, the great part of the earned money was taken from women by their husband. This might be regarded as the reason which prevents from the decent improvement of gender equality, although, referring to neoliberal rationality and Brown the involvement of women in the economic processes does not provide them with decent rights and equity. The USAID Policy indicates that gender equity in the economy produces a good impact, such as competition while owning an enterprise encourages people to become competitive and boost their capital.

With the example above, the program of Women Economic Empowerment, the space for the competition between genders arise. Unlimited number of projects can likewise require participants of all genders from within the community to enhance the economy in the state since most of them are also in the shortage of needed skills to fully participate in the economic life. That is where Liff & Wajcman concept of “sameness and difference” takes place; since women are still seen as “different from male” and occupying managerial positions will not exempt from inequality itself (1996:80-87).

The improvements of such central issues as the economy appears not sufficiently affect women's domestic life and responsibilities positively. Furthermore, it puts men in the vulnerable position where women placed above regarding gained knowledge and skills, which
at the same time adversely affect inequality from the male side, leading to unpleasant consequences on the domestic level or may cause tension in other cases.

Importantly to mention, most of the agencies as samples that were described in the paper, particularly, USAID with the strongest and the most influential program for Women Empowerment in Afghanistan, according to the theory of subalternity, implanting of ideas gives a feeling of prevalence or even superiority.

USAID agency assistance comes from the government of United States as the demonstration of «generosity» of the country and level of development, which is clearly states on the web page of the agency and produces an absolutely different interpretation, where according to Spivak, international agencies are seen as those who take a right to “speak for” not only because of the Western influence, but also because of the power and its way of constructing the culture and norms within the state.

The «generosity» revealed by such great agencies as USAID, carry influence and power and creates a false impression about the entire situation. Representation comes from a mass - a group of agencies- it is not their privilege to impose on the society their own rules and understanding of the state system.
6. Reference list


Appendix 1. List of figures and images

1. Figure 1. Sweden’s aid to Afghanistan in 2017  
2. Image 1. Distribution of birds under Women Empowerment project  
3. Image 2. Distribution of birds under Women Empowerment project
The Department for International Development (DFID) leads the UK’s global efforts to end extreme poverty, deliver the Global Goals for Sustainable Development (SDGs) and tackle a wide range of global development challenges. The UK’s focus and international leadership on economic development is a vital part of Global Britain - harnessing the potential of new trade relationships, creating jobs and channelling investment to the world’s poorest countries. Throughout history, sustained, job-creating growth has played the greatest role in lifting huge numbers of people out of grinding poverty. This is what developing countries want and is what the international system needs to help deliver. Whilst there is an urgent need for traditional aid in many parts of the world, ultimately economic development is how we will achieve the Global Goals and help countries move beyond the need for aid.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planned Budget for 2017/18</th>
<th>£155m</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Planned Budget for 2018/19</td>
<td>£155m</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sector breakdown of 2017/18 bilateral plans**

- Human Development: 8%
- Governance and Security: 28%
- Economic Development: 44%
- Global Partnerships: 1%
- Afghanistan Reconstruction Trust Fund, 2014-2018: £86.2m
- Multi-Year Humanitarian Support to Afghanistan: £27.8m
- Comprehensive Agriculture and Rural Development Facility: £8.6m

**Contribution to the Global Goals and other government commitments (achieved as at March 2017)**

UK support is helping to build a more stable Afghanistan that is less dependent on external support over the long term. The UK is supporting the Afghan people by helping to provide them with greater access to healthcare, education, and safe drinking water, as well as helping create jobs, boosting economic development, and tackling corruption. To this end, the UK has pledged to spend up to £750 million in aid to Afghanistan between 2016 and 2020 depending on security conditions and Afghan government performance.

**Headline deliverables**

- **Economic development**: We will create more than 35,000 jobs by 2023 and generate $600m of new private sector investment. We will improve land productivity and create jobs by clearing over 87 km² of land, made unusable by mines and explosives (equivalent to over 12,000 football pitches).
- **Basic services and humanitarian**: We will help poor people, including girls and women, access essential services such as health care and education. We will help 1.7 million more people, half of whom will be women, to have access to agriculture or irrigation services by 2018. We will provide life-saving humanitarian assistance to 1 million people a year, including refugees and people who have fled their homes due to conflict or disasters.
- **Building institutions**: We will support the government’s ability to fight high level corruption. UK support has helped the Afghan government establish the Anti-Corruption Justice Centre to investigate and bring to trial high level corruption cases. We will continue to support efforts to address corruption and to encourage greater transparency.

**Why DFID is investing in Afghanistan**

Almost 40 years of conflict have left Afghanistan one of the poorest and most fragile countries in the world. Creating a more stable environment will help reduce poverty and make progress towards the global goals. It will also reduce threats to the UK from violence and extremism, and discourage illegal migration. The challenges are acute with approximately 12.5 million Afghans living below the poverty line and 1.5 million

---

1 Results less than 1 million are rounded to the nearest thousand. Results over 1 million are rounded to the nearest hundred thousand.