

## The 'Essentially' Feminine

The 'Essentially' Feminine  
A Mapping through Artistic  
Practice of the Feminine Territory  
Offered by Early Modern Music

Katarina A. Karlsson (ed.)

# Contents

INTRODUCTION 9

Can Something Be ‘Essentially’ Feminine?

Katarina A. Karlsson

CHAPTER 1 19

Love Songs?

Katarina A. Karlsson

CHAPTER 2 37

Sexual Abuse: Historical and Current

Katarina A. Karlsson & Ulf Axberg

CHAPTER 3 51

To Stage or Not to Stage?

Katarina A. Karlsson & Gunilla Gårdfeldt

ISBN 978-91-23456-78-9 (Print)

ISBN 978-91-23456-78-9 (PDF)

ISSN 1234-5678

Printed in Sweden by Ale Tryckteam AB, 2018

CHAPTER 4 65

The Topic of 'Love' in Early  
Modern English Lute Songs or Ayres

Christopher R. Wilson

CHAPTER 5 91

The Feminine Territory Offered  
by Early Modern Music, through the  
Lens of an Aristocratic Lady

Katarina A. Karlsson

APPENDIX 1 III

Songs Published between 1597 and 1622

APPENDIX 2 125

Linguistic Laboratory

APPENDIX 3 123

Description of the Transcription

INTRODUCTION

Can Something Be 'Essentially' Feminine?

Katarina A. Karlsson

*Once upon a time there was a Swedish lumberjack who hurt his foot.*

*– I have never seen anything like it, said the doctor, normally a wood-cutter hurts his outer toes but you managed to cut off one in the middle!*

*The tight-lipped lumber jack answered:*

*– A real man cuts off any toe he likes.*

*Judith Butler talks about gender as performance, a story of male and female that we keep telling one another until it feels like the truth (Butler 1990). Many feminists today agree that there is no behavior that is entirely feminine or masculine in its essence. Yet the urge to label behavior as belonging to one or an other gender is something we have in common with our ancestors. Generally the gender who has the upper hand gets the prerogative to do so. So gender, as well as other cultural phenomena are narratives that changes over time. And to tell a story is also what singing is about, with or without words.*

This book is a documentation of the research project *The 'essentially' feminine – an investigation through artistic practice of the feminine territory offered by Early Modern Music*. The project was performed as artistic research and included concerts and stagings, but also surveys that compared Early Modern love songs to ideations of verbal abuse in our own time. The borders between historical and present day were drawn with the artistic freedom that comes with artistic research. The songs included in the project were a fraction of the 755 songs I read published between 1597 and 1622 in London, England. 390 of the total were love songs with male personas, 182 included one or more of the following rules for those personas:

1. do not take “no” for an answer
2. create a matrix of love and hate, where fear, friendliness, or indifference are impossible options
3. alternate pleading with accusation
4. threaten to take your own life and blame her for it
5. threaten to, or actually use, violence

Garrett (2004) points out ten such violent songs in her study of Early Modern song lyrics. Seventeen songs studied in the current project encourage violence, whereof five were analysed linguisti-

cally by the project and three were performed in October of 2017 as *Love has a hundred evil names* (see appendix 2).

This performance was used to explore how these songs could be performed and communicated today in a way that would not shun the problematic lyrics, but still make them obvious. Was it possible to disarm the problematic contents with comedy? Two contemporary composers re-wrote two of the pieces, which had premieres in this performance. I also wanted to know if the rules of the songs were dated, or if they mirrored a rhetoric and progression that were recognizable to women who had escaped abusive relations today. The project, as well as this book, is a result of a unique collaboration where some of the collaborators are also co-authors of this book: Prof. Gunilla Gårdfeldt, Prof. Christopher R Wilson, and Assoc. Prof. Ulf Axberg.

### Performing English Lute Songs

After performing songs for more than forty years, I learned that people seldom hear what you think they will. The communication between a singer and her audience depends on the presentation, the surroundings, the expectations, and not least the singer's body; not only the body language, but the sound producing body – the complex machinery of the singing technique itself, as it were. The story-telling of singing is much more intricate than just words and melody.

Elizabethan Lute songs, published in England between 1597 and 1622, have more than one story. This genre will be presented further in chapters one and four. Their multiple layers still surprise anyone who cares to look for them. When I first met Elizabethan Lute songs forty years ago they were just words and music. Later on, words, meaning, and music. After that, the puns and double entendres of the lyrics began wriggling. After that, the synergetic effects of the words combined with the music overwhelmed me. Still, I am acutely aware of the fact that English is not my first language. For a while, I tried to regard that as an asset and not a hand-

icap, thinking that my not-so-prudish upbringing in rural Sweden would make it easier for me to deal with the erotic themes.<sup>1</sup>

### The Co-Authors

On my first encounter with Elizabethan and Jacobean Lute songs, they were labelled “Love Songs.” But the love of some of the songs is a very problematic one, as chapters one and two will show. The psychologist, Dr. Ulf Axberg has assisted in interpreting the lyrics of some Elizabethan love songs, as well as the survey carried out within this project. He is also the co-author of the second chapter.

As I am writing this in Sweden in 2018, the “Law of sexual consent” has just been adopted, in order to strengthen the legal position of rape victims in the court room. Many a rapist has remained unpunished because of the claim “I thought she wanted it.” If she does not say “no,” the preconception is that she wants it, both in real life as well as in the Elizabethan “love” songs. In the songs of the English Golden era a “no,” was a “yes,” a scream was “playing hard to get,” her attempts to defend herself physically were an attempt to save her honor. The rhetoric of the Elizabethan “lover” is in fact the rhetoric of a perpetrator, and chapter two, “Sexual Abuse: Historical and Contemporary,” is an attempt to look at the reciprocity between the stories we tell and the stories we live.

‘To stage or not to stage’ is a chapter about the artistic research in staging Early Modern music in this particular project, where my dear colleague Gunilla Gårdfeldt Carlsson has contributed. Gunilla also served the project as a director of the staged parts.

You need a stage to tell a story and Christopher R. Wilson, who has spent more time with English lute songs than anyone I know and is soaked in English culture from birth, will illuminate the context of the songs and what kind of arena these songs had from

<sup>1</sup> For a discussion on how morals and manners spread in rural and urban Sweden in the twentieth century, I recommend Frykman and Löfgren 1980.

a musicological point of view. One interesting aspect involves the repetitions of a musical phrase that also repeats the same words. When performing, for instance, Robert Jones's lute song "Think'st thou Kate" (see appendix 3) the repetitions reveal just how crude it is. Thomas Campion's song "Come you pretty false-eyed wanton" (Campion 1613 no. 18) has no such repetitive moments and its offensiveness is more hidden within the music. The line "and when thou cried then would I laugh" is a short moment most audiences would miss. Both songs were performed twice in the performance *Love has a hundred evil names*, the performance which was the final manifestation of the project.

There is yet another arena, an imagined one, embedded in the name of this research project: *The 'essentially' feminine – a mapping through artistic practice of the feminine territory offered by Early Modern Music*. The territory I am speaking of is like a circus ring, consisting of the expectations an imagined audience would have of an English aristocratic woman. The Lute songs pronounce these expectations and the chapter about Frances Howard shows the lived reality of a very special aristocratic seventeenth-century lady compared to the music and lyrics she encountered.

The English Early Modern Lute songs unfold secrets and create new ones. Some of them are in this book.

## A Tradition of Artistic Research

Artistic Research is forming its canon with writings of Michael Polanyi and Donald A. Schön who are frequently quoted in artistic research and in pedagogy. The terms 'tacit knowing,' 'tacit dimension,' and 'reflection-in-action' have verbalised the implicit knowledge of musicians (Polanyi 1983). Later on, Hannula and Borgdorff have added dimensions such as the thorough work of describing in detail the artistic process in hope of achieving something that could be of use for others within the field (Hannula et al. 2012). There are many ways of performing artistic research. Frisk and Östersjö summarise:

We suggest that, rather than being a non-academic and independent research discipline, artistic research is situated in a multilayered and multidimensional space principally defined by four non-conformal fields of gravitation: the subjective, the academic, the experimental, and the field of the art world. (Frisk and Östersjö 2013, 42)

But artistic research also has roots in other disciplines such as psychology, auto-ethnography, musicology, and more. Artistic research sometimes assist other disciplines. It is in this way that artistic research is executed in this project, or as a part of the multilayered and multidimensional space sketched by Frisk and Östersjö above, or as The University of Manchester puts it in their mission statement:

Arts practices draw on a variety of creative methodologies that might be incorporated into interdisciplinary research projects as methodological innovations, providing new perspectives on and extending existing knowledge as well as materialising a different kind of knowledge practice. (Manchester University n.d.)

Other methods used in the project involve quantitative and qualitative research. Surveys were sent to women who had survived domestic violence. Two qualitative interviews were executed and recorded with the therapists who handed out and collected the surveys. The recorded interviews were then analysed by myself and the project's consulting psychologist Ulf Axberg, who has long experience of counseling men with a history of domestic violence, and the result is shown in the chapter "Sexual Abuse: Historical and Current."

Only a few days after the performance of *Love has a Hundred Evil Names* in Gothenburg in October of 2017 the #metoo-movement exploded on social media in Sweden. A movement in which I took active part as a singer, journalist, musician, and academic. As I write this September in 2018 the backlash is lurking, although much has been achieved. There is still need for people like the Swedish crime journalist and author Katarina Wennstam who in her recent radio show said:

How will young men ever learn to treat women with respect when the surrounding society puts the label 'love' on behaviours which are wrong, or even criminal? Wennstam (2018)

The artistic research was also inspired by Merleau-Ponty (1965) and consisted of practical work such as:

1. presenting and recording the songs to professional musicians without revealing its content
2. presenting and recording the songs to music students without revealing its content
3. presenting the music of the songs in workshops without revealing its content, and later adding the lyrics and discussing the effect
4. rehearsing the songs with professional musicians and directors
5. performing the songs with professional musicians in costume
6. commissioning two composers to re-compose two songs that used all five rules
7. rehearsing and performing the two re-composed songs to an audience, integrated in the full-length performance *Love has a hundred evil names* on October 6–8 2017

All of the original prints of lute songs referred to in this book can be found at Early English Books Online: <https://eebo.chadwyck.com/home>.

### Those before Me

Musicians have always influenced one another and the ones who have been instrumental for my perception of Early Music are also people I have performed with in my home town of Gothenburg, Sweden. The opera company "Utomjordiska," the two wonderful orchestras "Karlsson Barock" and "Göteborg Baroque," and of course the choir conductor Gunnar Eriksson. I have had the pleasure of working with Gunnar since the late 1970s and I do not know what my perception of music would be without him. Sweden has a rich selection of singers who are also active researchers: Sara Wilén, Tove Dahlberg, Hedvig Jallhed, Sven Kristersson, Elisabeth Belgrano, and Susanne Rosenberg, to name a few.

### Acknowledgements

There are many people who contributed to this work and to whom I owe a debt of gratitude: the Swedish Research Council, who funded the project, as well as the University of Gothenburg and the Department of Cultural Studies, who were my hosts. I want to thank my dear fellow researcher Prof. Christopher Wilson, with his extensive expertise and sound judgement, the sprightly and inventive director Prof. Gunilla Gårdfeldt, Assoc. Prof. Ulf Axberg whose warm humor and optimism balance the dark sides of human behavior that he deals with in his profession as a psychologist. The two composers Paula of Malmberg Ward and Ida Lundén gave the project and the performance an edge, an obvious linkage between historic and present time and a serious touch. For the performance I also want to thank costume designer Nonno Nordqvist, light designer Emma-Kara Nilsson, photographer Harald Nilsson, all workers at Atalante, and the filming team. Assoc. Prof. Joel Speerstra, my text editor and dear friend whose kindness, care and deep knowledge of Early Music, I could not be without. I am also grateful to my loyal, kind and hard working musical ensemble, Andreas Edlund, Kristina Lindgård, Helena Sjöstrand-Svenn, Matts Johansson, Tore Sunesson and last, but certainly not least, my wonderful daughter Sigrid Algsten.

## References

- Borgdorff, Henk. 2012. *The Conflict of the Faculties: Perspectives on Artistic Research and Academia*. Amsterdam: Leiden University Press.
- Butler, Judith. 1990. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York: Routledge.
- Frisk, Henrik and Stephan Östersjö. 2013. "Beyond validity: claiming the legacy of the artistic researcher." *Svensk Tidskrift för Musikforskning* 95: 41–63.
- Frykman, Jonas, and Orvar Löfgren. 1980. *Den kultiverade människan*. Malmö: Gleerups.
- Garrett, Cynthia. 2004. "Sexual Consent and the Art of Love in the Early Modern English Lyrics." *Studies in English Literature 1500–1900* 44 (1): 37–58.
- Hannula, Mika, Juha Suoranta, and Tere Vadén. 2005. *Artistic Research : Theories, Methods and Practices*. Göteborg: Art Monitor.
- Manchester University. "Practice as Research." Accessed June 15, 2018. <https://www.methods.manchester.ac.uk/themes/qualitative-methods/practice-as-research/>
- Merleau-Ponty, Maurice. 1965. *Phenomenology of Perception*. Translated by Colin Smith. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Polanyi, Michael. 2009. *The Tacit Dimension*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Schön, Donald. 1983. *The Reflective Practitioner: How Professionals Think in Action*. New York: Basic Books.
- Wennstam, Katarina. *Sommar & Vinter i Pr*. "Sommar." Produced by Erika Strand-Berglund. Swedish Radio, June 6, 2018.

## CHAPTER I

### Love Songs?

Katarina A. Karlsson



*It was by the name “Love songs” I first encountered English Lute songs. The collection Elizabethan Love Songs by Keel was used at the music conservatory in Gothenburg where I studied, and the music seemed to suit my voice well (Keel 1909). I don’t remember dwelling much on what the songs were about. Maybe some old-fashioned courtly love, my teacher and I thought. But they were not. They were, like most other love songs in history, a cloak under which power, threats, and pursuit were enacted, they could speak openly or obscurely about illicit desires.*

### Love and Music

“Love” is a flimsy word, lent and bent to many causes, and yet used everywhere by everyone. But it was not always like that, at least not in my life. My parents never spoke of love. Although I never doubted my mother’s love, I only heard her say it once. It was at the end of her life, and I think to one of the grandchildren. The word was never said aloud between my parents, to my knowledge. Then when American and English pop songs with all the yearning for love that streamed out of the radio, it was as if they took the most valuable golden paint and slabbed a wall with it. And after a while the word “love” appeared preprinted on Swedish birthday- and postcards. Devaluating, as it were, the precious word. This is one example of how the view and use of the word “love” can change rather quickly. In *Why love hurts – A sociological explanation*, Eva Illouz describes other changes, like the idea that an analysis of one’s childhood would be beneficial to better understand oneself and one’s relationships. That is an idea brought on by Freud and the psychoanalyst’s view of the self and the subconscious (Illouz 2012). Before the age of television and radio, married couples did not manage a flow of information and pictures of love, intimacy and sexuality, to compare to the intimate parts of their own lives. Even love as it is described in eighteenth-century novels was different from a hundred years earlier.

So the rural Sweden that I grew up in regarded love as something private, but in seventeenth-century England, music was also

a private matter. Maybe because of its proximity to love, at least in people's minds. And women's music-making was more so than men's. The historian Linda Phyllis Austern has often pointed out how explosive the combination of music and women was in Early Modern England:

Both music and feminine beauty were considered intense inflamers of passions, and, when used together, resulted in an uncontrollable sensual experience for the masculine listener. Therefore, many learned writers recommended that women avoid the inherent moral danger of music by limiting its use to private meditation where it was most capable of personal spiritual benefit. (Austern 1989, 447–8)

An interesting exception is the brothels, where the label “love” could be applied to relationships of power and trade. Some brothels had workers trained in music, and they were the ones visited by the aristocracy (Burford 2001). If only we knew what music they played and sang at those occasions! But even if all women did not follow the advice to make music for private meditation, it is not likely that an aristocratic lady would volunteer to sing songs like “A secret love or two” or “Fain would I wed’ a fair young man who day and night would please me” since it would question her honor (Campion 1613, 1617, and Coren 2002, 525–47). Music's ability to arouse sexual feelings made it an excuse for sexual violence just as alcohol or drugs have been used in later centuries:

One of the principal powers attributed to music by its defenders and detractors from all sides of the intellectual spectrum in Shakespeare's England and the following half century was its ability to “ravish” sense and intellect through its entry by the ear into an unguarded body, within a culture that further equated ravishment and ecstasy with the violence of rape. (Austern 1999, 647)

### Love and Privacy

With that mind set, it is understandable that the performance of a song with a daring content was seen as something private, but a song was not bound to have to be equivocal to make music making private. When talking of private we incorporate the idea

of something opposite – doing something in front of an audience, maybe in a public space where people gather to silently listen and view a performer from some distance. But the only existing public spaces in Early Modern society were the church, the theatre, and, on some occasions, the court room. Lute songs were performed in people's homes. We actually do not know if there were any listeners present at all except for the singer, since the lute-player and the singer often were the same person (Fischlin 1998). Some songs were, however, published with the possibility of adding vocal parts. These parts were identical to the lute accompaniment and did not resemble the contemporary madrigals which had long melismas. The lute song composers valued the lyrics highly, it was important that they were audible at all times. John Dowland is an exception, since his lute accompaniment was more complicated.

Not all of Shakespeare's sonnets were printed during his life time. They were handwritten and copied manuscripts, passed between a few people. The lute songs, on the contrary, were passed among many people. They were printed again and again. Considering how expensive they were, and how relatively few people lived in England at the time, it is noteworthy that John Dowland's first songbook was reprinted four times and that the second print alone was a thousand copies (Oswell 2009). The fact that so many songs were printed in a time span of just twenty-five years (1597–1622) shows they were indeed popular. Something made them well liked: the beauty of the songs, the accessibility of them, the content, or all of the above.

### Love Songs with Male Personas

While Elizabethan songs with female personas show that the persona is indeed female through the lyrics, the ones with male personas do not (Karlsson 2012). They do not have to, since a male persona is the default. The songs for the project *The 'essentially' feminine – a mapping of the feminine territory offered by Early Modern music* were narrowed down to songs published in England

between 1597 and 1622, which is the common time-span used to define English lute songs. All songs can be found in the formidable database English Early Books Online, from now on abbreviated EEBO. The songs were published as “Ayres,” or in masques and plays. The criteria was, I decided, that the writer or composer labelled them as “songs.”

Of the 755 songs I read, female personas represent only a small percentage. Mary Wroth labeled thirty of her poems “songs” although there is no indication that they were set to music (Wroth 1621). She is the only female originator of songs in the time span, unless some of the very few published anonymously were by women. It is possible that there are more songs that fit into the criteria than I have found.

The most common male persona in a lute song is a rejected, complaining lover. The woman he loves does not want him anymore. The reason why is not that she has found someone else, lost interest in him, or that he has treated her badly, but that her nature is false, cruel, full of contempt and hatred.

In Keel’s Elizabethan Love Songs I found the following five rules in the thirty songs. The rules are:

1. does not take “no” for an answer,
2. creates a matrix of love and hate, where fear, friendliness or indifference are no options,
3. in turns pleads and accuses,
4. threatens to take his own life and blames her for it,
5. threatens to use violence/use violence.

After reading another 669 songs, the pattern became more varied. Something that did not vary, though was that the root of the problem was always the woman.

Women’s hearts are painted fires to deceive them that affect.  
I alone love’s fires include; she alone doth them delude.  
(Rosseter 1970)

390 of the total are love songs with male personas. The words “did I vex her with unkindness?” appear in one of them as a flash of self-consciousness, as it were (Campion 1617, and Jones 1605).

However, I believe the question to be rhetorical. 182 of the love songs with male personas contain the rules above in different degrees. Rule number one, to not accept a “no,” is not always there. The persona has realized that love is over, but still mourns and accuses the woman. Rule number three does not always contain pleadings, sometimes there are only accusations. Rule number five is rare, and is present exclusively in Robert Jones and Thomas Campion’s production. The most famous composer of the genre, John Dowland, has male personas who frequently use rule number four, but not always to punish the loved one. In Dowland’s lyrics, death is sometimes a metaphor for sexual ecstasy (which can be also used as a revenge), sometimes longing for death has no connection to love but is an expression of the romanticization of death which was Dowland’s “brand” as the title of one of his compositions hints: “Semper Dowland, semper dolens” (Dowland 1604, xxii–v).

### Sweet Kate

One song that use all five rules is “Sweet Kate” by Robert Jones (1609, no. 2). Verse 1:

Sweete Kate of late ran away and left me playning.  
Abide I cride or I die with thy disdayning.  
Te hee hee quoth shee gladly would I see  
any man to die with louing Neuer any yet died of such a fitte:  
Neither haue I fear of prouing.

Robert Jones did not write lyrics. The originators of his lyrics are often anonymous “gentlemen,” which means upper class males. One of these anonymous originators has placed a female and male persona in dialogue in Sweet Kate. The name Kate, or Katherine is also the name of the main character in Shakespeare’s *The Taming of the Shrew* which was written between 1590–92, where the untamed Katherine/Kate must be disciplined by a man: if not no one will marry or even kiss her (Shakespeare 1986). So already the choice of name says something about who the female object of the

song is. In the opening bars, Robert Jones completes the picture of Kate by showing how she runs away from the male persona. We understand immediately that he is abandoned, and does not accept it. But she does not run the shortest way from *ei* to *gi*:



A lute song is generally syllabic, the only time it uses melismas it is to express something special. When the word “Sweet” occupies four quavers, it is probably Kate’s character that Jones wants to picture. It is the first thing that happens in the song, the musical phrase is alluring and teasing. An ornament like this was linked to femininity to the Puritans of the seventeenth century and thereby reprehensible:

Modest and chaste harmonies are to be admitted by removing as farre as may be all soft effeminate musicke from our strong and valiant cogitation, which using a dishonest art of warbling the voyce, do lead to a delicate and slothful kinde of life. Therefore, Chromaticall harmonies are to be left to impudent malapertnesse, to whorish musicke crowned with flowers. (Austern 1993, 343–54)

Prynne’s book *Histiomastix*, printed in 1632, condemned theatre but also music and special aspects of music. To garnish the music with “flowers” or ornament, was feminizing and would lead to a life of laziness and sin. The leap between “woman” and “whore” is implicit. In the quote, Prynne also states that some harmonies (“chromatic”), and some vocal technics (“warbling the voice”) are more feminizing than others. The male persona in *Sweet Kate* begs Kate to wait, or he will die, but Kate just laughs. Musically Robert Jones has done his work, from now on the same melody will be repeated every verse, but he has already shown what kind of person Kate is: a teasing person who is not to be trusted. In the next verse, rule number four appears: “Or I’ll die with thy consenting.” And in verse number three, rule number five: “Cause I had enough to become more rough, so I did, o happy trying.”

Kate is not portrayed as a stupid person. Maybe because we are meant to feel sorry for the male persona and see his violence against

her as something unavoidable or deserved. The violence is the logical consequence in the male narrative. The word “fool” in *Sweet Kate* is put in the female persona’s mocking answer to the male persona. To be ridiculed might be the spark that provokes a violent answer from the male persona and takes us back to the author who introduced the idea of enjoyable sexual violence to the English Renaissance literature, the Roman author Ovid (43 BC–17 BC).

### Ovid’s False Precept

The song collection which contains “Sweet Kate” was printed in 1609. The same year Ovid’s *The Art of Love (Ars Amatoria)* was published in English for the first time, translated by Thomas Heywood (Garrett 2004). As in Robert Jones’s *Think’s thou Kate*, *The Art of Love* teaches an unexperienced man how to make love. Cynthia E. Garrett writes in her article “Sexual Consent and the Art of Love in the Early Modern English Lyrics” how in Ovid’s chapter “Kisses, tears and taking the lead,” the experienced male teaches that not only do the women say “no” when they mean “yes,” they enjoy violence: “uim licet appellat, vis est ea grata puellis” (Garrett 2004). The Roman authors were particularly popular during the English Renaissance, which is the name of an era that wanted to give new life to antique ideals and art forms. The birth of the art-form opera was originally an attempt to revive roman art such as Ovid’s writings. Rapes occur in Ovid’s *Metamorphoses* fifty times, and have been subject to research by the musicologist Wendy Heller (2016). She emphasizes the Early Modern culture’s voyeurism, irony and sexual fantasy that surround the re-telling of the Ovidian stories, not least in Early Modern Opera. When the beauty of the nymph Callisto is described in Fransesco Cavalli’s opera (shortly before she will be raped) it is in triple-meter. The use of triple meter to enhance sensuality will be commented on further in this chapter.

Upper class, educated men (and some women) had been able to appreciate Ovid in Latin before, but from 1609 others could also read Ovid’s *Ars Amatoria*.

Garrett speaks of ten songs in the English Lute song tradition, all by Robert Jones, that recommend violence or contain “the comic rape”; the man abuses the woman who protests but is content afterwards (Garrett 2004, fn 32). However, I found three songs by Thomas Campion,<sup>1</sup> which all suggest violence on the male lover’s behalf, or describe a situation which borders on, or is explicitly rape. Garrett says that this made the crime of “rape” more difficult to report and punish:

The Lawes Resolutions of Womens Rights, an early seventeenth-century legal guide for women, offers an analysis of rape unique for the period: “So drunken are men with their owne lusts, and the poyson of Ouids false precept, uim licet appellat, vis est ea grata puellis. That if the rampier of Lawes were not betwixt women and their harmes, I verily thinke none of them, being aboue twelue yeares of age, and vnder an hundred, being either faire or rich, should be able to escape rauishing.” Few other texts of the period represent rape as a widespread social problem, and no other, to my knowledge, cites cultural influences. For the anonymous author of the Lawes, it is not Satan, women’s wiles, or even male lust alone that produces rape, but lust schooled by Ovid’s claim in *Ars Amatoria*: “they call force allowed, force is pleasing to girls.” (Garrett 2004, 37)

The quote seems to take the women’s side. Other texts show that the accusation of “rape” had been void, says Garrett, since the woman had to object explicitly before and after the rape, otherwise the contention would be that she actually enjoyed it.

A Swedish study shows that a high percentage of women (70%) exposed to sexual violence experience a state of frozen fright, which makes the demand for the “no” afterwards even more problematic.<sup>2</sup> Seventeenth-century England allowed violence towards women, but not deadly violence. A married man was expected to discipline and correct his wife, but in *The Lawes Resolution of Womens Rights*, the husband is discouraged to use violence. It is however difficult to say what constituted violence (Amussen 1994).

1 “It fell on a summer’s day” (Campion 1601); “Come you pretty false-eyed wanton” (Campion 1613); “O never to be moved” (Campion 1617).

2 Tonic immobility during sexual assault – a common reaction predicting post-traumatic stress disorder and severe depression (Möller et al. 2017).

The distinction of “sexual violence” was probably a grey zone, then as now. However, I want to quote Dr. Ulf Axberg, who states that the one who is allowed the interpretative prerogative on violence is the one who has been exposed to it.

### Singing as a Method of Inquiry

As a singer you wear your instrument on the inside of the body. The sound made by the vocal chords are affected not only by the larynx, the resonance and the articulation but also by the muscles involved in breathing. In my experience that means that the bodily practice of singing can give us information about the music which a reading or a playing on an instrument cannot when it comes to notated music before the arrival of phonogram.

The body stores memories not only in the brain but also in the muscles. They can be both unique to the individual or shared by others through all times. Laughter is a good example. Laughter occurs everywhere and has probably done so for more time than is the scope of this book. The memory of a laughter is not only a memory of something amusing that happened once, the memory of a sound or even an emotion; laughter is also the body’s memory of air blows through the vocal chords and a jumping belly.

The mirror neurons which enable us to be empathic to our fellow humans activate the same parts of the brain whether we watch something or if we actually do the same thing (Iacoboni 2009, 653–70). Even if these investigations were not made in connections to music-making and listening, I believe they are applicable to music. The relation between stage and audience, singer and listener builds upon this empathy, as described for instance in 1555 by the Swedish priest Olaus Magnus (1982, 700–3). Musicians and composers have always taken that into account, even if the neurologic evidence were discovered in modern days. In “So quick, so hot, so mad” (Campion 1617) the persona’s behavior discloses the persona’s gender. The behavior corresponds to the expected manners of a woman in the socio-cultural context in which the song was creat-

ed. The “I” does not want to be courted “so quick, so hot, so mad.” Also the musical design gives clues as to the persona’s gender.

Melismas and semiquavers are rare in Campion’s production. When they occur they mark something special, in this case an emotion to enhance the adjectives: “quick,” “hot,” “fond,” “rude,” “tedious.” The song expresses a fear of frogs, snakes and briers: “A yellow frog, alas, would fright me so as I should start and tremble as I go.” The fear of reptiles and sharp, stingy thorns suggests a fear of sex, and it is possible that it also wants to ridicule that fear. For a singer it would be natural to start a melisma with a consonant. The consonant would then serve as a trampoline to shoot off the semiquavers; to do anything else is much more difficult. Campion is careful to show that he does not want that. The vowel is sustained and then broken just before the end of the word with two semiquavers. It is as if the singer in the beginning of the word is trying to govern him/herself but then, just before the word ends, cannot cope anymore, and is overcome by the emotion:



How quickly the semiquavers should be performed is difficult to establish, since tempi were not indicated at the time. The nature of the lyrics may suggest that this is not a slow song. Also, it is in triple time, which is a dance rhythm, and, as mentioned above, could emphasize the sensual content of a song. That is why I believe the song would be equivalent to the fast dance “jig.”

For the semiquavers to be discerned as such and not as a slur, there are two possibilities in a fast tempo:

1. to separate the notes by introduce an “h” between them. The sound and the bodily movement will sound as in a laugh, which will arouse the memories of laughter both in the singer and the listener.
2. making the diaphragm shiver. The sound, the bodily and emotional memories aroused by the movement will be memories of fear, disgust or chills.<sup>3</sup>

The choice will thus influence the interpretation of the song. What I believe we can learn is that the composer, Campion, wants us to think of the song as comical and he lets the music show it. Not only by how the song is written, but by controlling what emotions the act of singing arouses.

The most violent song in the whole lute song repertoire also contains special information to the singer. It is “Thinkst thou Kate to put me downe” (1605, no. 12). The song is an instruction from an older man to a younger, about how to handle rejection from a woman.

Thinkst thou Kate to put me downe with a no, or with a frowne,  
since loue holds my hart in bandes, I must doe as laue commaundes.

Loue commaundes the hands to dare, When the tongue of speech is spare:  
Chiefest lesson in loues Schoole Put it in aduerture foole.

The young man is taught that if words cannot win her, hands must. But it is naturally not the hands of the female object, her hands are as deceitful as her words, tears, or cries. So, in the third verse when the woman tries to defend herself physically, the song instructs the male lover not to be put off by that. Only a fool, or someone with less education halts at such clear signs of her objection:

Fooles are they that fainting flinch  
For a squeak, a scratch, a pinch,  
Womens words haue double sence:  
Stand away, a simple fence.

In the fourth and last verse, the male persona concludes:

If thy Mistresse sweare sheele crye,  
Feare her not, sheele sweare and lye,  
Such sweet oathes no sorrowe bring  
Till the pricke of conscience sting.  
(Jones 1605, no. 12)

- 3 A third possibility is the “coup de la glotte” technique described by the nineteenth-century voice coach Manuel Garcia (Tägil 2013). Since I have no personal experience of this technique it is not included here.

The idea that a woman's consistent rejection should be ignored and met with daring hands is covered up in music which is seductively innocent. The activity of singing the song is affected first of all by the range; it is only five notes. Nowhere must the voice stretch for a high or low note. The music rounds up the song and the singing in a secure, as it were, area. The meter is simply noted "3". I interpret the meter as  $\frac{3}{4}$ . It reminds of a lulling or lilting movement, like lulling a baby to sleep, or rocking a cradle gently. I have presented the song several times at conferences and workshops, and most people agree that the melody breathes innocence – that is before they learn the nature of the lyrics. The only thing that stands out musically is the repeated phrase



which, if the same lyrics are repeated, adds urgency to the repeated words. And the words are indeed repeated, and not just any words.



It is obvious that Jones wants to make the music underline the sexual puns of the lyrics. The sentence "Till the prick of conscience sting," is set to music in such a way that the word "prick" occurs three times before the conscience is mentioned (and thereby forgotten?). The phrase is repeated in full immediately afterwards but in such a way that the word "prick" ends up in the middle of the bar instead of on the first note of the bar. However, meter was less important four hundred years ago, it was merely an indication of the beat and not that the first note of every bar should be the most stressed one. Nevertheless, it might still mean that Jones wants to add further urgency to the motive, or squeeze out more out of the repetition of the word "prick." Although we might think that the repetition of the word "prick" six times is actually no pun anymore, it is just vulgar, the song was not meant to be bellowed out

on a street corner by a beggar, the song was dedicated to crown prince Henry who was fifteen years of age at the time.

## Summary

To perform English Renaissance lute songs labelled as "Love songs" one must not only problematize the meaning of "Love," but also dwell upon what singing them does to the singer as well as to the audience. The music can become a Trojan horse who sneaks into our bodies and unloads its content of lyrics without us being aware of it. There is no such thing as "pure" music. As soon as music is charged with words (and that means also talking or writing about it) layers of contexts, concepts, and resonating power structures, occur whether we want them or not. However, to sing and reflect upon singing is a rewarding practice. In this chapter I have sketched how it can be done.

## References

- Amussen, Susan Dwyer. 1994. "Being stirred to much unquietness: Violence and domestic violence in early modern England." *Journal of Women's History* 6 (2). doi: <https://doi.org/10.1353/jowh.2010.0321>
- Austern, Linda Phyllis. 1989. "Sing again Syren: The Female Musician and Sexual Enchantment in Elizabethan Life and Literature." *Renaissance Quarterly* 42 (3): 420–448.
- . 1993. "Alluring the auditorie to effeminacie: Music and the English Renaissance idea of the feminine." *Music and Letters* 74:343–354.
- . 2002. *Music, Sensation, and Sensuality*. Edited by Linda Phyllis Austern. New York: Routledge.
- Braha, H. S., et al. 2004. "Does 'Fight or Flight' Need Updating?" *Psychosomatics* 45, nr. 5, 448–449.
- Burford, E. J. *The Bishop's Brothels*. London: Robert Hale. 2001.
- Campion, Thomas. 1601. *The songs from Rosseter's Book of Aires*. Edited by Edmund H. Fellowes, Revised by Thurston Dart. London: Stainer & Bell, 1968.
- . 1613. *Two Bookes of Ayres*. Facsimile edited by David Greer. Menston: The Scholar Press Limited England, 1967.
- . 1617. *The Third and Fourth Booke of Ayres*. Facsimile edition. New York: Performer's Facsimiles, 1995.
- Coren, Pamela. 2002. Singing and silence: female personae in the English Ayre, *Renaissance Studies* 16 (4): 525–47.
- Denver's Sexual Assault Interagency Council. 2018. "Common Reactions to Rape." Accessed August 8th, 2018. <http://www.denversaic.org/help/victims-survivors/common-reactions-to-rape/>
- Dowland, John. 1604. *Lachrimae, or Seaven Teares Figured in Seaven Passionate Pauans*. London: Iohn Windet.
- Fischlin, Daniel. 1998. *In Small Proportions: A Poetics of the English Ayre, 1596–1622*. Detroit: Wayne State University Press.
- Garrett, Cynthia E. 2004. "Sexual Consent and the Art of Love in the Early Modern English Lyrics." *Studies in English Literature, 1500–1900* 44, no. 1 (Winter): 37–58.
- Heller, Wendy. 2016. "Ovid's Ironic Gaze: Voyeurism, Rape, and Male Desire in Cavalli's La Calisto." *Eroticism in Early Modern Music*, 203–25. Edited by Bonnie J. Blackburn and Laurie Stras. New York: Routledge.
- Jacoboni, Marco. 2009. "Imitation, Empathy and Mirror Neurons." *Annual Review of Psychology* 60: 653–70.
- Jones, Robert. 1605. *Vltimum Vale*. London: Iohn Windet.
- . 1609. *A Musical Dream*. London: Iohn Windet.
- Illouz, Eva. 2012. *Why Love Hurts – A Sociological Explanation*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Karlsson, Katarina A. 2012. "'Think'st thou to seduce me then?' Impersonating songs with female personas by Thomas Campion (1567–1620)." PhD. diss., University of Gothenburg.
- Keel, Frederick. 1909. *Elizabethan Love Songs*. London: Boosey & Hawkes.
- Magnus, Olaus. 1982. *Historia om de nordiska folken*, 700–3. Malmö: Gidlunds förlag.
- Möller, Anna. Hans Peter Söndergaard, and Lotti Helström. 2017. "Tonic immobility during sexual assault – a common reaction predicting post-traumatic stress disorder and severe depression." *Acta Obstetricia et Gynecologica Scandinavica* 96, no. 8 (August): 932–8.
- Oswell, Michelle Lynn. 2009. "The Printed Lute Song: A Textual and Paratextual Study of Early Modern English Song Books." PhD. diss., University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill.
- Rosseter, Pihilip. 1601. *Book of Ayres*. Facsimile. Edited by David Greer. Menston: The Scholar Press Limited, 1970.
- Shakespeare, William. 1986. *Complete Works*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Tägil, Ingela. 2013. "Jenny Lind: röstens betydelse för hennes mediala identitet, en studie av hennes konstnärsskap 1838–49." PhD diss., University of Örebro.
- Wroth, Mary. 1621. *The Countesse of Mountgomerie's Urania*. J. Marriott and J. Grismand: London, 1621.

CHAPTER 2

Sexual Abuse: Historical and Current

Katarina A. Karlsson & Ulf Axberg



*– I am offended! You cannot take your modern reading and force it upon an old, innocent music genre!*

*This was the outburst of an Early Music lover who attended one of my lectures. Naturally, if nothing of past times and culture could be read with the help of new theories, we would be forced to stay away from not only analyses of sexual violence, but also of colonization, slavery, the holocaust, and so on. Still, the exclamation has stayed with me. The connection between past and present is interesting, and is the topic of this chapter.*

Sexual violence is nothing new. Its prevalence in Early Modern culture, including music, is indisputable. As mentioned in the chapter “Love songs?” rape occurs fifty times in the Roman author Ovid’s *Metamorphoses*, which was one of the most influential texts in Early Modern times. The chapter also discusses music’s ability to move the senses, which might be the very reason of Music’s existence. With this in mind, it may come as no surprise when BBC online published the news in May of 2018 that in Great Britain:

YouTube said it deleted more than half of the “violent” music videos which the country’s most senior police officer asked it to take down. (BBC News 2018.)

The connection between culture and violence has nevertheless been disputed. Does violent content in film, music, and computer games affect users or not? Magnus Ullén, English professor at the University of Karlstad, refers to Swedish and international research showing that the connection between fictional violence and real violence is not as direct as some may think. (Ullén 2014). The Swedish National Council for Crime Prevention (BRÅ), shows that lethal violence decreased by one-third between 1990 and 2014 and that women constituted one third of the total. But, while lethal violence is decreasing, sexual crime is increasing. BRÅ’s statistics on sexual crime show that the percentage exposed to (reported) sexual offenses in Sweden from 2005 to 2016 has more than doubled.

Most of the victims are women between 16 and 24 years of age, of whom 14 per cent state that they had been exposed to sex offenses during 2016. (BRÅ n.d.)

The estimated number of unknown cases is known to be substantial in this type of criminality. However, the increase can be partially explained by new sex offense legislation on April 1, 2005, says BRÅ.

### #metoo

The performance of *Love has a hundred evil names* coincided with the #metoo movement in Sweden, which exploded in social media only days after the last performance in Gothenburg in October 2017. The Hollywood mogul Harry Weinstein was accused of sexual harassment and abuse of power against women. At the Oscar awards party in 2017 all female actresses dressed in black. It was indeed a powerful statement and inspired Swedish female actresses to reveal their personal experience of rape, abuse, and sexual harassment on and behind the stage. The Swedish female singers were the second group to come forward, followed by many more: female politicians, lawyers, workers in all areas including prostitutes. A Swedish member of the Royal Academy of Music was the subject of two radio documentaries. He was one of Sweden's most internationally acclaimed singers and my fellow singers attested as to how he had expected sexual favors for advancing their careers. Later on the #metoo movement reached a person closely linked to the Swedish Royal Academy, the highly esteemed association responsible for awarding the Nobel prize in literature. Wave after wave of stories flooded discussion groups on Facebook. I took part in all of them I could claim membership to: the singers, academics, journalists, musicians. In all of the sad and upsetting stories, almost none mentioned their perpetrator by name. The women's stories surprised many men. Was male sexual misconduct really that common? The answer is not difficult to find. A report from the Swedish County council from 2017 says 99 per cent of those

who are suspected of rape are men, 84 per cent of all suspected of physical abuse are men, 86 per cent of all reported unlawful threats and stalking have male perpetrators (Noren and Eriksson 2017).

### Yes Indeed, Me Too

So the lineage between now and then was impossible *not* to see after our performance. But the link between past and present was also the initial spark for the whole project, as the Early Modern lute songs helped me understand a personal, troubling experience. It was not sexual violence, but an other criminal behavior: stalking. Although it took me a while to recognize it for what it was, the pattern was classic:

repeatedly calling, texting, leaving gifts, showing up, asking friends or family for information about the target. (Logan and Walker 2017, 203)

I experienced a growing uneasiness, which grew into fear as months went by and my pleadings to be left alone were ignored:

The cumulative and chronic effect of stalking interferes with other areas of life. (Logan and Walker 2017, 201)

During the 18 months the most intense phase lasted, I did not share what was happening to me, as I feared what the stalker might do. Some of the few I told still doubted and dismissed it. They were more interested in why the stalker behaved the way he did, than what the effect of it was. It is indeed difficult to read a stalker's mind. But, according to the American sociologists Logan and Walker the stalker's intent is not to inspire love; "The intent is to dominate, devalue and in some cases destroy" (217, 209). The police officer I visited did not encourage a report, but said 100 texts or messages/day was a minimum for him to take my complaint seriously. The victim-blaming and minimising I experienced followed a classic pattern;

Stalking is often minimized, denied or dismissed...criminal justice and victim service representatives do not always view stalking situations as a serious crime or as a dangerous situation. (Logan and Walker 2017, 202)

It was not easy to describe how threatening it was:

Being followed, tracked and watched is a pattern of fear inducing behavior and can create fear of future harm and significant emotional distress. ... stalkers can “pose” a threat without saying a word.

Among other things, the stalker showed up at concerts and events I attended or participated in, always unaccompanied. If I moved, he moved, staring relentlessly, not moving a muscle in his face. Was my fear groundless? Did he really pose a threat to me? A stalker does not have to be violent to be threatening. If I was uncertain, Logan and Walker are clear that some of the things he finally did or tried to do are indeed harmful:

...work sabotage, Ruining reputation, Forced confrontation, Harass friends and family, Threaten or actually harm self. (Logan and Walker 2017, 203)

## The Poll

The five accumulative rules were thus the path to my own revelation, starting with not taking no for an answer. Now I wanted to know (this was before the #metoo movement) if my experience was shared. Were the English Lute songs actually a blue-print copy of the progression of an abusive relation? I interviewed some therapists with experience of counseling survivors and perpetrators of domestic abuse and made a poll to be filled anonymously by women from a women shelter. The women, via their counsellors, got a letter with a description of the research and how it would be used. The poll was simply a list of the accumulative rules with a box to tick for every rule they recognised from their own abusive relationship. If they did not agree with the order of the rules, I encouraged them to change the order with arrows.

1. do not take “no” for an answer

2. create a matrix of love and hate, where fear, friendliness, or indifference are impossible options
3. alternate pleading with accusation
4. threaten to take your own life and blame her for it threaten to, or actually use, violence.

However, rule number one is already a form of violence, since it shows that you are insensitive to other’s needs and thereby capable of crossing borders. Or as it is stated in one commonly used definition of violence:

...any act directed against another person, where this act either harms, hurts or offends in a way that makes the person do something against his/her will or stop doing something that he/she would like to do. (Isdal 2001)

It is notable that of the twenty women participating in the poll, the themes presented was to a large extent recognised in their relationship. Almost all agreed and acknowledged the themes one, two and three, and a vast majority, but not all of the women also apprehended the themes four and five. In addition there also was a question about the sequence of the themes. Only a few of the women did alter the sequence, so in large it was recognised.

## Negotiating Violence

Now, several months later, the inevitable backlash of the metoo-movement has arrived. Some claim we must make a difference between rape and harmless flirting. But who gets to decide what is harmless? The perpetrator or the victim? To blame the victim, has always been part of a perpetrator’s argument. The #metoo-backlash thus puts us in a situation where violence is negotiated, something I came across in my surveys with women who had experienced domestic violence in this project. Women in abusive relationships found it difficult to deal with rule number five. Were they exposed to violence or not? Would a hit with an open hand be violence? Or kicks? Or stranglehold? Their partners had persuaded them to move the borders of what constituted violence

in their particular relation. This is something also the sociologist Susanne Boëthius describes in her dissertation where she interviewed men who had been in therapy for violent behavior to their partners. A man describes in an interview:

If I push her she falls, but if she pushes me I hardly feel it. But we are doing to same thing. It is the same thing. So she is as much abusive as I am, only that she is smaller. (Boethius 2015, 121)

The man did not want to be associated with physical abuse, since it is regarded as de-grading. Therefore he directed the attention away from what harm was being done, to a matter of physical imbalance. The sociologist Jeff Hearn has described five different clusters of how men accounts to violence; *Repudiation, Quasi-repudiation, Excuses and justifications, Confessions and contradictory accounts* (Hearn 1998). The negation of violence becomes very explicit when it comes to quasi-repudiation. Even if the violence to some extent is acknowledged, different strategies are used that in the end makes the admitted violence defined as non-violent. It might include aspects of minimizing, reducing and relativizing the violence. The violence might also be reframed by arguments and distinctions about what is and what is not violence, like in the quote above, or seeing it as some kind of a natural process. The one who listens to the Quasi-denial may be confused and uncertain about what has actually happened, if it was violence or not, and might result in the uncertainty that was expressed by women who participated in this project.

Another aspect of negotiating violence is the moral discourse of excuses and justifications. Whereas the excuse includes elements of accepting the blame but not the responsibility, defining the man as the *actual* victim, forced to use violence triggered by something or someone else. Commonly described as “losing control” (Hearn 1998).

Cause I had inough, To become more rough, (Jones 1609, no. 2)

In the quote from Robert Jones’ *Sweet Kate* it is as if the man has been holding back his violence for a while, but in the end decided not to. The song represents the fictive Kate’s behavior as

a justification for violence, which she also expects. In fact, she derides his hesitancy.

What a fool is he, Stands in awe of once denying. (Jones 1609, no. 2)

When the male poet puts these words into Kate’s mouth, the man gets his justification.

Justifications denotes accepting the responsibility, but not the blame. The violence is also a response to something that is happening or just recently has happened which is out of the man’s own control. It is a consequence of something that happens in relation to the women, thus making both the man and the woman as, at least partly, agents. However, it is often formulated as a reaction to the woman not acting in a manner that the man expects and has the right to demand. Underlying justifications is the man’s right to use violence to correct her. Thus, the woman is seen as an object possessed by the man. Even if the man admits the use of violence, he would not have had to use it if the woman had behaved properly. Hence the man is not to blame for the violence but the woman. Whereas the excuse refers to something that happens inside the man out of his control, triggered by something or someone outside making him behave violent, the justification refers to something that occurs as a result of an interpersonal process. The man is still in some control of his behaviors but he is forced to use violence by the woman not consenting to behave in a way that she is supposed to do.

Vnkind, I find, Thy delight is in tormenting, Abide, I cride, Or I die with thy consenting. (Jones 1609, no. 2)

In this quote the male persona says that Kate’s rejection of him is her way of tormenting him. Thus he has the right to also assume that she wants him to die, and that she were to blame if he took his own life. This kind of justification for violence (since the threat of hurting one self is also seen as violence) is also present in contemporary research about how abusive men talk about their violence. In a study of support to children who have witnessed violence against their mother, mothers where asked to describe how the

man who had abused them had talked about the violence (Broberg et al. 2011). Thirty-two of the interviews were transcribed and analysed in an inductive approach (Oscarsson 2015). Thematic analysis were used, meaning that utterances were coded and collated in sub- and finally main-themes (Braun and Clarke 2006). Four main themes emerged, in large in line with Hearn's different clusters (I) The violence had not occurred (Repudiation), (II) Minimizing the violence (Quasi-repudiation), (III) She was the problem and the right to use violence (Excuses and justification).

### So, Why Bother about Old Music?

Today there is a broad consensus among researchers and theoreticians that men's violence against women is best understood from a multifactorial perspective from different levels (ontogenetic, micro meso, macro)<sup>1</sup> interacting (Hagemann-White, et al. 2010). From this perspective, contemporary media, when repeatedly displaying and rewarding successful acts of violence and their connection to sexuality and gender, is a powerful influence on the culture on a macro level. However, it is on the micro level in close relationships the impact becomes visible in how they form ideas about what behavior is expected from men and women. Thus, it is important to bother about culture utterances, whether it is lute songs or contemporary music videos.

Furthermore, to blame the victim is not only the perpetrator's argument. Victim blaming is defined in research as attributing the blame for an offense, at least to some degree, to the victim (Adolfsson and Strömwall 2017, 527). Research has shown that the risk of victim blaming in the criminal act of rape is a reality (Adolfsson and Strömwall 2017, 527). Among the different factors

1 "Ontogenetic" refers to individual "life history", "micro" to dynamics in smaller face-to-face groups, such as peer groups, family, etc., "meso" to larger institutions and organizations and "macro" to cultural, historical and economic structures).

contributing to victim blaming, the acceptance of rape myths proven to be a strong one (Adolfsson and Strömwall 2017, 540). It was in the 1970s that the concept of rape myth was introduced, defined as "prejudicial, stereotyped, or false beliefs about rape, rape victims and rapists." (Grubb and Turner 2012, 445) In the late 1990s Payne, Lonsway, and Fitzgerald in their development of the *Illinois Rape Myth Acceptance Scale* found seven themes of female rape myths (1999). These were "she asked for it" (e.g. When women are raped, it's often because the way they said "no" was ambiguous), "it wasn't really rape" (e.g. If a woman doesn't physically fight back, you can't really say that it was rape), "he didn't mean to" (e.g. When a man is very sexually aroused, he may not even realize that the woman is resisting), "she wanted it" (e.g. Many women actually enjoy sex after the guy uses a little force), "she lied" (e.g. A lot of women lead a man on and then they cry rape), "rape is a trivial event" (e.g. If a woman is willing to "make out" with a guy, then it's no big deal if he goes a little further and has sex) and "rape is a deviant event": e.g. it is usually only women who dress suggestively that are raped; In reality, women are almost never raped by their boyfriends (Payne et al. 1999). Acceptance of rape myths has proven to impact ideas that the numbers of false reports of rape are high, whereas the actual figure in research is estimated to 2% (Grubb and Turner 2012, 445). In addition rape myth acceptance has been associated to decisions made by police and prosecutors, and thereby also have had a large impact on conviction rates and prosecution of cases (Grubb and Turner 2012). Thus cultural beliefs on a macro level might also have an impact on a meso level.

Furthermore, rape myth acceptance also increases the risk of being a perpetrator of rape. (Grubb and Turner 2012, 445)

Would it were dumb midnight now,  
 When all the world lyes sleeping:  
 Would this place some Desert were,  
 Which no man hath in keeping.  
 My desires should then be safe,  
 And when you cry'd, then would I laugh,  
 (Campion 1613, no 18)

## References

- Adolfsson, Kerstin, and Leif A. Strömwall. 2017. "Situational variables or beliefs? A multifaceted approach to understanding blame attributions." *Psychology, Crime & Law* 23 (6): 527–552.
- BBC News. 2018. "YouTube deletes half of 'violent' music videos." Accessed June 27, 2018. <https://www.bbc.com/news/newsbeat-44281586>.
- Boethius, Susanne. 2015. *Män, våld och moralarbete. Rapporter från män som sökt behandling för våld i nära relationer*. (Men, violence and moral work. Reports from men who have sought treatment for violence in intimate realtions). Lund: Lund University.
- BRÅ, The Swedish National Council for Crime Prevention. n.d. "Swedish criminal statistics." Accessed June 27, 2018. <https://www.bra.se/bra-in-english/home/crime-and-statistics/rape-and-sex-offences.html>.
- Braun, Virginia, and Victoria Clarke. 2006. "Using thematic analysis in psychology." *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 3 (2): 77–101.
- Broberg A. G., L. Almqvist, U. Axberg, et al. 2011. *Support to children who have witnessed violence against their mothers: Results from a national evaluation study*. Gothenburg: University of Gothenburg.
- Campion, Thomas. 1613. *Tvvo Bookes of Ayres. The First Contayning Diuine and Morall Songs: the Second, Light Conceits of Louers*. London: Tho. Snodham.
- Granath, Sven. 2015. "Lethal violence in Sweden 1990–2014: a description of trends with a specific focus on firearm violence. English summary of BRÅ report." No. 24. Accessed June 26, 2018. <https://www.bra.se/bra-in-english/home/publications/archive/publications/2016-01-11-lethal-violence-in-sweden-1990-2014.html>
- Grubb, Amy, and Emily Turner. 2012. "Attribution of blame in rape cases: A review of the impact of rape myth acceptance, gender role conformity and substance use on victim blaming." *Aggression and Violent Behaviour* 17 (5): 443–452.

- Hagemann-White, C. et al. 2010. "Factors at play in the perpetration of violence against women, violence against children and sexual orientation violence – A multi-level interactive model." European Commission, Feasibility study to assess the possibilities, opportunities and needs to standardize national legislation on violence against women, violence against children and sexual orientation violence. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union.
- Hearn, Jeff. 1998. *The violences of men*. London: Sage Publications.
- Isdal, Per. 2001. *Meningen med våld* (The meaning of violence). Stockholm: Gothia.
- Logan, T. K. and Robert Walker. 2017. "Stalking: A Multidimensional Framework for Assessment and Safety Planning." *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse* 18 (2): 200–222.
- Noren, Jenny & Eriksson, Maria. 2017. *Förändringsarbete med våldsutövande män: strategier för kvalitetsutveckling*. (Rehabilitation of men who practice violence: strategies for quality development). Stockholm: Sveriges Kommuner och Landsting. Accessed January 12, 2018. <https://webbutik.skl.se/bilder/artiklar/pdf/7585-594-3.pdf?issuysl=ignore>.
- Oscarsson, Lovisa. 2015. *Våld i nära relationer – våldsutsatta kvinnor beskriver talet om våldet* (Violence in intimate relations – women exposed to violence describe the talk about violence). Thesis. University of Göteborg: Institute of Psychology.
- Payne, Diana L., Kimberly A. Lonsway, and Lousie F. Fitzgerald. 1999. "Rape myth acceptance: Exploration of its structure and its measurement using the Illinois Rape Myth Acceptance Scale." *Journal of Research in Personality* 33 (1): 27–68.
- Jacobsson, Andreas, Magnus Ullén (ed.), Erik van Ooijen, Johan Wijkmark, and Sofia Wijkmark. 2014. "Våldsamma fantasier, studier i fiktionens våldets funktion och attraktion" (Violent fantasies, studies in the function and attraction of fictional violence). Karlstad University: Kulturvetenskapliga skriftserien no. 2.
- Jones, Robert. 1609. *A musicall Dreame or the fourth booke of Ayres*. London: Iohn Windet.

CHAPTER 3

To Stage or Not to Stage?

Katarina A. Karlsson & Gunilla Gårdfeldt



The work from idea to performance is an entangled matter of design, study, rehearsals and interpretation, well described in, for instance, Sara Wilén's thesis (Wilén 2017). For the implementation of *Love has a hundred evil names* I involuntarily shouldered many roles: instigator, project leader, script writer, translator, producer, promoter, composer, singer, actor, researcher, mother, victim of stalking. This chapter will be a chronological description of my journey through and with English lute songs, and the work with *Love has a hundred evil names* in particular, where the stage director and my fellow researcher Gunilla Gårdfeldt Carlsson is the author of the second half of this chapter.

### History

As described in the chapter 'Love songs,' I started singing Elizabethan love songs as part of my voice training in the late 1970s. Over the years, I translated them to Swedish and composed my own "lute songs." As I experienced that the audience did not always perceive the lyrics, I began staging the songs. The performance *Lady Essex' secret* was based on the life of Frances Howard (See chapter five). I portrayed the narrator as well as Frances herself. The guitarist Thomas Melin, who is the most listening accompanist I ever had, portrayed Robert Carr. We dressed in mock Renaissance costumes and made a tour with the production. Later I used the English lute songs in concerts mixed with contemporary music. In churches many of the sacred English lute songs went well. In my doctoral project I experimented with twelve songs by Thomas Campion with female personas. I cross-dressed in mock-Renaissance male costume, modern male suits, and in the clothes of a modern rural farmer. By trying various accompanying instruments and sometimes amplifying the singing, I examined how the singing technique, and thereby the story of the song, was affected. I arranged the songs for female quartet, careful to always avoid the lute, for which they were originally written, since I was more interested in communicating the songs than interpreting them in a historically authentic way (See Karlsson 2012).

The songs were indeed durable, that is, I never grew tired of them. So, when starting the research project *The 'essentially' feminine* I had already performed English lute songs for almost forty years, and wanted to explore another side aspect of them. Two of the songs, "Think's thou Kate to put me down" (Jones 1605, app. 3), and "Sweet Kate" (Jones 1609, no. 2), those with the most troubling content, were given to two interesting Swedish composers, Paula af Malmborg Ward and Ida Lundén. I chose Paula because she had dealt with the human voice before in works for choir and opera. Ida was unknown to me, and recommended by the choir leader professor Gunnar Eriksson, whose taste in music I have always trusted. The composers received a minimum of instructions, but maximum information, since I was curious to learn what they would add from their own artistic minds.

#### *Love Has a Hundred Evil Names: The Music*

The singers were Tore Sunesson, Sigrid Algsten, Helena Sjöstrand Svonn, myself, and Matts Johansson. I asked Tore to lead the rehearsals and take on more responsibility than the others. A group with highly trained singers as small as this one, can work without a leader. But my experience is that when there is an instigator, the unspoken rule is for the instigator to lead, which I did not want. The arrangement also provided me a person with whom to discuss issues between rehearsals. Later when Andreas Edlund, harpsichord and Kristina Lindgård, baroque cello were added, I asked Andreas to take over Tore's role in the rehearsals. Andreas also made musical arrangements and contributed generally to the musical performance. Andreas is an experienced Early Music musician with an inventive and unorthodox way of dealing with the genre (Edlund 2010).

Paula's "Sweet Kate D.E.F-version" was a complicated piece and the singers were chosen carefully. Tore, Helena, and I had performed together for decades in various ensembles. Matts had the

required qualities of a male peacock. Sigrid, who is also my daughter, added an age gap, which made the violence of the songs more troubling. The musical rehearsals went on for more than a year.

The repertoire for *Love has a hundred evil names* thus consisted of three newly composed songs, two English madrigals, three Italian madrigals and four lute songs, since I also wrote one, some of the latter performed twice. In addition, we sang a modern, popular Swedish song arranged by Tore into a pastiche of an Early Modern Madrigal. The lyrics of the song "Gråt inga tårar mer för min skull" (Shed no more tears for me) corresponded to the grand, melancholic lyrics of English Lute songs. I translated two madrigals and one lute song into Swedish. The English madrigals were about love, had a male persona, and contained at least one of the rules.

At this stage I want to make it clear that even with all five rules present in a song there is no way to state that the intent of a lute song, is to "...dominate, devalue and in some cases destroy," as Logan and Walker put it in their article (Logan and Walker 2017, 209). The actual contents of the songs can be discussed, but the intent only speculated upon. However, I would like to return to the quote the Swedish crime journalist and author Katarina Wennstam:

How will young men ever learn to treat women with respect when the surrounding society puts the label 'love' on behavior which is wrong, or even criminal? (Wennstam 2018)

And "Love songs" is what these songs often are called.

The Italian madrigals did not fit the rules, but were chosen because they were from the right time frame, they were about love, had female originators and were beautiful. They would also serve as a break from the violent theme.

Ida Lundén was asked to make her piece easy to learn, since it was added late in the process. In her composition she made use of the two instrumentalists on stage; Andreas Edlund, harpsichord, and Kristina Lindgård, baroque cello.

*Love Has a Hundred Evil Names:*  
The Script

The script for *Love has a hundred evil names* started with two texts. I put one of them partially to music which made a seamless transition between Matts's monologue and the music. The title came from a linguistic investigation I did on five of the songs, which contained four of the five rules. The songs were "If my complaints could passion move", "Now O now I needs must part", "Shall I sue" by John Dowland (1597, no 4, 6, and 1600, no. 17) "Sweet Kate" and "Think'st thou Kate to put me down", both by Robert Jones (1605, no 2 and 1609, no 12).

I wanted to see what verbs and adjectives were connected to men and women in the songs. It turned out that all traits and activities connected to men were forms of suffering, love, and death. The word "death" in different forms was connected to the male subject fourteen times in five songs (see appendix 2). The adjectives and verbs connected to women displayed much more variation. No word in particular stood out, but they were all synonymous of cruelty, shallowness and/or abuse of power. I would once again like to refer to crime journalist Katarina Wennstam who in her radio show (2018) counted 59 degrading words for a woman who is said to be sexually active, while men of the same behavior got sixteen words, whereof most were not degrading, but rather rewarding. I used some of the degrading words from the investigation to time-travel in the script from the seventeenth century to the present day. After my character had told the audience how the linguistic investigation showed the many words the English lute songs used to describe womens' bad behavior, the whole cast counted the words found in the investigation; despises, scorns, flees, deceive, torments, lies, commands, and so on. During Matts's and Tore's continuing dialogue, I gradually introduced the words from the investigation with lines from the interviews with the therapists and overheard arguments, which made the conversation between the two men more contemporary.

The eloquence in the description of the woman's bad traits seems to be a common trait also in stalking messages. In the interviews

with therapists who had counseled victims and perpetrators of domestic violence, the therapists described how perpetrators in cases drawn to justice, use the courtroom as a stage, as it were, often crying while elaborating on the woman's bad behavior towards them. The stalking messages I personally received were indeed eloquent which was how I realized the connection to the English Lute songs in the first place.

In the early stage of writing, I wanted to have actual quotes from perpetrators in the performance. After contacting the Research Council's committee of ethics, I realized that I would put survivors of domestic violence in danger. I decided to use direct quotes from some of the messages sent to myself, although I had always been careful not to spread the facts to too many, in fear of what the stalker might do (Logan and Walker 2017, 203). To handle the situation, our stage director Gunilla Gårdfeldt-Carlsson, suggested that the lines would be shared among the cast, which turned out to be a good idea.

*Love Has a Hundred Evil Names:*  
The Gender

Paula's piece was originally written for eight parts, but there were only five singers in the vocal ensemble for *Love has a hundred evil names*. We all ended up singing both 'female' and 'male' parts, which suited the floating gender ideas of English Renaissance drama well. As we know, all female characters were played by men in Shakespeare's plays, which is why I have experimented with cross-dressing for the last twelve years. Many writers have dealt with this fact, I refer to some of them in my dissertation (Karlsson 2012). The costume designer Nonno Nordqvist put heels, breeches, bows and jackets in bright orange and pink on the men (except the harpsichord player who had grey wool socks), while the women dressed in boots, pants and coats in white, grey, and burgundy. The costumes provided a powerful and useful statement to us and made it possible for the director Gunilla Gårdfeldt-Carlsson to

make us androgynous or male when she wanted to. The transition from female to male happened on stage in the original version of “Think’st thou Kate” (app. 3), where my character turns male.

### A Statement from the Director Gunilla Gårdfeldt-Carlsson

To succeed in a dramatic staging of music, a useful and good script with a strong story is a “must” for me as a director. The music in the script should be of varying complexity and duration. In combination, these conditions can create important story-telling in the staging, with multi-faceted characters, exiting relationships and the right preconditions for a dynamic stage-work. Besides that, I need trained actors with curiosity, empathy, courage, and inclination for their work. With all of that in place, we can go ahead with the substantial work required to make the play, and the characters, our own. Every singing actor must, via their imagination, constantly have the courage to reconsider their rehearsal work, both in the role and in the story-line in order to make our rehearsals a development of the senses in the material (Gårdfeldt 2017).

All that I have so far described was present in *Love has a hundred evil names*; via Katarina’s script, newly composed music by Paula af Malborg Ward, Ida Lundén and Katarina plus a skillful ensemble of singing actors! Obviously the script had to be adjusted and sharpened in collaboration with the whole cast. Our goal was now to jointly create a narration that would reach and touch our audience. We wanted the audience to leave our performance with a story that had given birth to existential thoughts and questions in each and every one of them. Questions of what it is to be human, questions that give us all hope and strength because the story has been told in completely earnestly, but with comedy as a weapon. The good laugh (as well as the laugh that gets stuck), opens us as humans and makes us more susceptible to recognition also of the difficulties and darkness in our performance.

The performance dealt with gender, the male versus the female, as Katarina has described above. We problematized and compared the male and female in the seventeenth century with the twenty-first century. What then is specific in the difference between the sexes? We know so much about this... and yet! What happens if we emphasize the human, the sort of behavior any sex could use in power and relationships? What happens if we also let female actors perform gendered power towards women as well as men? Will this even clarify our questions?

At this stage, we had to find a way of working which made the characters believable and simultaneously provided the singers with the chance to believe in themselves. The costumes contributed very much in those respects. We had a very good collaboration with our costume designer Nonno Nordqvist. We tried costume suggestions, discussed and adjusted continuously to find the gender-crossing expression we were looking for to enrich the actors’ work on stage. We found exciting, spectacular, and surprising expressions. The interpretation of the characters was deepened, strengthened and problematized by the costumes. The variation of status between men and women was facilitated by the male singers’ clothes with a more delicate touch and the female singers’ more robust clothing which could enhance their psychological status. The men had been provided with clothes that could enhance pathetic and self-pitying traits – while still in the next scene be able to turn sharply to high cultural status. All of this was used, tried, and tossed back and forth in the project. One example is the first scene after the opening in the second act where Katarina sings “Think’st thou Kate to put me down”. (app. 3) Her androgynous character taught the men (Tore and Matts) a lesson through the song, on how to court a lady (Helena), demonstrating how to alternately charm and plead but then quickly change into frightening and humiliating the lady, and lastly suggesting how it all must end with force, that is: rape. “Love commands the hands to dare... put it in, put it in,” etc. The scene unraveled at the slightly shocked delight of the men, who then applauded and encouraged the perpetrator.

A second example of change of status was the duet “Sweet Kate” (Jones 1609, no. 2) (in the beginning of the first part) where a young, androgynous person (Sigrid Algesten) teases and scorns the amorous male (Matts Johansson) who seriously thinks he is irresistible when he courts the capricious creature in an exaggerated and – in her eyes – comical way. One leaves the poor longing male on the floor in low status. Matts then immediately performs Katarina’s piece “Se mig” with the rest of the cast. The emphasis here was an exaggerated, male egocentrism, when Matts’s character put on the role of a victim. The rest of the cast took his self-pity with the utmost seriousness and sang a beautiful quartet to sympathize with the poor man. This way of mixing seriousness with humor and satire was a conscious choice on my behalf. It has proven to be an effective way to make the audience interested.

Another example of the same approach is the scene before the finale of the second part. It was another lesson in how a young man should behave to get a woman where he wants her. The three ladies had just told the men off in the vocal trio “Good men show” (Campion 1613, no. 9). To regain his status and amuse the men on stage and in the audience Matts sang “Come you pretty false-ey’d wanton” (Campion 1613, no. 18) in a Swedish translation which did not embellish the misogyny of the song, rather the opposite. What the translation did was to show how refined the agenda is in English. My choice was to direct Matts to interpret the song with crude sexual hints, in a way that has always lured a male audience into amiable laughter. However, Tore’s laughter was strained. With an excusing smile he corrected his younger colleague: “This is how we do it!” after which Tore sang the same song in English in a courtly and elegant manner using his best British accent. He instructed his younger friend, who listened with growing understanding and admiration while trying to imitate Tore. The manipulated version was a means for the audience to experience the male prerogative and gendered power in a way that was both elegant and uncomfortable.

Since I always look for rich variation between the scenes in a stage performance, I highlighted and returned to the human behavior revealed in the relationships between the characters. It was

important to give the audience a multi-dimensional view of our story. I, together with the cast, wanted to bring out a staging that was at the same time troubling and affecting. I wanted the existential depth and the humor to take turns on stage for the audience to get a chance to reflect and recognize themselves in a contemporary and historical context.

Yet another example was when an androgynous being (Helena) interacted with the other four singers as they sang the beautiful quartet “Io v’amo vita mia” (Schleter et al. 1996, p. 149). This person approached them quietly and physically to figure out how it would be to make love to each and every one of them. The result was both sensual, comical and liberated us from the hetero-normative in love, that is usually present in western classical music.

The first and second part both opened with beautiful choral pieces that embraced the audience from all sides with lovely sound and the intoxicating promises of exquisite love. In both cases I used the approach of surprise by placing a scene immediately afterwards which displayed bullying or abuse of power. The first occasion was when the cello player (Kristina Lindgård) was attacked by the “mob” in the song “Fair Phyllis” (Farmer 1599, no. 15). The ensemble teased Kristina, with accelerating hostility that interfered with the cellists’s personal space until she had to flee in terror. The scene draws on how contemporary mobbing can appear on a school yard or in social media. The second scene of the second part, “Think’st thou Kate to put me down” (app. 3), is described above.

Apart from the direct quotations and dialogues from actual stalking, Katarina used, as she has described, two texts about her research. These were directed in a conscious, scenic way. The ensemble, including the two musicians Kristina Lindgård and musical director Andreas Edlund participated with lines and were by all means acting on equal terms with the rest of the cast. In that way we gave the dialogues more life and a more heated atmosphere. The feeling was that the two musicians were completely involved in Katarina’s story.

The two newly composed, and interesting musical pieces were placed in the end of the first and second half. The placing of the

pieces took some pondering. We decided for several reasons that Paula af Malmborg Ward's composition "Sweet Kate D. E. F. version" should end the first part and Ida Lundén's work the second part. We put a great deal of extra work into Paula's refined, but technically difficult piece, which was hard to learn. These fantastic singers still managed to learn the piece by heart, but my choice as a director was to use three music stands (two for the women on one side, and one for the men on the other side). In this way the five singers could use the walk between the music stands to define their gender identity, to move the stands in order to either threaten someone or find shelter behind them. In that way the long musical scene (11 minutes) could be varied and gradually intensified. The scene also contained some comical parameters, which gradually evolved in a growingly eerie situation for the characters and the climax was very strong. After that, the scene ended with the five singers whimpering as if they were totally wiped out. And that was where the break came.

Part two started, as I mentioned previously, with the most exquisite baroque piece. After the mix of comical and serious scenes, the second part concluded directly after Tore and Matts sang "Come you pretty false-ey'd wanton" (Campion 1613, no. 18) described above with Katarina's character brusquely giving the singers a file each for Ida's piece "Men's words – med hänsyn till allvar" (Men's words – with consideration of their gravity). The light was changed to an icy blue glow as Ida's piece started. This was different compared to Paula's scene, which had been filled with extreme emotions. The stage direction was scarce. The situation and the text described, coldly and objectively, what the law on sexual crime says about sexual harassment. A minimalistic repetition of text and music gave a strong effect, which we used to sum up Katarina's research in our scenic story.

## References

- Campion, Thomas. 1613. *Two Bookes of Ayres. The First Contayning Diuine and Morall Songs: the Second, Light Conceits of Louers*. London: Tho. Snodham.
- Dowland, John. 1597. *The First Booke of Songes or Ayres*. London: Peter Short.
- . 1600. *The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres*. London: Thomas Este.
- Edlund, Andreas. 2010. "Vogler och Pergolesis Stabat Mater: En väg till historiskt informerad uppförandepraxis." Masters thesis, University of Gothenburg.
- Farmer, John. 1599. *The First Set of English Madrigals: to Foure Voices*. London: William Barley.
- Gårdfeldt, Gunilla. 2017. *Scenkonst – en handbok i musik och teater*. Göteborg: Bo Egebys Förlag.
- Jones, Robert. 1605. *Vltimum Vale*. London: Iohn Windet.
- . 1609. *A musicall Dreame or the fourth booke of Ayres*. London: J. Windlet.
- Karlsson, Katarina A. 2012. " 'Think'st thou to seduce me then' – interpreting songs with female personas by Thomas Campion (1567-1620)." PhD diss., University of Gothenburg.
- Logan, R. and T. K. Walker. 2017. "Stalking: A Multidimensional Framework for Assessment and Safety Planning." *Trauma, Violence, and Abuse* 18 (2): 200–222.
- Schleifer, Martha and Sylvia Glickman, eds. 1996. *Women Composers: Music through the Ages, vol. 1: Composers Born Before 1599*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Wennstam, Katarina. *Sommar & Vinter i Pt*. "Sommar." Produced by Erika Strand-Berglund. Swedish Radio, June 6, 2018.
- Wilén, Sara. 2017. "Singing in Action: An inquiry into the creative working processes and practices of classical and contemporary vocal improvisation." Phd diss., Malmö Academy of Music.

CHAPTER 4

The Topic of 'Love' in Early  
Modern English Lute Songs or Ayres

Christopher R. Wilson



The large majority of so-called English lute songs or ayres preference as the subject of their texts “love” in all its forms and meanings. Indeed, the entire canon of lute-song subject matter can be categorised as “love” and “other,” the latter including religious songs, quasi-pastoral topics and *personae*, devotional and elegiac songs (Songs of Mourning), seasonal songs (Christmas and Easter, May Day), life and death – grief. A similar division can be made with regard the English madrigal (1588–1630) but because the madrigal is essentially a polyphonic medium its expressivity and emotional impact are less direct and potentially explicit as opposed to the immediacy of the solo voice lute song. Moreover, the madrigal prefers to set one stanza only of a multi-stanza poem, whereas the lute song often provides strophic settings of entire poems. In other words, the lute song as solo song is capable of individual, personal expression of an intensity or otherwise only found in these songs, their performative alternatives as part songs notwithstanding (Wilson 1983, 3–12; Greer 1967–8, 97–110).

The English lute song was a print phenomenon.<sup>1</sup> Between William Barley’s *A New Booke of Tabliture* (1596) and John Attey’s *The First Booke of Ayres* (1622), thirty-two collections of English ayres were published. The beginning,<sup>2</sup> whose impetus derived from John Dowland’s *The First Booke of Songes or Ayres* (1597), coincided with William Byrd’s relinquishment of the printing patent to Thomas Morley.<sup>3</sup> It released into the public domain a music-poetry type of art-music hitherto reserved to esoteric circles of Elizabethan readers and authors. The most prolific composers were John Dowland (1563–1626), Thomas Campion (1567–1620), and Robert Jones (c. 1570–c. 1617) who between them contributed over half the entire output of more than 600 English lute songs.<sup>4</sup>

1 For a discussion of a wide range of aspects of print culture in the early seventeenth century, see Raymond 2011; Marotti 1995.

2 Lute songs had circulated in manuscript copies from c. 1560 (Greer 1979).

3 The patent is reproduced in Robert Steele 1903. See also Krummel 1975 and Price 1981, 180–9.

4 Dr Karlsson has identified and investigated 755 individual songs relating to this genre as part of her current study “Kärleken har 100 onda Namn” (Love has 100 evil names).

The songs were published in folio collections comprising eighteen to twenty-eight leaves or pages presenting a corresponding number of ayres either for solo voice with lute accompaniment and/or viol (sometimes orpharion), or in score arranged in vocal parts for three or four voices.<sup>5</sup> The majority of books contain twenty-four leaves following the precedent set in Dowland's first book of 1597.

Why certain composers hastened (or otherwise) into print can be explained partly by their artistic *persona*. John Dowland was essentially (in today's terminology) a professional musician, earning his living by composing, performing and teaching though not necessarily in that order. On the title page of his first book of ayres and in subsequent books, he is keen to parade his professional qualifications, styling himself "Batcheler of muscike in both the Universities" [i.e. Oxford and Cambridge]. Publication of his books of ayres coincides with his career development, or rather his frustrations as Diana Poulton contends:

the reason he chose the year 1597 in which to publish his first collection [of ayres] probably resulted from the realization that, after the second failure to secure an appointment at Court, his career had reached a critical point, and that some special effort was needed to maintain himself in public favour after his absence abroad. (Poulton 1982, 48–9).

Choosing lute ayres rather than solo lute music would reach a wider public and stand a better chance of bringing his name to public and courtly attention. Some years later, Dowland's son, Robert, affirms as it were the potential audience the books of ayres hoped to reach:

Some [ayres] I have purposely sorted to the capacite of young practitioners, the rest by degrees are of greater depth and skill, so that like a carefull Confectionary, as neere as might be I have fitted my banquet for all tastes. (Dowland 1610)

<sup>5</sup> Modern edition: Greer 2000. For a critical assessment of the part-song versions, see Wilson 1983, 3–12.

In other words, there are ayres of all kinds to suit all tastes, ranging from pure entertainment and amusement to erudition and moral advancement among aristocratic households and the emergent mercantile gentry, to be performed by family members or household music servants (Price 1981).

Robert Jones was a composer and lutenist who "professed Musicke" to earn his living. He achieved the BMus from Oxford University in 1597. He published five books of ayres between 1600 and 1610, the most intense period of popularity for the lute ayre. He seems to have encountered mixed fortunes in his musical career, if the preface "To all Musicall Murmurers" in his fourth book, *A Musicall Dreame* (1609) is to be believed:

Thou, whose eare itches with the varietie of opinion, hearing thine owne sound, as the Ecchoe reverberating others substance, and unprofitable in it selfe, shewes to the World comfortable noyse, though to thy owne use little pleasure, by reason of uncharitable censure.

reflecting on the decline of his popularity and esteem. His standing and widespread adumbration are attested by the status of an ayre in his first collection, *The First Booke of Songes or Ayres* (1600), rated as "one of the most successful of all the English lutenist songs" (Greer 1990, 213–29). In addition to arrangements for lute, cittern, mandora, or virginals, "Farewel Deare Love" was arranged as a vocal-lute parody found in various sources ranging from Scotland to the Netherlands. Famously it was used by Shakespeare in *Twelfth Night* (act 2, scene 3) in a love lusty scene and later by Beaumont in his *Knight of the Burning Pestle* (c. 1609) (2. 470–1) in a similar love forlorn scene.

Unlike Dowland and Jones, Thomas Campion did not "profess" music and boasted no professional musical qualifications in his published works. There is no reference in his own or contemporaneous sources to his having received any specialist musical education though an amateur attainment on the lute would be most likely. His published ayres manifest his musical output which is certainly comparable in skill, range and quality to other English lutenist song-writers, excepting Dowland. But Campion regarded

his English ayres as no more than “superfluous blossomes of his deeper Studies,” in other words as second best to his Latin verse (see also Wilson 2017, 54–66). He published five collections of ayres between 1601 and 1618, representing compositional output from the 1590s right up to the end of his career. Unique among the lutenist song-writers (though there is some probability Dowland wrote some of his own lyrics), Campion composed both music and poetry for almost all his entire output. All his books were printed as paired volumes – two books in one publication. His first *A Booke of Ayres* (1601) was a joint venture with his close associate and friend, Philip Rosseter (c. 1568–1623). Campion provided music and poetry for the first part of the book; Rosseter composed the music to Campion’s lyrics in the second part.<sup>6</sup> The other four books are themed. The second and third books – *Two Bookes of Ayres I* and *II* (c. 1613) – are arranged according to poetic and musical content, thus “The First Contayning Divine and Morall Songs: The Second, Light Conceits of Lovers.” David Lindley argues that:

In order to build up a picture of the kinds of connections made between poems, and, more important, to establish how such connections are significant for the reader’s experience of Campion’s work, it is convenient to begin with the simplest relationships between individual lyrics and then move on to consideration of patternings that inform the structure of the *Bookes* as whole units. (Lindley 1986, 8)

Campion offers ample hints of this procedure in his prefaces and other writings. The third and fourth books like the first and second books are similarly dedicated to father and son, whose content reflects their respective situations in life, in particular age and youth sometimes identified with religion and love.

Campion’s “light conceits of lovers,” together with the extensive canon of the English lutenist song-writers embraces a diverse range of kinds of love poetry set to music. Variety is the spice of love poetry, as [George] Puttenham observed:

<sup>6</sup> It is not proved that Campion supplied the lyrics, but see Berringer 1943, 938–48.

because love is of all other humane affections the most puissant and passionate, and most generall to all sortes and ages of men and women, so as whether it be of the yong or old, or wise or holy, or high estate or low, none ever could truly bragge of any exemption in that case: it requireth a forme of Poesie variable, inconstant, affected, curious, and most witty of any others, whereof the ioyes were to be uttered in one sorte, the sorrowes in an other, and, by many formes of Poesie, the many moodes and pangs of lovers thoroughly to be discovered; the poore soules sometimes praying, beseeching, sometime honouring, avancing, praising, an other while railing, reviling, and cursing, then sorrowing, weeping, lamenting, in the ende laughing, reioysing, & solacing the beloved againe, with a thousand delicate devises, odes, songs, elegies, ballads, sonets, and other ditties, mooving one way and another to great compassion. (Puttenham 1904, 46–7)

Puttenham alludes to a wide variety of kinds of verse forms and subject matter from joy to sadness though he does not mention melancholy.

Out of the diverse range of forms of “amorous affections and allurements,” Campion seems to select amatory material best suited to the dedicatee of the second book, the young Henry, Lord Clifford, son and heir to the Right Honourable Francis, Earle of Cumberland (the dedicatee of the first book):

These weeke-day works in order that succede,  
Your youth best fits, and yours yong Lord they be.  
(dedicatory verse in *The Second Booke*)

The opening poem is a moralising reflection on the power and effect of love, cautioning the reader of vanity and impetuosity:

Vaine men, whose follies make a God of Love,  
Whose blindness beauty doth immortal deeme,  
Prayse not what you desire, but what you prove,  
Count those things good that are, not those that seeme.  
I cannot call her true that’s false to me,

Nor make of women more then women be.

In this first stanza the youth is advised to be realistic in love. In the second, retrospective narrative the youth recalls the time when his hopes and desires were quashed:

How faire an entrance breakes the way to love?  
 How rich of golden hope, and gay delight?  
 What hart cannot a modest beauty move?  
 Who seeing cleare day once will dreame of night?  
 Shee seem'd a Saint that brake her faith with mee,  
 But prov'd a woman as all other be.

The third stanza as it were glosses the first two, advising the youth to be confident and imaginative in love, to put his past dejection behind him and not be too beholden to women's foibles:

So bitter is their sweet, that true content  
 Unhappy men in them may never finde,  
 Ah but without them none; both must consent,  
 Else uncouth are the joyes of eyther kinde.  
 Let us then prayse their good, forget their ill,  
 Men must be men, and women women still.

Campion's music is melodically simple observing step-wise movement across an overall, arched descent.<sup>7</sup> The rhythm is less straightforward, incorporating elements of syncopation on unaccented syllables and a typical couplet refrain, which increases the tempo. There may be influence of dance here in this short refrain, that is the coranto with its alternating duple and triple rhythm. The metrical element is almost exclusively confined to binary pairs of semibreves and minims/minims and crotchets in the refrain, reminiscent of *musique mesurée*.

The next three poems "can best be understood as a kind of clearer re-writing of the narrative of this lyric" (Lindley 1986, 15). Poem two, "How easly wert thou chained" recalls more contented times when the woman was avowedly constant, or at least gave that appearance:

Fond hart by favours fained...  
 My love still here increaseth...  
 Yet 'tis no woman leaves me,

<sup>7</sup> On Campion's musical characteristics from differing aspects, see Greer 1967, 7-16; Lindley 1986, 62-126; Wilson 1989, 86-116; and Wilson 2001.

## Vaine men whose follies make a god of love

For such may prove unjust,  
A Goddess thus deceives me,  
Whose faith who could mistrust?

The lover continues to confuse fantasy with reality. The third poem suggests the lover is beginning to realize the error of his ways:

Harden now thy tyred hart, with more then flinty rage;  
Ne're let her false teares henceforth thy constant grief asswage.

The music is similarly more intricate and the (lute) accompaniment more rhythmically involved. The fourth poem may provide the release from tension (or it may not of course be connected) as the woman concedes and the lover prevails:

O what unhop't for sweet supply!  
O what joyes exceeding!  
What an affecting charme feele I  
From delight proceeding?...  
Since I am hers, and she is mine.

Melodic contour is more ecstatic. There are a number of harmonic niceties entwined in this (ambivalent) major/minor ayre.

Thematic threads run through Campion's books. These are less defined in *A Booke of Ayres* (1601) although here unsophisticated love poems are easily identified, where "love" in its differing guises prevails ranging from Classical allusion in the opening "My sweetest Lesbia let us live and love" recalling Catullus ("Vivamus, mea Lesbia, atque amemus") and Propertius *Elegies* II.xv "O me felicem" (Joy in true love); the "God of merrie Love" (Cupid) poems (nos. 14–16) to more bawdy and sexually explicit ayres such as "Your faire lookes enflame my desire" (no. 17). The music varies in different proportions according to subject matter and metrical content.

It is not uncommon to find poems paired by Campion in his collections. In the amatory *Second Booke*, in one poem (no. 14), the man is distracted by his own sexual arousal:

Pin'd I am, and like to die,  
And all for lacke of that which I  
Doe ev'ry day refuse.  
If I musing sit, or stand,  
Some puts it daily in my hand,  
To interrupt my muse.

The bawdy innuendo is unmistakable except perhaps to the poet himself. The simple, mainly syllabic musical setting underlines the naivety of the youth. That uncertainty is confirmed in the third stanza:

Would I had the heart, and wit,  
To make it stand, and coniure it  
That haunts me thus with feare.  
Doubtless tis some harmless spright,  
For it by day, as well as night,  
Is ready to appeare.  
Be it friend, or be it foe,  
Ere lone Ile trie what it will doe.

In the next song the woman is perplexed by her situation. Whereas in the first song, the youth does not understand the consequence or meaning of his daily sexual desire, in the second the woman denies her younger sexual appeal, or at least is not able to flaunt it.

So many loves have I neglected,  
Whose good parts might move mee;  
That now I live of all rejected,  
There is none will love me.

Whereas the youth is able to bemoan the frustrations of his sexual passions, the woman is not permitted to recall the circumstances of her sexual inhibitions. Herein lies the difference between the male and female *personae*, as the third stanza makes known:

O happy men, whose hopes are licenc'd  
To discourse their passion:  
While women are confin'd to silence,  
Loosing wisht occasion.  
Yet our tongues then theirs, men say,

Are apter to be moving:  
 Women are more dumbe then they,  
 But in their thoughts more [roving].

The musical setting reflects the heightened passion of the words, agitating in melismatic shorter notes (quavers) and melodic octave leaps. Uncertain in his love, doubt enters the mind and affections of the lover as the *Second Booke* proceeds. In the sixth song, the lover ponders on whether or not to declare his love and thereby gain pity:

Faine would I my love disclose,  
 Aske what honour might denie...  
 She would pittie might shee know  
 The harmes that I for her endure...

But the consequence might be worse then he expects:

But both love and her I lose,  
 From my motion if shee flye.  
 Worse then paine is feare to mee,  
 Then hold in fancy though it burne.

In the next poem he reflects on her powerful beauty, the beauty that excites all potential lovers. In “O deare that I with thee might live” he contemplates what might be, intellectualising joined thoughts:

Why should our mindes not mingle so,  
 When love and faith is plighted:  
 That eyther might the others know,  
 Alike in all delighted?

“Good men show if you can tell” is an unusual song both in its setting and self-reflective mode. Its minor key and poignant diminished fourth towards the end of the musical stanza on “sorrow” in “So vext with sorrow is my brest” and “unhappie” in the last line “makes th’unhappie blest” are affective.

The tension is relived somewhat in the next song when the lover asks what harm is there in kissing?

## 15. So many loves have I neglected

Musical score for 'So many loves have I neglected'. The score is in 3/2 time and G major. It features a Treble and Bass staff for the first system, and a Treble (Tr.) and Bass (B.) staff for the second system. The lyrics are: 'So ma - ny loves - have I neg - lect - ed, Whose good parts might move mee, Why is may - den heate so coy?'.

## 9. Good men show if you can tell

Musical score for 'Good men show if you can tell'. The score is in 3/2 time and D minor. It features a Treble and Bass staff for the first system, and a Treble (Tr.) and Bass (B.) staff for the second system. The lyrics are: 'Good men shew, if you can tell, Farre and neere her Where doth hu - mane pit - tie dwell? She (they say) to would I seeke, So vext with sor - row is my brest. all, is meeke, And one - ly makes th'un - hap - pie blest.'

What harvest halfe so sweet is,  
As still to reape the kisses  
Growne ripe in sowing?

The minor mode is continued but the music is significantly more ecstatic and agitated in its paired quaver rhythms. In the following song, the lover can no longer hold back his wish to be united, pleading that she must unbar the door to her (bed-) chamber:

Sweet exclude mee not, nor be divided  
From him that ere long must bed thee...  
Women are most apt to be surprised  
Sleeping, or sleepe wisely fayning.  
Then grace me yet a little more,  
Here's the way, barre not the dore.

A rare example in Campion of sequential four-fold repetition on a descending quaver figure occurs on “yet a little more” in each stanza. Noticeable also is the quaver melisma on “that ere long must bed thee” with its syncopated lute accompaniment. The remaining songs in the book, after a quasi masque-song interjection, “The peacefull westerne winde,” continue to develop the lover’s sexual wants and desires, culminating in the declamation of the final song, “Where shall I refuge seek if you refuse me?.” The message of Campion’s most explicit of amatory books is as stated in the epigrammatic ending of the opening song, “Men must be men, and women women still.”

If thematic patterning can be seen in Campion’s books of ayres then a similar structuring can be found in John Dowland’s books. This is most emphatically the case with his *The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres*, printed sometime shortly before or after July 1600, when it was entered in the Stationers’ Register under Thomas Este.<sup>8</sup> This was the same year as Robert Jones’ *The First Booke Of Songes & Ayres*, Thomas Morley’s *The First Booke Of Ayres*, Thomas

8 Complications surrounding its publication were articulated by Margaret Dowling 1932, 365–80.

Weelkes’ *Madrigals Of 5. and 6. parts*; and the second edition of his own first book of ayres. Dowland was away from England at the court of King Christian IV of Denmark and his quest for preferment at the English court, as has already been suggested, may have intended a special publication. Arguably he adopts as his theme for his own artistic *persona*, that is melancholy.

The philosophy and emotional affect of “melancholy” in early modern poetry and music are connected with the ambivalence of love, requited and unrequited sensations. As Melvin Askew contends, “ambivalence is part of the given, for the woman represents simultaneously cessation of the pain of unrequited love and positive gratification, on the one hand, and on the other, the threat of immediate death, either temporal or eternal” (Askew 1965, 26). Here in this situation requited love is identified with life and therefore the binary opposite to death, the consequence of unrequited love. Daniel Fischlin notes that the “interconnections between love and death in the love ayre define the basic uncertainty of the love experience as a function between self and other. Love’s association with death is epitomized in the idea that sexual ecstasy and death are equivalent forms of a self-annihilation that is also a self-transcendence” (Fischlin 1998, 121).<sup>9</sup> The beloved becomes as one with the lover, as it were the other half or other self in Renaissance Neoplatonic theories of love and death. The interconnectedness of love and death involves among other emotions, melancholy. In his *The Anatomy of Melancholy* (1621), the main source on the subject, Robert Burton defines love as a “species of melancholy” and links it to the “character of mortality” (Burton 1977, III.4). Therefore love, mortality and melancholy interact. Fischlin argues that “implicit in death as a metaphor for love is the expression of the melancholic futility of asserting the self’s sense of transcendence, sine the experience of love is also inevitably the experience of loss, decay, and anamnesis” (Fischlin 1998, 122).

9 See further Austern 1991, 17–36.

The consequence of Duke Orsino's melancholic lovesickness in *Twelfth Night* as a result of his lusty quest for Olivia is "death":

If Musicke be the food of Love, play on,  
Give me excesse of it: that surfetting,  
The appetite may sicken, and so dye. (TN. TLN 5–7)

He therefore calls for moody music of love to help assuage his appetite. He asks once more for a sad song:

That straine agen, it had a dying fall (TN. TLN 8)

The kind of music appropriate for such a situation, and one recently used in a modern "Original Practices" production,<sup>10</sup> is Dowland's famous "lachrymae" also set as a lute ayre in the second book as "Flow my teares."<sup>11</sup> It is one of several "melancholic" ayres which open that book, including "I saw my Lady weepe," "Sorrow stay," "Dye not before thy day," "Mourne, day is with darknesse fled." Others are situated later in the book: "If fluds of teares" (no. 11), "Come yee heavy states of night" (no. 14), and "Woeful hart with griefe oppressed" (no. 16). Other notable melancholic songs by Dowland include the famous "In darknesse let mee dwell" (Robert Dowland, *A Musically Banquet*, 1610, no. 10), "Al ye whom love or fortune hath betrayed" (*First Booke*, 1597, no. 14), and "Come heavy sleepe, the Image of true death" (*First Booke*, 1597, no. 20). The preponderance of melancholic songs in Dowland's works has led some commentators to assert that it represents his artistic *persona*. Anthony Rooley argues that the "songs of darkness" in the second book, whose dedicatee Lady Lucy Countess of Bedford was "central to the poetic cult of darkness," figure his *persona* of "inspired melancholy" together with melancholic songs in other publications (Rooley 1983, 6–21). As such, Dowland's music is steeped in Her-

<sup>10</sup> *Twelfth Night* by Shakespeare's Globe production, first performed in the Middle Temple Hall, London in 2002. Transferred to the Globe theatre later that year. Transferred to Broadway, USA for the 2013–14 season. See further, Kampen 2017, 42–9.

<sup>11</sup> On Dowland's "Lachrymae," see Holman 1999.

metic neoplatonism. In answer to Rooley, Robin Headlam Wells can find no evidence that Dowland's songs contain intellectual philosophising on themes of blackness, despair, anti-Christ, and night, but rather they follow conventional expression in rhetoricised feelings, and that there was nothing extraordinary or esoteric about his art (Wells 1985, 514–28). Diana Poulton takes issue with Rooley and argues that even if "the hearer is left with the conviction that this is the expression of a profoundly tragic experience," that does not tell us much about Dowland's art (Poulton 1983, 517–19). Notwithstanding, Dowland's melancholic love songs stand as supreme examples of their kind among a significant number of ayres in which "pleasant are the teares which Musicke weepes."

In two ayres, Robert Jones asks explicitly "now what is love?." In his *The Second Booke of Songs and Ayres* (1601, no. 9), a variety of possible answers are given, covering the gamut of "love" with its mixed fortunes and affects:

it is that fountaine and that well  
where pleasures and repentance dwell,  
it is perhaps that sancising bell<sup>12</sup>  
that towles all in to heav'n or hell...  
It is a worke on holy daie,  
It is December match't with Maie...  
It is a Sunne-shine mixt with raine,  
It is a gentle pleasing paine,  
A flower that dyes and springs againe,  
It is a noe that would full faine...  
It is a pretie shadie waie  
As well found out by night as daie,  
It is a thing will soone decaie...  
A thing that creepes it cannot goe,  
A prize that passeth to and fro,  
A thing for one a thing for moe [more]  
And he that proves shall find it so...

This was a popular Elizabethan poem first printed in *The Phoenix Nest* (1593) and reprinted with variants and additional stanzas in

<sup>12</sup> Sacring bell, rung three times during the Sanctus at the Holy Mass.

*England's Helicon* (1600) and the second edition of *A Poetical Rhapsody* (1608). In *England's Helicon*, the poem was originally ascribed to Sir Walter Raleigh, but in subsequent editions and various manuscripts, that ascription was cancelled. In various sources as many as 14 extra stanzas are found, ending with a passionate conclusion:

Now to conclude say what love is  
 a thinge of woe a thinge of bliss  
 a thinge wonn & lost with a kiss  
 a firy watry thinge is this  
 A thinge that burnes & nev'r cries hiss  
 and this is love or els I miss.

Mixed in with superficial, near-bawdy humour are some serious elements, such as love's denial and the ability to say "no." In his last, fifth book of ayres, *The Muses Gardin for Delights* (1610, no. 1), Jones offers further definitions of "love," this time with a more ironic twist, explicating love's stimulae:

Love Is a prettie Frencie,  
 a melancholy fire,  
 begot by lookes, maintain'd with hopes,  
 and heythen'd, by desire...

Love is a pretie nothing,  
 Yet what a quoile it keeps,  
 With thousand eyes of jealousies,  
 Yet no one ever sleepes

More than any other lutenist song-writer, Jones sets poems on the subject of love's denial. These are: the third book, *Ultimum Vale* (1605, no. 12):

Thinkst thou Kate to put me downe  
 with a no, or with a frowne,  
 since love holds my hart in bandes,  
 I must do as love commands.

According to the lyricist, when a woman says "no" she does not mean it:

## 12. Think'st Thou, Kate, To put me Down?

The musical score is written for Treble and Bass clefs in a 3/4 time signature with a key signature of one sharp (F#). The lyrics are: "Thinkst thou Kate to put me downe with a No, or with a frowne, Since love holds my hart in bandes, I must do I must do i must do as love com - mands." The score includes a first ending (Tr.) and a second ending (B.) for the Treble clef part.

Womens words have double sence:  
Stand away, a simple fence.

Jones' musical setting expresses the other sense and innuendo, for example on the last line

Till the pricke of conscience sting

by repeating the first phrase and delaying "of conscience sting."  
*A Musicall Dreame or the Fourth Booke* (1609, no. 7):

Jenny as most women use it,  
Who say nay when they would have it,<sup>13</sup>  
With a bolde face seemed to crave it,  
With a faint looke did refuse it...

Jocky knew by her replying,  
That a no is I in wooing,  
That an asking without doing,  
Is the way to loves denying.

Similarly in *The Muses Gardin for Delights or the fift Booke of Ayres* (1610, no. 14), when the woman says "no" as far as the man is concerned that means "yes":

There was a wyly ladde, met with a bonny lasse,  
much pretie sport they had, but I wot not what it was,  
hee woad her for a kisse, She plainely said him no,  
I pray quoth he, nay nay quoth Shee,  
I pray you let mee goe.

The subject of contrary denial in love-making is found in a number of song lyrics, as for example in Campion's:

I care not for these Ladies,  
That must be woode and praide...  
Her when we court and kisse,  
She cries forsooth, let go.

<sup>13</sup> Cf. Tilley 1950: "Maids say nay and take it" (M34); "A woman says nay and means aye" (W660).

But when we come where comfort is,  
She never will say no. (*A Booke of Ayres*, 1601, no. 3).

The musical depiction of verbal meaning and poetic imagery, sometimes referred to as "word or text painting" by modern commentators, is not confined to the madrigal where it is a distinguishing feature (see Carter 2001, and Toft 2014). One example by Robert Jones is particularly worthy of note in this context. It is a dialogue love song, "Sweet Kate of late ranne away" in *A Musicall Dreame or the Fourth Booke of Ayres* (1609). Kate does not trust the amorous intent of the man who would woo her. She doubts he will remain true to her once his hopes have been attained. The lover complains that Kate has deserted him and left him in a tormented state:

Sweete Kate  
of late  
ran away and left me playning.  
Abide  
I cride  
or I die with thy disdainning...  
Te hee hee quoth she,  
Make no foole of me,  
Men I know have oathes at pleasure,  
But their hopes attaind,  
They bewray they faind,  
And their oathes are kept at leasure.

The music represents the impassioned exchange between Kate and would-be lover. One voice pursues the other in agitated response. The structure of the song is neatly divided into four-bar phrases coming to effective cadences every three poetic lines, reflecting the structure and meaning of the poem:

The topic of love is indeed pervasive and varied in English Renaissance song. It embraces subjects as diverse as physical bawdy to ethereal romanticising, from pastoral simpletons to sophisticated courtly situations. A host of fictional characters express their loves, including Amyntas, Aurora, Pastorella, Phoebus, Phyllis, Celia, Cynthia, Sylvia, and paired lovers such as Venus and Adonis,

## 2. Sweet Kate

Voice I  
Sweete Kate Of late Ran a-way and

Voice II  
Sweete Kate Of late Ran a -

Bass

6  
I left me playn ing. A bide!

II way and left me playn - ing. A

B.

11  
I I cride Or I die with thy dis - dayn ing.

II bide! I cride Or I die with thy dis - dayn - ing - s

B.

Corydon and Phillidor, Robin Hood and Marian, Thyrsis and Milla. Cupid hovers over a number of songs, besetting his amorous influence and intent. Separation, parting, weeping and tears, colour many love songs. More explicit manifestations and receptivities such as kisses, caresses, beauty, (starry) eyes are there for the beholder.

## References

- Askew, Melvin W. 1965. "Courtly Love: Neurosis as Institution." *Psychoanalytic Review* 52: 19–29.
- Austern, Linda Phyllis. 1991. "Love, Death and Music in the English Renaissance." *Love and Death in the Renaissance*. Edited by Kenneth R. Bartlett, Konrad Eisenbichler, and Janice Liedl. Ottawa: Dovehouse, 17–36.
- Berringer, R. W. 1943. "Thomas Champion's Share in *A Booke of Ayres*." *Publications of the Modern Language Association of America* 58: 938–48.
- Burton, Robert. 1977. *The Anatomy of Melancholy*. Edited by Holbrook Jackson. New York: Vintage Books, vol. 3.
- Carter, Tim. 2001. "Word Painting," *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd edn. Edited by Stanley Sadie. London: Macmillan. www.oxfordmusiconline.
- Davis, Walter R. ed. 1969. *The Works of Thomas Champion*. London: Faber & Faber.
- Dowling, Margaret. 1932. "The Printing of John Dowland's *Second Book of Ayres*." *The Library* 12, no. 4 (March): 365–80.
- Doughtie, Edward. 1986. *English Renaissance Song*. Boston: Twayne Publishers.
- Doughtie, Edward, ed. 1970. *Lyrics from English Airs 1596–1622*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Dart, Thurston, et al. eds. 1959–61. *English Lute-Songs* (formerly *The English School of Lutenist Song Writers*, ed. E.H. Fellowes). First Series, 17 vols, 1959–; Second Series, 21 vols, 1961.
- Fischlin, Daniel. 1998. *In Small Proportions: A Poetics of the English Ayre 1596–1622*. Detroit, MI: Wayne State University Press, 1998.
- Greer, David. 1967. "Champion the Musician." *Lute Society Journal* 9: 7–16.
- . 1967–68. "The Part-Songs of the English Lutenists." *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association* 94: 97–110.
- . 1979. *Songs from Manuscript Sources*. 2 vols. London: Stainer & Bell.

- . 1990. "Five variations on 'Farewel Dear Loue.'" *The Well Enchanting Skill: Music, Poetry, and Drama in the Culture of the Renaissance*. Edited by John Caldwell, Edward Olleson, and Susan Wollenberg. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 213–29.
- , ed. 2000. *Collected English Lutenist Partsongs*. Musica Britannica vols. 34, 35. London: Stainer & Bell.
- Holman, Peter. 1999. *Dowland: Lachrymae (1604)*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Jorgens, Elise Bickford. 1982. *The Well-Tun'd Word: Musical Interpretations of English Poetry 1597–1651*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Kampen, Claire van. 2017. "Original Practices and Historical Music in the Globe's London and Broadway Productions of *Twelfth Night* and *Richard III*." *Shakespeare, Music and Performance*. Edited by Bill Barclay and David Lindley. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 42–49.
- Karlsson, Katarina A. 2011. "'Think'st thou to seduce me then?' Impersonating songs with female personas by Thomas Champion (1567–1620)." PhD. diss., University of Gothenburg.
- Krummel, D.W. 1975. *English Music Printing 1553–1700*. London: Bibliographical Society.
- Lindley, David. 1986. *Thomas Champion*. Leiden: E.J. Brill.
- Marotti, Arthur F. 1995. *Manuscript, Print, and the English Renaissance Lyric*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Maynard, Winifred. 1986. *Elizabethan Lyric Poetry and its Music*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Pattison, Bruce. 1970. *Music and Poetry of the English Renaissance*. 2nd edn. London: Methuen.
- Poulton, Diana. 1982. *John Dowland*. 2nd edn, London: Faber & Faber.
- . 1983. "Dowland's Darkness." *Early Music* 12 (October): 517–19.
- Price, David C. 1981. *Patrons and Musicians of the English Renaissance*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Raymond, Joad, ed. 2011. *The Oxford History of Popular Print Culture*, vol. 1. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

- Rooley, Anthony. 1983. "New Light on John Dowland's Songs of Darkness." *Early Music* 11 (January): 6–21.
- Steele, Robert. 1903. *The Earliest English Music Printing*. London: Bibliographical Society.
- Sternfeld, F.W. and David Greer, eds. 1967. *English Madrigal Verse*. 3rd edn. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Tilley, Morris P. 1950. *A Dictionary of Proverbs in England in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.
- Toft, Robert. 1993. *Tune Thy Musicke to Thy Hart: The Art of Eloquent Singing in England 1597–1622*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- . 2014. *With Passionate Voice: Re-creative Singing in Sixteenth-Century England and Italy*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Wells, Robin Headlam. 1985. "John Dowland and Elizabethan Melancholy." *Early Music* 13 (November): 514–28.
- . 1994. *Elizabethan Mythologies: Studies in Poetry, Drama and Music*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Wilson, Christopher R. 1983. "Thomas Campion's 'Ayres filled with parts' reconsidered." *The Lute: Journal of the Lute Society* 23 (2): 3–12.
- . 1989. *Words and Notes Coupled Lovingly Together: Thomas Campion, A Critical Study*. New York and London: Garland Publishing.
- . 2001. "Campion" in *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*. 2nd edn. Edited by Stanley Sadie. London: Macmillan. www.oxfordmusiconline.
- . 2017. "Thomas Campion's 'Superfluous Blossomes of His Deeper Studies': The Public Realm of His English Ayres." *Beyond Boundaries: Rethinking Music Circulation in Early Modern England*. Edited by Linda Phyllis Austern, Candace Bailey, and Amanda Eubanks Winkler. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 54–66.

## CHAPTER 5

### The Feminine Territory Offered by Early Modern Music, through the Lens of an Aristocratic Lady

Katarina A. Karlsson



## Introduction

This is one of the most popular portraits in the National Portrait gallery in London. The deep neckline of the dress is spectacular, but the look the woman gives is also something special. However, Frances Howard, who is the central figure of this chapter, might not have chosen the dress herself. Low necklines were the fashion of the days, a portrait of queen Anne from the same period exposes just as much skin. By Frances Howard's expression, one might be fooled into believing that she was a woman who knew how to have a good time, but most of her life was extremely unhappy. In this chapter I am going to examine the feminine territory offered to her, by analyzing the music she encountered at some very dramatic moments in her life.

## A Dramatic Life

Here is the drama of her life in short: At the tender age of thirteen, Frances Howard was married to Lord Essex, who was fourteen at the time. It was an arranged marriage, which was annulled after a few years because the husband was said to be impotent and not capable of consummating the marriage. After that, Frances Howard married the King's favorite, Robert Carr. Not long after, the couple was accused of the murder of Sir Thomas Overbury. Frances pleaded guilty, and Robert not guilty, after which both were sentenced to death. A series of trials led to the execution of several persons, but Robert and Frances were pardoned. They spent six years in the Tower. Frances Howard died at 42 from ovarian cancer.

So what was expected of Frances Howard and what is possible to know and say about it 400 years later? David Lindley, professor of English Renaissance Culture, has investigated the more or less credible facts surrounding her life, and also the novels and plays contemporary to Frances Howard (Lindley 1993). I will do something similar on a smaller scale, by looking at how the Early Modern music prepares the circus ring for the situations in which Frances Howard found herself. The expectations of the

contemporary culture create a kind of public space, a circus ring, as it were. And as clowns and acrobats have their acting space prepared to suit the act they are going to perform, so do men and women. The preparation's aim is not to give each person the space he or she needs, but the scene the audience wishes to see. When we look at how a male subject describes a female object in English lute songs between 1597 and 1622, the expectations can be quite vulgar. In the song "I Care not for these Ladies" the male persona says:

I care not for these ladies that must be wooed and prayd.  
Give me fair Amaryllis, the wanton country maid.  
(Campion in Rosseter 1601, no. 3)

The word *wanton* can have more than one interpretation, and in this case cheeky/horny/mischievous is likely. The song is in triple time, a meter connected to folksiness, dance and uncontrolled emotions. The composer and lyricist Thomas Campion has further placed the word *country* on a long, and then a short note. So the first syllable is held long enough for the audience/singer to discern the word "cunt" before finishing with "-ry." For the rest of the song, the girl Amaryllis's personality is interpreted through that lens. However, if an aristocratic lady behaved the way Campion suggests, the result would be devastating for her. She would lose her status and risk a life as a social outcast; "A woman which has lost her good name is dead while she lives," says a contemporary source (Fraser 2002).

The portrait above is attributed to the studio of William Larkin, and was made the same year Frances Howard was accused of the murder. Next to the portrait at The National Gallery a sign says:

A famous beauty, Frances Howard was divorced from Robert Devereux, 3rd Earl of Essex in 1613 and married Robert Carr, Earl of Somerset, a favourite of James I. In 1615 she and her second husband, along with several accomplices, were convicted of poisoning Sir Thomas Overbury, who had opposed their marriage. Although the couple were imprisoned until 1621, they were later pardoned of their crime. History, and their contemporaries, judged Frances more harshly than her husband. It was said of Somerset: 'If he had not met with such a woman he might have been a good man.' (National Portrait Gallery n.d.)

The information "History judged Frances more harshly than her husband," has been added since the first time I saw the portrait in the late 1980s. But, exactly how and why she was condemned more than her husband is left to the imagination of the reader.

Those who have written about her have often showed contempt of women, intentionally or not. Their main concerns have been to protect the governing power structures of the time. A writing by George Abbot, the Archbishop of Canterbury, circulated already in October 1613. It was not turned into a book until much later (Abbott 1715). It is a narration of the annulment of Frances Howard's first marriage, in which the Archbishop himself played a role albeit with great reluctance. Abbot describes Frances Howard as lewd and evil, and mentions incidentally that womankind is more receptive to witchcraft than men. Another early author was Richard Niccols, who published a long poem where Overbury and the spirits of the executed people appear before the author (1616). Niccols puts the blame on the Somerset couple, Frances and Robert. Francis Bacon, known more now as a philosopher, presided as judge at some of the trials in 1614 and 15. He published a collection of texts from the trials, and the speeches held by the King and the Archbishop. Bacon is the only one who relates the events with any sympathy towards Frances (Bacon 1651). Whether these were his true feelings is doubtful, the purpose was not to show pity, but to defend James I's pardon. The historian, poet, and playwright Arthur Wilson was employed by Frances's first husband and "an intimate bosom friend" to her second. Nobody has described Frances Howard with more misogyny. Much of the content seems to be gossip: that Frances was cunning already as a teenager, that she had sought to win the love of the late crown prince Henry by love potions from a quack, and that she had an intimate relationship with Robert Carr before they were married, while still married to her first husband. Since Wilson's book was published in 1653, six years after the beheading of Charles I, in the reign of Oliver Cromwell, Wilson's agenda was to show the downside of the monarchy, says the historian Sara Luttfring, expert in Early Modern literature (Luttfring 2011). Current scholarship puts

the responsibility on those who had the power to set up the murder, Thomas Howard, Frances' father, and his uncle. At the time of the trials the uncle was deceased, and Thomas Howard was never summoned to the trials, which stretched out over almost a year.

In the middle of the twentieth century the story was revived by William McElwee, an author of several popular English history books (see McElwee 1952). McElwee took Wilson's early lampoon seriously. For instance he claimed that Frances Howard enjoyed the joys of the court from the tender age of thirteen while her first husband was doing his grand tour, something Lindley refutes.

My own first encounter with the story was in 1989 when I spent some months in London to study Lute Songs. The Lute player the late sir Robert Spencer tipped me about McElwee's book, and it took such strong hold of me that it still lasts. I went to the British Library for more information on Frances Howard. The *Dictionary of National Biography* was in, those days, not a good source for finding information on women. I had to look up her husband and father to find something about her, and even then the information was brief: "Frances Howard, murderess." But along the library walls ran shelf after shelf of the Venetian ambassador's letters. Their voices appeared from the past in a never-ending stream of gossip, such as the claim that Frances Howard had given her first husband an impotency potion, which made him lose his hair and fingernails, but not the ability to perform his marital duties. Something no other source confirmed, as it turned out.

The two award-winning researchers and authors Beatrice White and Anne Somerset have written one voluminous book each on this case (White 1998). The scholar John Higgins has looked at the relation between the Somerset couple and their servants, who were actually executed (Higgins 2015). The court case resembles the content of the play *The Changeling* by Thomas Middleton, as Sara Luttfriing has acknowledged (2011). Middleton was contemporary to Frances Howard and author to one of the masques that were performed at her second wedding. In *The Changeling*, a virginity test, such as the one performed on Frances Howard is described, something Sara Luttfriing has pointed out.

## The First Marriage

Today we look at love as a source of understanding, respect, and affection. We want to have our sexual as well as our intellectual and emotional needs fulfilled. Early Modern expectations were quite different. In an Early Modern anthology where English poets are presented by subject, love is described as a natural force which makes people unhappy. Even if Shakespeare's sonnets contain some of the most beautiful texts ever written about love (they were not in print 1600), the chosen quotes of the anthology are almost exclusively a recount or the miseries of love. As the poet Edmund Spencer puts it:

[Love] is but a continuous war, O miserable men, that to him subjects are.  
(Albott 1600, pp 170-192)

Still, love is described as something impossible to resist. However, many early modern marriages were not built upon such flimsy foundations as love, but were arranged by the parents. To marry off children below the age of fifteen was not as common in the seventeenth century as it had been earlier, says the historian Lawrence Stone, who has looked at the demography of Early Modern England (Stone 1977). According to Stone, the most common age to marry was between twenty five and thirty. But there were obviously exceptions. Thomas Howard, Frances's father, who was Lord Treasurer in 1615 and later sentenced together with his wife for large-scale embezzlement, was married off when he was only eleven years old. He followed the same pattern with his own children. As a parent he wanted to get the most out of his offspring by tying alliances to influential families. Thus his thirteen-year-old daughter, Frances, was married off to fourteen-year-old Robert Devereux, Lord Essex. They were not supposed to spend the wedding-night together, the dangers of early pregnancy were known (Lindley 1993, 22–23). Instead Lord Essex was sent on an educational trip for years while Frances was forced to stay at home.

At aristocratic weddings it was common to arrange masques. Masques were very expensive and prolonged spectacles with dance,

declamation, singing, and instrumental music, plus a very popular feature: an interaction with the audience. Scenography and costumes were extremely lavish. At Frances Howard's first wedding two masques were staged. One of them by Ben Jonson, the most sought after author at such occasions, and a famous playwright still today with plays such as "The Fox" and "Volpone."

The King at the time, James I, was Elizabeth I's successor. He was the former King of Scotland and upon his ascension to the throne in 1604, England and Scotland were united for the first time in history. Jacobean masques emphasized that James I was superior to his predecessor. Since Elizabeth I never married, the King's marriage was portrayed as a model with himself as the emblematic husband of the entire English nation, despite the fact that he and Queen Anne lived parallel lives and spent little time together. James would rather spend his time on Bible studies, and initiated a translation of the bible into English. An other time-consuming habit of James I was the company of young, beautiful men, which would have consequences for our main character, Frances Howard.

In Ben Jonson's masque "Hymenai," written for Frances Howard's wedding, marriage is described time and again as a sacrifice on the bride's behalf. Sex is portrayed as something to be ashamed or afraid of:

The blushing Veile shows shamefastness, th'ingenious Virgin should possess  
At meeting with the man (Jonson 1606, 9).

In the spoken parts, Jonson stresses that the bride should not avoid housework. The sung text is preserved, but unfortunately not the music. There is still reason to look at the texts set to music separately, since the sung message differs from the spoken one. The image of marriage's more intimate parts is brighter:

These, these are they, whom Humour and Affection must obey; Who come to deck the genial Bower, and bring with them the grateful Hour, That crownes such Meetings, and excites the married Pair to such Delights: As Courtings, Kissings, Coyings, Oaths & Vowes, Soft Whisperings, Embracements, all the Joys, and melting Toys That Chaster Love allows." (Jonson 1606, 15)

As in other contemporary song lyrics, sensuality is portrayed differently in text set to music, than in spoken text. Of the 699 songs I have read printed between 1597 and 1622, the message is, strikingly, often erotic. Music was strongly connected to dance, body, and sensuality, and to resist these emotions was considered very difficult, as the historian Linda Phyllis Austern has pointed out (Austern 1993).

When music was performed at the intervals in theatre, the historian Andrew Gurr describes acts of theft, battering, rape, and even murder. The authority's reaction to that was not to forbid the criminal acts, but to forbid the music, says Andrew Gurr (Austern 1993). So even though the music for Jonson's masque is lost, we can assume that the song's function was to be an appetizer for the wedding-night, although that night would lie years ahead.

During the Victorian era, England became sexually hostile. Masturbation and same-sex desire were branded as sicknesses and women's sexual needs were denied. As the urologist William Acton put it:

The majority of women (happily for them) are not very much troubled by sexual feelings of any kind. (Laqueur 1990, p. 190. fn 101)

During the seventeenth century, there was a conflict between the growing Puritanism (which condemned women's lust), and the court (where parties, alcohol, and debauchery was common). Still, nobody would come up with the idea that women had no sexual feelings at all. A thirteen-year-old girl, however, was not expected to have any sexuality – it had to be aroused by a man in order to exist (Lindley 1993, 22). After that women's sexual appetite was considered greater and more difficult to tame than men's:

Though they be weaker vessels, yet they will overcome 2, 3 or 4 men in satisfying of their carnal appetites. (Fraser 2002, p 5, fn 13)

To sum up, we can see that the expectations imposed on Frances Howard at her first wedding were that she would be shy, somewhat afraid, but appreciate love and marriage in time. That is certainly not what happened.

## The Second Wedding

In 1613, Frances Howard was married for the second time, but to get to that point was not easy. When her first husband, Lord Essex came home from his educational trip, the couple did not fall into each others' arms. In fact, Robert did not seem to like women at all. According to Bacon, Frances did everything for them to have their marriage consummated, but Robert could not (Bacon 1651, 2–3). Meanwhile, the King had befriended a handsome young red-head, Robert Carr. The Scottish aristocrat had become the King's closest friend, and had received the biggest shower of gifts, titles, castles, and land seen in the history of England. Robert Carr thus became a much better catch than Lord Essex, since he was closer to the King. So close that some modern historians describe the King-Carr relation as a love affair. The King himself would probably claim that their relation was noble: a male friendship. But contemporary eye-witnesses described kissing which they found unfitting for a king, and there were rumors (although it would have been high-treason to say so) of same-sex practice (Somerset 1998, 59–66). The word homosexuality is not applicable to the Early Modern society, since it assumes that one sees one's sexual orientation as a part of one's identity.

Because of Carr's proximity to the King, the Howard family were supporting Frances Howard's friendship to Carr. As Lindley puts it, Frances Howard was "the female glue to join two politically important men" (Lindley 1993, 85). Robert Carr had a friend: Sir Thomas Overbury. He was the brains behind Carr's advancement at the court. When Carr eventually reached the highest post of the court, that of chancellor, he did nothing without asking Overbury's advice. But Overbury did not like Frances, he opposed the marriage. At some point someone, possibly from the Howard clan, determined he must be made away with. This plan reached as high as the King, who offered Overbury an embassy office abroad, which Overbury declined on Carr's advice. This was the incitement to accuse Overbury of high treason and put him in the Tower. Both the lieutenant of the Tower and the

jail keeper were exchanged, whereupon several presents reached Overbury in jail; broth, plaster, marmalade, jellies and medicine. Overbury died. His body was buried immediately, and his family was not allowed to see the corpse. Whether or not the "presents" actually killed Overbury is impossible to say, since we will never know if they were really poisoned or even if he ate them. Some were confiscated by the jail keeper, but the stomach-medicine that Carr sent seems to have made Overbury really ill (Lindley 1993, 170). One theory is that Overbury died of untreated diabetes, another is that he got gangrene from the medical treatment. The doctors of the time built their treatment on the balance of the four humors of blood, phlegm, black and yellow bile, which will be too long a digression for this chapter. Let me just say that a plaster was not a little patch to put on your finger, but a big piece of fabric prepared with substances. It was put over Overbury's back, which was already full of sores that the doctors had inflicted in order to draw yellow bile - it seems to be the last medical care he got (Somerset 1998, 239–240).

To live married but separated, like the King and Queen, was the usual solution for a couple that did not get along (Stone 1997). To get a divorce was principally impossible, Frances's influential father and father's uncle worked diligently to achieve it. They managed to get the first marriage annulled with the motivation that it was never consummated on the grounds of the husband's impotency. Frances's virginity was examined by twelve wet nurses, while Lord Essex did not have to endure any examination. To preserve his manly honor, he was said to be impotent only towards Frances and not other women. Still, some of the officials who took the decision were hesitant. The Archbishop of Canterbury dissented, as mentioned above. But the King himself intervened, and thereby the last obstacle was removed.

It is important to try to see in what order things happened, says Lindley. It is improbable that the relationship between Frances Howard and Robert Carr was intimate before the divorce. Some, as Arthur Wilson, have insinuated that Frances was no virgin despite the wet nurses's examination. The so-called nurses might

have been relatives of the Howards. There were also rumors that Frances never showed up at the examination but sent a stand-in so heavily veiled that her identity was not discerned. Today we might think that the whole virginity-business was exaggerated, as virginity is impossible to state according to modern medicine and the examination thereby completely pointless. But in the Early Modern period virginity was crucial for a woman's value on the marriage market, since it was the guarantee that the man's heirs would really be his. Furthermore, since sexual activity was associated with general immorality, the question of Frances' virginity was extremely important to her contemporaries. The doubtfulness of such an examination was however big even 400 years ago. Women were considered to be the only ones able to perform such an act. Thereby virginity became a narrative where women were able to, at least partly, take the power, says Luttfriing. This was, of course, very unsettling to the men. The suspicion that the act could be manipulated was intimidating and might be the reason why this part of the Frances Howard story has drawn so much attention. Something else to challenge the patriarchal authority is the question of Lord Essex's impotency, says Luttfriing (2011).

There were masques also at the second wedding, four of them this time. The only one which is preserved as it was, is by Thomas Campion and has become classical in every description of Frances Howard for hundreds of years. In the spoken text, the following words occur: "Set is that Tree in ill hour, That yields neither fruit nor flower" (Campion 1614, xiv). The metaphor refers to Frances' first marriage, and the fact that no children were conceived because of the husband's impotency. The metaphor is completed in the song "Bring Away this Sacred Tree", where one of the actors approached queen Anne with a golden tree from which she broke a branch, a reminder of how the King intervened at the annulment of Frances' first marriage. The Music to this song is as far from the bumping "I care not for this Ladies" mentioned above, as possible. "Bring Away this Sacred Tree" is serene and peaceful, almost as to make the time stop. Masques often made parallels between the royal dynasty and antique gods to make the monarchy appear as

sent from above, and thereby impossible to challenge, says David Lindley. This is one of those songs where the music has the character of a message from heaven.

How were then the expectations on Frances described at the second wedding? In Campion's masque the shyness on the bride's behalf is gone. The marriage is not pictured as a war and sexuality is not a shame. Instead the emphasis is on mutual love. Frances Howard was twenty years old, her husband was twenty six – it is likely, says David Lindley, that they were in love. In Campion's masque the following lines were recited:

Some friendship between man and man prefer, But I th'affection between  
man and wife. What good can be in life, where of no fruits appear? (Campion 1614, xiii)

The masque glorifies the King and his decision to interfere in favor of the annulment of Frances's first marriage. But to speak about male friendship in such a manner, when many people knew it was the King's highest pleasure, seems careless. At this time same-sex practice was called sodomy and punishable by death. However, it is probably no coincidence that no such punishment were executed during the reign of James I (Bray 1982). Maybe the King was aware of the rumors concerning his relationships to young men? Is it relevant that Thomas Campion never got a commission from the court to make an other masque?

Ben Jonson, who wrote masques for the first wedding, contributed two also for the second one. One of them, *The Irish Masque* (Jonson 1606), is a satire over Campion's masque. The fourth masque, by Thomas Middleton, is lost. Jonson re-wrote his works after the scandal. The only one to remain in its original state, as mentioned before, is Thomas Campion's who encourages Frances Howard to enjoy her new marriage and her love for her husband. But also this time, history took an other turn.

## In Prison

The Tower is one of the world's most popular tourist attractions. In order to get a glimpse of the torture chambers one has to line up with people from all over the world. But it is no longer London's biggest building as it was in the seventeenth century. Then it was a jigsaw puzzle of buildings: a castle, towers, courtyards, walls, a zoo, a the Royal Mint, and jails. It housed the workers of the Tower: cooks, washer-women, blacksmiths, prison guards, and more. The Tower was surrounded by a moat, and functioned as a prison for the aristocracy. The only way to reach it was by the River Thames.

On December 9, 1615, Frances Howard had just given birth to a baby girl. Therefore, she was not placed in the Tower together with her husband during their detention. Robert Carr had been stripped of his chancellor office. On April 4th there was no time for Frances to say goodbye to her little daughter. She was brought to the Tower hastily by boat, the same way Sir Thomas Overbury had been three years previously. But while Overbury was kept alone in a cold stone chamber, the Howard-Carr couple had a tower with two small furnished rooms. Anyone who visits the Tower today can still see the dwellings as they used to be. On May 24th of the same year, it was Frances's turn to appear in court and she behaved like a woman of her rank was supposed to (Lindley 1993, 184). She was dressed in a strict, black dress, she spoke softly, wept occasionally and took all the blame. Obedience, passivity, and quietness were the most appreciated traits in a woman. The trial was well-attended, tickets had even been sold on the black market. Lord Essex, Frances Howard's first husband, was also in the crowd (Somerset 1998, 389). The court gave a great deal of attention to the question of Frances Howard's moral conduct. The annulment of the first marriage was brought up, although the case concerned the murder of Sir Thomas Overbury. The question whether Frances Howard really was a virgin or not at the "virgin test" she endured to get her divorce was also put on the table. Spectacular evidence of her bad morals were shown to the court,

such as letters written to her friend Mrs. Turner and a figurine depicting a fornicating couple, which Frances Howard was said to have used in witchcraft.

A court case in those days had no defense attorneys, but there was more than one judge and they were the ones to produce the proofs. The accused had but to defend themselves as well as they could. The best defense for Frances Howard was to refrain from it, while the judges strategy seemed to be making her the front figure in order to draw attention from everything else, that is: the King's interference and the father's and the other relatives' actions.

The question of whether Frances Howard actually was guilty is still not answered, and has been debated ever since the seventeenth century. When I visited David Lindley in Leeds in 2013 he shared that the intrigue that preceded the internment of Overbury, and the change of the staff at the Tower does not necessarily mean that a murder was planned. Frances might very well have had Overbury killed on her own. My guess is that the couple were guilty together, but the fact that Frances had recently given birth (with all the emotional turmoil that goes with that) might have meant that she could not resist the pressure. Also, Robert Carr was pressed to confess, but he seems to have been blinded by his previous career, and was not loyal to his wife. Robert pleaded not guilty. It is, nevertheless, clear beyond doubt that it was the actions of the Howard family, as well as the King himself, who made the murder possible.

There is, of course, a song about what it feels like to be in prison, and it is connected to the same court case. Once again, Thomas Campion turns up. His patron, Thomas Mounson, was also imprisoned at the Tower for a while. He was the one who provided money for the previous lieutenant of the Tower to abandon his lucrative post for a more Howard-minded lieutenant. The middle man, the one to deliver the money, was no one else than Thomas Campion himself. That is why he was called to court and stated that he "knoweth not was the money was for" (Public Records Office 1989). By doing so he followed the pattern of the other servants, who claimed they were not informed, and thereby put the blame on those above themselves in the hierarchy. Thomas Moun-

son was taken ill by the imprisonment, probably both in body and mind. When he was released, Campion dedicated his third Song-book to him, with a long, affectionate preface. The song collection is one of the most extraordinary in the lute song era 1597–1622, by being tailor made for the events and emotions Mounson had experienced while at the Tower. The song “So Tyr’d are all My Thoughts” looks like a a clinical definition of depression:

So tyr’d are all my thoughts, that sense and spirits fail;  
Mourning I pine, and know not what I ayle.  
O what can yield ease to a mind,  
ioy in nothing that can finde. (Campion 1617, no. 5)

In the second and third verses we learn that the pain is not the pain of love, and not the pain of a soldier. The sorrow comes from idleness, from not having any stimuli, like a life in prison would produce.

The music is in minor and quotes one of the most famous songs at the time, *Lacrimae* by John Dowland (1600). The words in Dowland’s version are “Flow my tears.” The four-note phrase is one of the most quoted in music history. It has become a powerful symbol of tears and mourning, and *Lacrimae* is still one of the most performed songs from this period. Even John Dowland must have thought it successful since he wrote several instrumental versions of it.

The most common quotation is the first four notes, but Campion also copied the following three. The quote comes in the sixth bar on the line “Mourning I pine and know not.”

Dowland’s music is in a minor and Campion’s in d minor, but the quotes are an exact copy of Dowland:



Since Campion always wrote both music and lyrics, he tailor made the music to the words and the emotions he wanted to arouse. The poem is generally sad, but through the Dowland quotation some passages are accentuated: “Hence cruel hate” in verse 2; “Proud of a wound” in verse 3; and “that no delight” in verse 4.

There was no song book to commemorate Frances Howard’s time in prison, no matter how gloomy it might have been. The guides of the Tower says she had a miscarriage and that the couple became enemies while in jail.

Frances’s death appears in the book by Arthur Wilson, mentioned earlier. His description of it is ghastly, not only because of the content but because of the spectator’s sadistic gaze:

For that part of her Body that had been the receptacle of most of her sin, grown rotten (though she never had but one Child) the ligaments failing, it fell down, and was cut away in flakes, with a most nauseous and putrid savour; which to augment, she would roul herself in her own ordure in her bed, took delight in it. Thus her affections varied; For nothing could be found sweet enough to augment her Beauties at first, and nothing stinking enough to decipher her loathsomeness at last. (Wilson 1653)

### What Was the Feminine Territory Frances Howard Was Allowed to Perform In?

In this chapter I have shown how Early Modern music defined the feminine territory for an aristocratic lady. Had she fulfilled the ideal of Thomas Campion’s *I care not for these Ladies*, she would not have been able to marry at all, and would have lived her life as a social outcast. In the masques produced at her first wedding, she was supposed to be shy, obedient, passive, chaste, and possibly a little bit afraid. At her second wedding, she was expected to be happy and in love. After the trials and the time in the Tower, no music we know of was dedicated to her – she was perhaps already “A woman which had lost her good name is dead while she lived.” But even if she might have been socially isolated, she was highly present through the books and plays where her fate was repeated

and scorned publicly. And even today, she is alive at the National Portrait Gallery where her exposed bosom attracts the eyes of spectators. Sexy enough to make history forget about the corrupt and criminal men who avoided the blame by putting her in the center of a court scandal, and set into a circus ring where any circus act would have been impossible without losing her reputation.

## References

- Abbott, George. 1715. *The Case of Impotency As Debated in England, in that remarkable tryal an.* 1613. London: E. Curll.
- Albott, Robert, ed. 1600. *Englands Parnassus*. London: N. L[ing,] C. B[urby] and T. H[ayes].
- Austern, Linda Phyllis. 1993. " 'Alluring the auditorie to effiminate' Music and the English Renaissance Idea of the Feminine." *Music and Letters* 74 (3): 343–354.
- Bacon, Francis. 1651. *A true and historical relation of the poisoning of Sir Thomas Overbury*. London: John Benson and John Playford.
- Bray, Alan. 1982. *Homosexuality in Renaissance England*. London: Gay Men's Press.
- Campion, Thomas. 1614. *The Description of a Maske. Presented in the Banqueting roome at Whitehall, on Saint Stephens night last at the mariage of the Right Honourable the Earle of Somerset: and the right noble the Lady Frances Howard. Written by Thomas Campion. Whereunto are annexed diuers choise ayres composed for this maske that may be sung with a single voyce to the lute or base-viall*. London: Imprinted by E. A[lld and Thomas Snodham].
- Dowland, John. 1600. *The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres*. London: Thomas Este.
- Gurr, Andrew. 1987. *Playgoing in Shakespeare's London*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Fraser, Antonia. 2002. *The Weaker Vessel: Woman's Lot in Seventeenth-Century England*. London: Phoenix.
- Higgins, John. 2015. " 'Servant obedience changed to master sin': Performance and the Public Transcript of Service in the Overbury Affair and The Changeling." *Journal of Early Modern Studies* 4: 231–258.
- Jonson, Ben. 1606. *Hymenai. Or The Solemnities of Masque, and Barriers*. London: Thomas Thorp.
- Laqueur, Thomas. 1990. *Making Sex, Body and Gender from the Greeks to Freud*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

- Lindley, David. 1993. *The Trials of Frances Howard*. London: Routledge.
- Luttfring, Sara D. 2011. "Bodily Narratives and the Politics of Virginity in The 'Changeling' and the Essex Divorce." *Renaissance Drama*. 39: 97–128 .
- McElwee, William. 1952. *The Murder of Sir Thomas Overbury*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- National Portrait Gallery. n.d. "Frances: Countess of Somerset." Accessed May 10, 2018. <http://www.npg.org.uk/collections/search/person/mp04187/frances-countess-of-somerset>
- Niccols, Richard. 1616. *Sir Thomas Ouervuries vision With the ghoasts of Weston, Mrs. Turner, the late Lieftenant of the Tower, and Franklin*. London: R. M[eighen] & T. I[ones].
- Public Records Office. *Handwritten notes from the trial of the murder of sir Thomas Overbury, kept in Public Records Office*. Accessed 1989.
- Rosseter, Philip. 1601. *A booke of ayres, set foorth to be song to the lute, orpherian, and base violl*. London: Peter Short.
- Somerset, Anne. 1998. *Unnatural Murder, Poison at the Court of James I*. London: Orion.
- Stone, Laurence. 1997. *The Family, Sex and Marriage in England 1500–1800*. London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson.
- White, Beatrice. 1965. *Cast of Ravens: The Strange Case of Sir Thomas Overbury*. London: John Murray Publishers Ltd.
- Wilson, Arthur. 1653. *The History of Great Britain, being the Life and Reign of King James*. London: Richard Lownds.

## Appendix 1

### Songs Published between 1597 and 1622

(Madrigals and church music are not included, although sacred songs are)

Anon	9	Love songs: 8
Attey	14	Love songs: 9
Bachelor	1	Love songs: 1
Bartlet, John	17	Love songs: 13–14
Byrd, William	99	Love songs: 19
Campion, Thomas	119	Love songs: 61 (12 or 14 <sup>1</sup> with female personas)
Cavendish, Michael	28	Love songs: 24
Coprario, John	17	Love songs: 5
Corkine, William	30	Love songs: 19
Danyel, John	19	Love songs: 10
Dowland, John	94	Love songs: 57
Ferrabosco, Alfonso	25	Love songs: 21, (1 with a female persona with lyrics by Campion)

1 There is some uncertainty about how many songs have female personas. I count twelve based on a method that only includes songs that have a clear sign in the lyrics: either a) direct references to gender such as "we maids," or b) an indication that the persona has something only a woman can have, such as a husband, or her virginity. Ralph Berringer counts fourteen because he has labeled two songs ("Never love unless you can," and "Silly boy") as having female personas, even though they do not include either of my criteria. "Think'st thou to seduce me then" has no explicit gender-markers but I, as well as Berringer and Reitenbach still think it might have a female persona. My decision is based on the use of metaphors from a maternal life: babies, nurses, and weaning. See Karlsson 2012, 58–60.

Ford, Thomas	10	Love songs: 9
Greaves, Thomas	14	Love songs: 8
Hales, Robert	1	Love songs: 1
Hilton, John	1	Love songs: 1
Holborne	1	Love songs: 1
Hume	5	Love songs: 2
Jones	113	Love songs: 98 (1 with a female persona)
Martin	1	Love songs: 1
Mason	11	Love songs: 2
Maynard	12	Love songs: 5 (3 with female personas)
Morley	17	Love songs: 12
Pilkington	21	Love songs: 16
Robinson	2	Love songs: 1
Rosseter	21	Love songs: 14
Tessier	1	Love songs: 1
Total:	702	Total love songs: 420 (16–18 with female personas, 402 or 404 with male personas)

#### Songs from Masques

Beaumont	5	Love songs: 0
Brathwaite	2	Love songs: 1
Campion	6 (possibly among above)	Love songs: 3 Love songs: 3
Chapman	4	
Daniel	1	Love songs: 0
Jonson	27	Love songs: 11
Middleton	6	Love songs: 0
Total:	56	Total: 56

#### Songs from Theatre Plays

Jonson	16	Love songs: 6
Wroth	34	Love songs: 31, sum 50

Total number of songs published between 1697 and 1622 found by surveying Early English Books Online: 808

Eight songs were published twice, forty-five (mostly by William Byrd) are only mentioned by title with no lyrics or music available on EEBO.

Total songs read by Katarina A Karlsson: 755

## References

- Berringer, Ralph W. 1943. "Thomas Campion's Share in A Booke of Ayres." *PMLA* 58 (4): 938–948.
- Karlsson, Katarina A. 2012. "Think'st thou to seduce me then? Impersonating songs with female personas by Thomas Campion (1567–1620)." PhD. diss., University of Gothenburg.
- Reitenbach, Gail. 1990. "Maids are simple some men say." *The Renaissance Englishwoman in Print*. Amherst: The University of Massachusetts Press.

## Appendix 2

### Linguistic Laboratory

Five lute songs were chosen: "If my complaints could passion move," "Now O now I needs must part," and "Shall I sue" by John Dowland (1597, nos. 4 and 6, and 1600, no. 19) and "Sweet Kate," and "Think'st thou Kate to put me down" by Robert Jones (1609, no. 2, and 1605, no. 12).

The spelling is modernized, because the seventeenth-century spelling was not standardized and would make the counting of the words difficult. The punctuation has been changed in "Sweet Kate," and quotation marks added for the reader to be able to see when the male and female personas take turns in singing. The capitalization is original except in "Sweet Kate," where capital letters are added after punctuation. The songs are not representative for the whole genre,<sup>1</sup> but chosen because they had male personas (except "Sweet Kate" where the author has put a man and a woman in dialogue) and meet three to five of the rules:

1. create not take "no" for an answer
2. create a matrix of love and hate, where fear, friendliness, or indifference are impossible options
3. alternate pleading with accusation
4. threaten to take your own life and blame her for it
5. threaten to, or actually use, violence

In the five songs, the male persona expresses the following: complaints and passions, and (deep) sighs. He gets to mention despair four times, hearts five times (whereof one is bleeding, one is dying,

<sup>1</sup> For an overview of the whole genre, see appendix 1. For the titles of all songs that neglect sexual consent or encourage sexual violence, see chapter 1.

one is silly), love (twice), hope, faith, fall, affection, harm, oaths, joy (twice), absence, (a wounded one) eyes, sighs, moans, disgrace, grief, and despair.

The female object is described as having: grief, wounds, unkindness, plenty, power (twice), worth, delight, words (twice), flouts, a “no”, frown, (no) fear, oaths, and eyes.

The male persona is: condemned, true (twice), rough, gone (twice), a silly wretch (talking to himself), base, and just.

The female object is: rich, unkind, worthy, cruel, just, and fair.

The male persona: suffers, lives (three times), dies (fourteen times), hopes (in vain), complains (twice), wants, despairs, desires, does, becomes (more rough), tries, and loves (three times). In the female’s words in Sweet Kate, he betrays, feigns, has, parts (three times), mourns, needs (must part), needs (must love), leaves, lies, joys, does (not return), sues, seeks, prays, proves, strives, thinks, forsakes, yelles, and perishes.

The female object does (not pity), speaks, hopes, can, repairs, condemns, runs, leaves, disdains, sees, cuts, doubts, cries, swears, lies, commands, holds, quoths (three times), scants, offends (three times), (never) mourns, joys, and respects (with “no moan”).

In these five songs the male persona talks about dying fourteen times, and mentions his heart three times.

The most common thing the female object possesses (in the man’s narrative) is power and words, the most common thing she does is talks and (in synonyms) disdains.

Result: The word “die” is connected to the male fourteen times, while no word in particular is repeated many times in connection to the female, but rather a variety of nouns, adjectives, and verbs.

### If My Complaints Could Passions Move

If my complaints could passions move  
or make Love see wherein I suffer wrong:  
my passions were enough to prove  
what my despairs had govern’d me too long,  
O Love, I live and die in thee  
thy grief in my deep sighs still speaks,  
thy wounds do freshly bleed in me  
my heart for thy unkindness breaks,  
yet thou dost hope when I despair,  
and when I hope, thou mak’st me hope in vain,  
thou say’st thou canst my harms repair,  
yet for redress, thou let’st me still complain.

Can Love be rich, and yet I want?  
Is Love my judge, and yet am I condemn’d?  
Thou plenty hast, yet me dost scant,  
Thou made a God, and yet thy power contemn’d.  
That I do live, it is thy power,  
That I desire it is thy worth,  
If love doth make men’s lives too sour  
Let me not love, nor live henceforth:  
Die shall my hopes, but not my faith,  
That you that of my fall may hearers be  
May here despair, which truly saith,  
I was more true to Love, than Love to me

John Dowland

Now, O Now, I Needs Must Part

Now, O now, I needs must part,  
parting though I absent mourn,  
absence can no joy impart,  
joy once fled cannot return.  
While I live I needs must love,  
love lives not when hope is gone,  
now at last despair doth prove,  
love divided loveth none:

Sad despair doth drive me hence,  
this despair unkindness sends,  
If that parting be offence,  
it is she which then offends.

Dear, when I from thee am gone,  
Gone are all my joys at once,  
I loved thee and thee alone  
In whose love I joyed once:  
And although your sight I leave,  
Sight wherein my joys do lie,  
Till that death do sense bereave,  
Never shall affection die.

Sad despair doth drive me hence, etc.

Dear, if I do not return,  
Love and I shall die together,  
For my absence never mourn  
Whom you might have joyed ever:  
Part we must though now I die,  
Die I do to part with you,  
Him despair doth cause to lie,  
Who both lived and dieth true.

Sad despair doth drive me hence, etc.

John Dowland

Shall I Sue, Shall I Seek for Grace

Shall I sue, shall I seek for grace?  
Shall I pray shall I prove?  
Shall I strive to a heav'nly joy,  
with an earthly love?  
Shall I think that a bleeding heart  
or a wounded eye,  
Or a sigh can ascend the clouds,  
To attain so high?

Silly wretch, forsake these dreams  
of a vain desire,  
O bethink what high regard  
holy hopes do require.  
Favour is as fair as things are,  
treasure is not bought,  
Favour is not won with words,  
nor the wish of a thought.

Pity is but a poor defence  
for a dying heart,  
Ladies eyes respect no moan  
in a mean desert.  
She is too worthy far  
for a worth so base.  
Cruel and but just is she  
in my just disgrace.

Justice gives each man his own,  
though my love be just,  
Yet will not she pity my grief,  
therefore die I must.  
Silly heart then yield to die  
perish in despair,  
Witness yet how fain I die,  
when I die for the fair.

John Dowland

Sweet Kate

Sweet Kate of late  
ran away and left me plaining.  
“Abide!” I cried,  
“or I die with thy disdain.”  
“Tehehe” quoth she,  
“Gladly would I see  
any man to die with loving.  
Never any yet  
died of such a fit:  
Neither have I fear of proving.”

Unkind, I find,  
thy delight is in tormenting,  
“Abide” I cried,  
“Or I die with thy consenting.”  
“Tehehe” quoth she,  
“Make no fool of me,  
Men I know have oaths of pleasure,  
But their hopes attain’d,  
they bewray they feign’d,  
And their hopes are kept at leisure.”

Her words, Like swords,  
Cut my sorry heart in sunder  
Her flouts With doubts  
Kept my heart affections under.  
“Tehehe” quoth she,  
“What a fool is he,  
Stands in awe of once denying”  
Cause I had enough,  
To become more rough,  
So I did, O happy trying!

“a gentleman”

Think'st Thou Kate to Put Me Down

Think'st thou Kate to put me down  
with a no, or with a frown,  
since love holds my heart in bands,  
I must do as love commands.

Love commands the hands to dare,  
When the tongue of speech is spare:  
Chiefest lesson in love's school  
put it in adventure fool.

Fools are they that fainting flinch  
for a squeak, a scratch, a pinch,  
Women's words have double sense:  
stand away, a simple fence.

If thy Mistress swears she'll cry,  
Fear her not, she'll swear and lie,  
Such sweet oaths no sorrow bring  
Till the prick of conscience sting.

“a gentleman”

## References

- Dowland, John. 1597. *The First Booke of Songes or Ayres*. London: Peter Short.
- . 1600. *The Second Booke of Songs or Ayres*. London: Thomas Este.
- Jones, Robert. 1605. *Vltimum Vale*. London: Iohn Windet.
- . 1609. *A musicall Dreame or the fourth booke of Ayres*. London: J. Windlet.

## Appendix 3

### Description of the Transcription

“Think’st thou Kate to put me down” was the twelfth song in Robert Jones’s song collection *Vltimum vale* (1605). It has not been reproduced since, as far as I know. I have transcribed the song from the original tablature and edited it for voice and keyboard instrument. The spelling is modernized: “love” is not spelled “loue,” “chiefest” is not spelled “chiefeft,” “commands” is not spelled “commaundes,” and “she’ll” is not spelled “fheele.” The capitalization is the original, which preserves inconsistencies between the first and the following verses. In the original, the first verse was in the score and the rest of the verses were printed beneath the score. I have put all verses in the score. The original meter is marked as ‘3’ in the beginning. I have changed it to  $\frac{3}{8}$  which means that the bar lines are the same but the length of the notes is halved.

## References

Jones, Robert. 1605. *Vltimum Vale*. London: Iohn Windet.

