GÖTEBORGS UNIVERSITET

TCG NORDICA AND ARTSNORDICA

A study of in what way artistic meetings can increase dialogue and understanding between people with different cultural backgrounds.

Emanuelle Brandström

Abstract

Examensarbete inom lärarutbildningen

Titel: TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica – A study of in what way artistic meetings can increase dialogue and understanding between people with different cultural backgrounds.

Författare: Emanuelle Brandström

Termin och år: VT 2010

Kursansvarig institution: Sociologiska institutionen

Handledare: Ann-Kristin Jonasson

Examinator: Andreas Nordin

Rapportnummer: VT10-2450-08

Nyckelord: Dialogue, Understanding, Art, Artistic meeting, Culture, Michail Bakhtin, Intercultural Education, Post-colonialism, Post-structuralism, Otherness, Orientalism, Occidentalism, Socio-Cultural pedagogy, China, TCG Nordica, ArtsNordica, Vygotsky

Sammanfattning:

The aim of this thesis is to further enhance our understanding of the way in which dialogue and understanding can increase between artists, with different cultural backgrounds. A meeting can lead to increased dialogue and understanding as well as increased stigma and prejudices. Hence, I study what constitute the difference, what determines that outcome.

In order to do so, I study TCG Nordica, a culture centre situated in China, and ArtsNordica, a network. By interviewing personnel and artists about their experiences we can learn from TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's way of working.

In order to analyze the results I create a theoretical framework, where I make use of Michail Bakhtin's understanding and definition of dialogue and understanding and combine that with the theories of intercultural education, which gives valuable insight of how understanding is created. Moreover, the theories of Lev Vygotsky are an important part of the theoretical framework. Furthermore, theories of otherness, including post-colonialism, post-structuralism, Orientalism and Occidentalism are used as a theoretical framework. The concept "culture" is discussed and used as a perspective through which the analysis is made.

The conclusion of this thesis is that there are several factors that affect the outcome of the collaboration in terms of dialogue and understanding. I have found great potentials in working with art in different ways. However, differences, openness, mutuality respect, human dignity, respect, flexibility and friendships are found to be important factors. Further, I find it important to help and support the collaboration in different ways. Finally, the leader of the collaboration and projects are found to be important for the outcomes.

This thesis is of importance for every one who is working as a pedagogue and teacher in various situations, especially within artistic subjects and in multi-cultural environments. It enhances the understanding of how one can work to increase dialogue and understanding between people.

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

Throughout my education to become a vocal-, improvisation- and music teacher and through my experiences as a musician and teacher, the communicative aspects of music and its abilities to connect people have amazed me. In the year 2002/2003, I worked as a volunteer at the culture center Tranströmer Café/Gallery Nordica (henceforth called TCG Nordica), a Scandinavian-Chinese Culture Centre in Kunming in China. During my stay there, I experienced how music and other aesthetic cultural expressions could connect people even if they could not speak the same language. I found this cultural centre to be a successful forum for Scandinavian and Chinese cultures to meet.

Last year, I studied Mikhail Bakhtin and his theory of dialogism, while studying socio-cultural theory within pedagogy. I saw a strong connection between his description of how we, as human beings, interact with one another, and the interaction within musical practices. When I received a "Minor Field Study " scholarship from SIDA via the Academy of Music and Drama, University of Gothenburg, to go back to China and TCG Nordica to do research for my thesis I found it useful to use Mikhail Bakhtin's theories as a theoretical framework for my analysis of their work.

Dialogue and understanding are important components between people at many different levels in our world. On a global level, it is a prerequisite for a positive and fair global development. On a national level, within Sweden, it is essential to work for multiculturalism and diversity according to Swedish integration policies. In Swedish schools, it is mandatory through the steering documents to support the ability to understand other people and perspectives (Lpo94, Lpf94: Lärarförbundet, 2006).

1.2 Research problem: Dialogue and understanding across cultures - or not?

In a meeting between people, dialogue may or may not occur. A dialogue does not necessarily take place only because two or more people converse. In the same way, understanding for the Other may or may not increase in a meeting. It could be that stigma and prejudice increase, instead of understanding increasing. Ruth Illman and Peter Nynäs (2005) point out that stereotypes of the Other can become self-fulfilling prophesies (Illman & Nynäs, 2005:107). In other words, the stereotypes we perceive can be consolidated in the meeting because we interpret and treat the Other according to our perceptions.

Both Stig-Magnus Thorsén and Eva Sæther have carried out studies on artistic meetings and their outcomes. Thorsén describes a study he did when South African and Swedish musicians met in a project. His conclusion is that, within these shorter meetings, the participants did not increase their understanding for the Other (Thorsén, 2008:99-115). Eva Sæther, on the other hand, describes how Malmö Academy of Music has let their students confront and experience a strong meeting with the unknown in Gambia in order to create a deep understanding of music and cultural expressions. Sæther's conclusion is that cross-bordering music teachers were brought up through this project. The students repealed the dichotomies of "us and them" and the participants changed (Sæther 2006:72, 83).

1.3 Aim

Above we see two different outcomes of the meeting. On one hand, it can increase dialogue and understanding and, on the other hand, it can increase monologue, stigmatization and prejudice. In this context, an important question to ask is what determines the outcomes from different kinds of meetings. Hence, the overall aim of this study is to investigate in what way dialogue and understanding can increase in the context of artistic meetings. By studying the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica this study aim to, on the basis of a theoretical framework, further enhance our understanding of the way in which dialogue and understanding can increase between artists, with different cultural backgrounds. This understanding is important for everyone working within an artistic context and within a multi-cultural environment, for example as a pedagogue, an organizer or a leader.

However, only presenting how TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work and how this work relates to the theoretical framework will not tell us so much about in what way dialogue and understanding can be increased. Only when the work is placed in relation to the outcomes from their work, can we actually draw conclusions and learn from their way of working and experience. Thus, to evaluate if the methods and work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica actually increase dialogue and understanding between people with different cultural backgrounds I investigate the personnel and artist's experiences of the outcomes of the meetings.

To be able to study this, I first have to develop a theoretical framework, on the basis of theories of Bakhtin, Vygotsky and intercultural education and other perspectives that I find important to enhance the understanding of the way in which dialogue and understanding can increase between artists with different cultural backgrounds. I argue that a discussion on culture and Orientalism is vital for the understanding and dialogue between cultures.

This aim gives rise to the following research questions:

- How do TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work to increase dialogue and understanding between artists with different cultural backgrounds?

- What outcomes do personnel and artists at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica experience from their work in terms of dialogue and understanding?

-According to the experience of the personnel and the artists, what aspects can affect the outcome of the artistic meeting when it comes to dialogue and understanding?

In relation to the first question, I investigate in what way TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work to increase dialogue and understanding between artists with different cultural backgrounds. Their methods and experiences will be analyzed mostly through Bakhtin's theories and the theories of intercultural education. The analysis will also take in consideration the perspectives of how the cultures can be perceived and the risks within Otherness. From TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's way of working we can further on draw conclusions about how dialogue and understanding can increase instead of creating monologue and increased stigmatization and prejudices.

However, as described above, TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's way of working do not tell us so much unless we investigate what effects that can be found from their work. This will be done in the second research question by analyzing the interviewees' experiences using what Bakhtin and the theories of intercultural education describe as the fruits and characteristics of the dialogue and understanding.

The third question clarifies different aspects that can determine the difference in outcome; increased dialogue and understanding versus increased monologue, stigmatization and prejudges. This will be investigated by analyzing the interviewees' experiences, using the theoretical framework.

1.4 Delimitations

I will study the interpersonal level; the dialogue and the understanding between the participants. I am not going to study directly what happens to the art through the interactions of the participant. Though, I discuss art in an indirect way, as a sign of dialogue or as a dialogue in itself.

I have chosen to focus on the artists participating in TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's activities. The dialogue between the artists and the audience is also interesting but I do not focus on that in this thesis. Though, also this perspective is discussed in an indirect way, as an indication of dialogue.

I do not give a full description or debate different ways of viewing and interpreting art as a phenomenon. I do not deny that it is of relevance for the subject but it is not within the scope of this thesis. That would raise new questions.

1.5 Definition of concepts

Artist – With this word I refer to everyone who is practicing some kind of art regardless of which art form.

Artistic meeting / Artistic collaboration – I refer to the meetings between people, individuals or groups, that occur through art. I refer to the meeting between two or more artist I this thesis. The artistic meetings/collaborations referred to in this thesis are more of less organized.

Art – I will not define art as a concept since that need a whole new essay. However, I want to clarify that by the word art I refer to all kinds of art for example visual art, music, dance and poetry.

Culture - In this thesis, I use culture in two different, but very connected, ways. I use culture in a broader perspective as a complex, interpretive, reflective, diverse, changeable system out of which a person creates meaning and understanding. Moreover, I use culture in the sense of art, music, poetry and so on. This is of course a part of the broader concept of culture and cannot easily be isolated from our cultural existence. To clarify when I mean more specifically these aesthetic cultural expressions I simply use the term art.

2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 Introduction

To be able to investigate the questions presented in the aim I use Bakhtin's theories of dialogue and how dialogue is needed for understanding to take place. Further, the theories of intercultural education also give valuable insight in how understanding can be created. In outlining the theoretical framework, I make use of the *prerequisites*, *characteristics* and *outcomes* of dialogue and understanding described by Bakhtin and within the theories of intercultural education. In the analysis I compare these to the interviewees' experiences and descriptions.

Since this thesis will focus on possible dialogues and understanding between people from different cultural backgrounds, I find it important to look closer at the concept "culture" and discuss how it will be used in this thesis. As will be outlined later this is used more as a perspective that the analysis use as a starting point than an analytical tool.

Since the aim is to investigate how to avoid stigmatization and stereotypes and since the collaborations take place mostly between the East and the West, I find it important to consider intercultural differences: the attitude towards and perception of *the Other*. I will therefore make use of theories of "Otherness" within the postcolonial perspective and the post-structural theory, as will be laid out below. Orientalism and Occidentalism are used as examples of how post-colonialism and post-structuralism can exist within the meeting of the East and the West. I argue that it is important to keep these aspects in mind when analyzing the results of this thesis, and moreover, when working with projects similar to the ones at TCG Nordica that will be described later on.

Finally, I will take Thorsén's valuable knowledge of the risks, potentials and overestimation of the artistic meeting, in this case through music, into account when analyzing the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica.

2.2 Lev Vygotsky and the Socio-cultural Pedagogy

In the analysis I will use concept and understanding within the Socio-Cultural theory of Pedagogy. I contend that it creates a useful framework to understand the processes around the creation of dialogue and understanding. Moreover, this perspective creates a foundation out of which Bakhtin should be understood.

Olga Dysthe and Mari-Ann Igland (2003) contends that according to Lev Vygotsky social interaction is not only the frame around the individual process for learning; it is the point of departure (Dysthe & Igland, 2003:75). He divides the social activities into two levels; the intermental level, that takes place in interaction with others, and the intramental level, that is created on an inner level (Dysthe & Igland, 2003:78). The movement from the outer to the inner level consists of complex processes and continuous movement back and forth. This means that the thought exists within the word and not only get expressed in the word (Dysthe & Igland, 2003:84). Vygotsky called the movement from the intermental level to the intramental level internalization. Wertsch later developed the concept into two steps: mastery

and appropriation. Mastery means that you take over something and appropriation that you make something into your own, that you learn to master it. The development from appropriation to mastery is not an automatic event; it is a complex process that takes a lot of effort (Dysthe & Igland, 2003:78-79). Vygotsky states that we communicate with each other in different social activities using different tools, that contain generations' experiences and understandings, which we use to understand the world and to act. Through these tools mental functions get mediated, transferred, supported or governed. These tools can be of various kinds, for example the language, the system of arithmetic, formulae, rules and scientific or other concepts. These tools have been codified in language and been transferred through communication. The tools can also be things that mediate organization, storing and advancement of content of a text or ones own thoughts for example books and movies that is a source of information or a notebook, a pen or a computer. (Dysthe 2003:45-46). Thus, there is an interaction also between a human being and the cultural tools of various kinds (Dysthe & Igland, 2003:79). Furthermore, Vygotsky contends that imagination is an "*...ability to communicate experiences, feelings and thoughts*" (Dysthe & Igland, 2003:87).

In my analysis I use Vygotsky's understanding that social interaction is necessary for growth and learning. Moreover, I make use of the understanding of how things get internalized, appropriated and mastered, through a process between the intermental and intramental level, and become a part of us. When analyzing in what way dialogue can be increased in the context presented in this thesis, I use the understanding that different kinds of tools can mediate knowledge, traditions and thoughts, both from our historical and social context and in the sense that we can mediate a message for example thought a book. Except the usage within the analysis these theories also lay a foundation out of which Bakhtin's theories should be understood.

2.3 Mikhail Bakhtin and the Dialogism

As mentioned above, I have chosen to use Mikhail Bakhtin's theories as a theoretical framework. In this part we look closer at Bakhtin's perception of the dialogue, its prerequisites, its characteristics and its outcomes. Bakhtin's concepts and description of dialogue, understanding and art are used to analyze answers given from the personnel and artists during the interviews in the analysis.

I do not make any claim to give a complete presentation of Bakhtin's work. It is far too extensive and complicated to do within the frames of this thesis. I have hence chosen parts that I have found relevant and possible to fit into the scope of this thesis. Since Bakhtin's work is complicated and hard to understand I have, except books written by Bakhtin, also used secondary resources. Those who are most frequently referred to in this thesis are very recognized sources and referred to in many other books regarding Bakhtin's work.

Mikhail Bakhtin lived 1895–1975 in Russia. His work is within and between many different scientific disciplines but is primarily placed within the language theories and literature science. Within pedagogy he is placed within the socio-cultural perspective (see e.g. Dysthe, 2003:95).

Igland and Dysthe (2003) describes that the dialogue runs as a red thread through Bakhtin's work but are also used in different meanings (Igland & Dysthe, 2003:97). According to

Michael Holquist (1990), dialogism is a term of the interconnectedness within Bakhtin's theories, but Bakhtin himself never used the term (Holquist, 1990:15)

According to Bakhtin, *all* cultural phenomena are based on the same principles as communication. These principles are the dialogical relations between individuals and groups, various systems of symbols, different voices and praxis. These systems for symbolism can be for example a picture, tone or text (Igland & Dysthe, 2003:103). This goes hand in hand with Deborah J. Haynes analysis that, according to Bakhtin, there is only one organizing power for all aesthetic forms (Haynes, 1995:10). But how is this possible? How can two pictures be based on the same dialogic relations as a conversation taking place between two people. These dialogic relations that are stated to be applicable to all cultural phenomenon should be understood more from an existential perspective. Bakhtin views dialogue as a fundamental aspect of life and of existing as a human being. *"Life is by its very nature dialogic. To be means to participate in dialogue: to ask questions, to heed, to respond, to argue, and so forth"* (Bakhtin 1984:293). Consequently, all cultural phenomenon, including art, are based on the same principles as our existence. This is strengthened by Bakhtin's statement that "…*dialogical relations are for example possible between different pictures in other kinds of art"*. (Bakhtin 1991b:196, my translation). These dialogic relations described above will be discussed further below.

2.3.1 Existence – the Self and the Other

Bakhtin views human existence as a profound communication, human lives is an unfinished dialogue. To be and to exist is something that is shared with one another; we exist in relation to other human beings. According to Bakhtin, we can only achieve self-consciousness by revealing ourselves to another. We can only see ourselves fully through the eyes of the other and it is through the communication process that understanding can be achieved. Bakhtin states that: "*To exist means to be for the other, and through him, for myself*." (Bakhtin, 1984:287). When we are looking within ourselves we are looking in or through the eyes of another (Dysthe, 1999:11). The self and the other are not isolated units, they are in constant relation to each other that never grows static. They are in a constant process of development. (Dysthe, 1999:11-12).

Since we define ourselves through the relationship to the other, the language we use is not self-expression rather it is a dialogue. It is through the eyes of the other's point of view that we can see ourselves, since some distance is needed to see. Through "the other" I become an object for my own perception. I see myself as I think that the other sees me and by combining that with what I see from my point of view, I create a whole image of myself. Consequently, I create myself both internally and externally (Dysthe, 1999:11-12). This distance that is needed to perceive and understand is what Bakhtin calls Outsideness. Haynes points out that this Outsideness, that occurs within the Self-Other relationship, also exists between the artist and the art, where the artist *"… has a unique position of Outsideness to what has been created"* (Haynes, 1995:72). Haynes, quoting Bakhtin (1990:191), also contends that the artists' task is to " …*find a essential approach to life from outside*" to define others in ways they cannot do for themselves (Haynes, 1995:72).

To sum up, we need the other to perceive and understand ourselves. By revealing ourselves for the other, we can, through her/his eyes, gain self-consciousness. Consequently, one of the outcomes of dialogue is that we get to know ourselves better and can perceive ourselves clearer. Moreover, Outsideness is a prerequisite for dialogue to take place. We now continue by looking closer at how Bakhtin described the nature of dialogue.

2.3.2 Dialogue and communication

As stated above, all cultural phenomena abide under the same principle, or force, as all communication. Below I describe how Bakhtin perceive and define dialogue and understanding. In the analysis I discuss how this can be applied in an artistic context, and further, how these theories can be used in the work of increasing dialogue and understanding through artistic meetings.

According to Bakhtin, an utterance can be of various kinds, for example a word, a sentence, a conversation or a book (Dysthe, 1999:13). Dysthe describes how, according to Bakhtin, an utterance always is created by someone's voice. This voice is representing the speaker's personality, consciousness and specific point of view. This point of view is seen more as a process than an actual position (Dysthe, 1999:13). Bakhtin emphasizes that a person's unique voice and experience are shaped and developed through a constant interaction with other individual's utterances (Dysthe, 2003:86). Furthermore, the words that we are using also carry voices from former voices. The creative element for Bakhtin is the interaction between these different voices (Dysthe, 1999:13). Since an utterance carries voices from former users, the word consequently becomes a meeting place for interaction and confrontation of different voices and their points of views. Hence, there is diversity in the potential of meaning within our utterances "…*which always are connecting the social, the cultural and the individual level*" (Igland & Dysthe, 2003:99). By analyzing the interviewees' experience I investigate if different voices exist at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica, and in that case in what way. Moreover, I discuss how this can be understood in an artistic context.

An utterance is always made in relation to what has been said before and to the response the speaker is expecting. In this way the borders between our own and the others utterances are very vague (Igland & Dysthe, 2003:100). Consequently, the utterance does not belong to the individual but to the group who participates in the interaction (Dysthe, 1999:10). Dysthe states that an utterance cannot be seen isolated; it is created and affected by the speaker's voice and personality, the concrete situation, the socio-cultural context, utterances made before and the expected response (Dysthe, 1999:13). Thus, the speaker is more or less an answerer herself/himself, by presupposing that there are other former utterances that the present utterance is in relation to. Thus, an utterance is one part of a very complex organized chain of other utterances (Bakhtin, 1997:211-212). In the analysis I discuss how the artistic meeting can be understood according to the description of dialogue described above and how this corresponds with the interviewees' experiences. Moreover, I discuss the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica in relation to this and discuss in what way it can affect how one work to increase dialogue and understanding within artistic meetings.

The answer can be of different kinds, for example that the listener agrees, object, fill it out, apply it, prepare to execute, contradict, complete or build upon the utterance made (Bakhtin, 1997:211, Igland & Dysthe, 2003:100). Thus, the answer is not always a verbal response right after the utterance; it can be an action like for example executing a command. The response can also be a silent answering understanding of the present, but sooner or later what has been heard and understood will be answered through a verbal response or through the listener's behavior (Bakhtin, 1997:211). But the degree of activity in the response varies extremely (Dysthe, 1999:76). Dysthe explains that "(r)*esponse may take place as an inner dialogue or as outer dialogue, and both kinds of dialogically and multivoicedness interact to develop understanding*" (Dysthe, 1999:76). Bakhtin states that the speaker is expecting an active understanding (Bakhtin, 1997:211).

In the response, understanding comes to realization. Response and understanding cannot exist without the other; they are in a mutual condition to one another. The one who is listening to an utterance, the addressee, are not a passive receiver but is taking an active answering position, shaped through the whole process of listening and understanding, and gives an answer of some kind (Bakhtin, 1997:211). Thus, understanding shall not be seen as something that is sent from the sender to a passive receiver, it is in the meeting, meaning and understanding are created (Dysthe, 1999:10-13). Since response is an essential part of the dialogue and since response and understanding goes hand in hand, we can draw the conclusion that understanding is an outcome of dialogue. Further, we can see that dialogue and understanding are created through an activity. Since response is a necessity in the construction of dialogue, and for understanding to come to fruition, I discuss the existence of dialogue by analyzing if response of any kind can be found within the activities at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. Moreover, I compare this description of response with the interviewee's experiences and thoughts to discuss in what way it can be understood in this artistic context.

This activity corresponds with Bakhtin's statement that the communication, and consequently all cultural phenomenon, are always a creative process since we are using something that is given and are adding something new. That also means that no utterance is totally original to its origin; it is a dialogical relation between old and new. Igland and Dysthe gives the example of how hiphop as a genre combines both global and local impulses and reuses existing cultural expressions to create ones own expression (Dysthe, 2003:104). In the analysis I investigate how this can be applied in the artistic context.

According to Bakhtin, dialogue is required if someone is to develop and grow. Bakhtin is making a distinction between the "authoritative discourse", the monologue, and the "inner persuasive discourse", which requires dialogue. The former does not include a dialogue, instead it demands to be accepted. It does not allow doubts, questioning, open exchanges of views or objections. The ambiguous becomes unambiguous. If one is exposed to the authority discourse all the time and if only these authoritative utterances and voices exist within someone's mind, that person will grow static and stop developing and growing. The inner persuasive discourse, the dialogue, does not depend on if we agree with each other or not, that is not the important question. What is important is that the dialogue is including different voices and that we get to try things, reaccentuate, give one's own version and find our own central point. This is required for appropriation of the other's words to take place and for the inner persuasive discourse to exist (Dysthe, 1999:14, Igland & Dysthe, 2003:104-105). According to Bakhtin, development requires processes that form the inner dialogue. Cultural, historical and institutional perspectives of the reality form this inner dialogue and individual voices (Dysthe, 2003:86). We can here see the characteristics of the inner persuasive dialogue and, furthermore, that its outcome is that a person can grow and develop. I discuss in what way this is applicable and correspond to ArtsNordica and TCG Nordica and its activities and if it correspond to the personnel and artist's experiences of the effects of the artistic meetings.

Meaning, according to Bakhtin, is created in the interaction between those who communicate. Meaning is never created easily, only through the struggle between different voices (Dysthe, 1999:10-13). Thus, it is not enough that different voices exist simultaneously; the tension and struggle between them are needed for the creation of understanding (Dysthe, 1999:76). Hence, conflict in a discourse can promote understanding and meaning (Igland & Dysthe, 2003:109).

Igland and Dysthe describe:

> Meaning is in other words not something that exists in the individual's consciousness or is created by the individual. Meaning is created and recreated by parties that collaborate within particular contexts and get life by different integrated voices. Those who converse or communicate with the help of writing or other medias cooperate hence in the creation and recreation of meaning.
>
> <div align="right">(Dysthe, 2003:101, my translation)</div>

This corresponds with Jonny Karlsson's understanding that according to Bakhtin, truth is created between people and not on an individual level (Karlsson, 2000:56). Hence, we need each other not only to see, perceive and understand ourselves, but also to create meaning and understanding. The dialogical foundation of man's being is manifested also here.

Only because the people involved take turn speaking a discourse is not by definition dialogical, according to Bakhtin. It is dialogical when each utterance is dependant on the other and when the tension between the voices creates new meaning (Dysthe, 1999:81). This goes hand in hand with Bakhtin's understanding that one human being cannot grasp the whole truth. Haynes contends:

> Unfinalizability results because we are finite human beings and have finite knowledge. What we apprehend are constructions, and inevitably conflicts arise over these constructions. Therefore, no one person or group can contain the truth. We simply cannot see the whole – everything that is. Ultimately, the unrepeatability and openendedness of a creative act make transformation possible.
>
> <div align="right">(Haynes, 1995:19)</div>

Hence, since the human being is finite we can only comprehend contructions. In the meeting our specific point of view and construction meet and struggle with other perspectives and constructions. These different positions are what are called voices. Only though this encounter meaning can be created. Consequently, we need others for the creation of meaning. This dialogue with different voices is taking place on the intermental level as well as the intramental level, both internally and externally.

I have earlier described that I study the existence of different voices at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica in my analysis. Further, I discuss how this tension and struggle of different voices, that are described by Bakhtin as a prerequisite for the creation of understanding and meaning, correspond with the personnel and artist's experiences of how the project are run and their turnouts. That meaning and truth cannot be created on an individual level is a starting position for my analysis.

According to Bakhtin, the prerequisites of the real person-to-person dialogue to occur are self-confidence, trust and respect. Although, Bakhtin does not see one existing before the other because through the dialogue we get a concept of who we are, and this is a necessary step to gain self-confidence and, moreover, to develop self-confidence in others (Dysthe, 1999:80). According to Bakhtin, dialogue is built on mutual trust and respect (Dysthe, 1999:77). How

does these prerequisites correspond with in what way TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica is run? This is discussed in the analysis.

We have now deepened our understanding about how Bakhtin perceive the dialogue. We continue by looking closer on how Bakhtin states that one can view a piece of art. Also here, Bakhtin's dialogical understanding of our existence and of truth is strong.

2.3.3 Understanding of an artwork

In this part I discuss Bakhtin's theories of how to understand an artwork. Bakhtin describes this by discussing how to perceive a literature work. I have already described that all cultural phenomenon abide under the same principles. Hence, the discussion of the literature work can be applied at any art form.

According to Bakhtin, a literature work has to be understood in relation to the author's epoch and culture. However, if we stop there we might miss a lot of important new values, meanings and treasures in the work. Every new epoch will, from their context, find new meanings within the work, and will in that way free the work from its own time. A literature work stands in relation to its past and owns treasures from past times, treasures that will be found within new contexts and new epochs (Bachtin, 1991a:7-13). In the analysis I discuss how this affect the work to increase dialogue and understanding through the artistic meetings. It is relevant because the meetings studied occur between artists from different cultural background.

Katerina Clark and Michael Holquist describe how Bakhtin was debating with other great Russian thinkers within literature. There was a debate of how much the author had to do with the art. Some of them claimed that the author had very little to do with the art; that what they did was predetermined by the sociological context that the author came from. Others tried to find a middle way. Bakhtin had been occupied with how to place art into the socio-economical and historical context at the time without loosing the art's distinctively aesthetic dimension. Bakhtin's solution was that these two sides were operating simultaneously (Clark & Holquist, 1984:198-200). Bakhtin defines "… *art as an event, the acting out of an exchange, the clash of values between a work and its audience.*"(Clark & Holquist, 1984:200) Bakhtin viewed art as a relationship, as an act of communication. Since this thesis study the meeting between artists from different cultural context it is relevant to raise the question of how much the artwork is sprung out of the context and how much it is created by an individual. This is important since Bakhtin's way of viewing the art can help to avoid two implied risks within artistic meetings between artists with different cultural backgrounds. On one hand there is an implied risk in the meetings of the artists and in the perception of the other's art to be viewed only according to stereotypes and not based on the artist's individuality. On the other hand, there is a risk of misunderstanding the art if one ignores the context in which the art has been created.

How does art and dialogue relate to each other in reference to Bakhtin's theories? I contend, that if there is Outsideness implied within the artistic process between the artist and the piece of art, as described above, that would mean that the very process of aesthetic creation in itself is a dialogue between the art and the artist. Second, Bakhtin also states that the artist's task is to help others to see themselves. This indicates that there is also a dialogue between the pieces of art and the one who is taking part of the art in any way, in other words the audience. Third, if we use tools that mediate knowledge, culture, value and so forth to communicate, as Vygotsky states, there is also a dialogue between the artist and the audience and between

artists within a collaboration. The fourth perspective of the dialogue of art is that, according to Bakhtin, a dialogic relationship can occur between for example two pictures. Bakhtin describes how a dialogic relation is possible to a word if it is perceived as a symbol of a foreign position, another worldview (Bakhtin, 1991b:196). Hence, a dialogic relation is possible to a picture, a symbol or other tool if they are perceived as a position for another worldview. Consequently it is not merely the artists message that is mediated but rather voice from former users that has been a part of shaping a tradition, value, culture and so on. Further, these positions, different consciousness, worldviews and voices can be in a dialogic relation. Further, this can be understood in relation to Bakhtin's understanding that a piece of art, as well as a speech, can be dialogical or monologic. If there is a dialogue between pictures, I interpret that as if there is as struggle between different voices, different point of views. Igland and Dysthe states that Bakhtin described Dostoevsky's novels as being dialogical in the sense that the characters in the novel are allowed to have their own voice and conversation without being suppressed and monologized by the author's wish to have control. If the different voices are allowed to converse and struggle within the novel, Bakhtin defines it as polyphonic (Igland & Dysthe, 2003:107). In the same way, a piece of art can be polyphonic in itself. Furthermore, a piece of are can be one voice in a greater body of work. All of these possible dialogues within art go hand in hand with Bakhtin's description of art as an event, in other words something active, an interaction between different voices. According to Bakhtin, a polyphonic artwork can be a representation of the dialogical search for truth (Dysthe, 1999:15). Caryl Emerson and Gary Saul Morson contend: "*Creation…produces not a finished world but a range of possibilities, of potentials for interesting and unpredictable histories*" (Emerson & Morson, 1987:52). These different perspectives of dialogue within and through art will be used in the analysis to discuss and answer the research questions.

2.3.4 Critique

Ken Hirschkop (2000) is criticizing Bakhtin for not being able to explain the failed and sour conversations. To be able to explain how a form of language can defy language itself, Hirschkop claims that one either has to see the sour conversations as a result of violence against language or one have to admit that a good conversation is more than just the language itself (Hirschkop 2000:84).

> For to admit that the monologue's hierarchical and authoritarian language is just as genuinely intersubjective, just as pure a form of language as its dialogical cousin, would be to accept that the problems gathered under the rubric of monologism are internal to language, part and parcel of its ordinary operation, rather than the consequence of its suppression or distortion.
>
> (Hirschkop, 2000:86)

One solution, presented by Hirschkop, is to view conversation not as a native human ability where the means may change over time, but its substance is more or less the same, but rather as a refinement and development of our language (Hirschkop, 2000:92).

This critique is important in the sense of not taking dialogue for granted when analyzing the result in this thesis. Just because a conversation is taking place it does not necessarily mean that dialogue has taken place. Though this is nothing that Bakhtin took for granted either, rather, it corresponds with Bakhtin's theories. Hirschkop's critique also seems to be pointing out that an answer does not always occur, something that does not accord with Bakhtin's description of dialogue. However, Dysthe states that, according to Bakhtin, the degree of activity within the response can vary. Since the dialogue is a fundamental aspect of our

existence, according to Bakhtin, maybe the answer is of a more subtle and existential version, than Hirschkop are debating. However, Hirschkop brings up a good point and rises a question that this thesis will not be able to answer. Though, whether an answer always occurs or not is not crucial for the outcome of this thesis. The fact that there might be an answer and that the ones participating in the dialogue are expecting response and are influenced by the expected answer is the important aspect. To determine whether dialogue is taking place or not at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica is based on the experiences of the personnel and artists interviewed. In the analysis I compare their experiences to what Bakhtin states is the outcome of dialogue. I compare how the interviewees describe the work and their experiences of the collaborations with Bakhtin's descriptions of the prerequisites and characteristics of the dialogue.

Moreover, Hirschkop criticizes Bakhtin for presenting dialogue both as an historical event, for example the novel, but also as something that is not an historical occasion but rather something deeply rooted in the structure of the discourse. Hirschkop sees a problem of explaining dialogue in these two, in his opinion, contradicting ways (Hirschkop 2000:84-85). Many of the authors writing about Bakhtin, also describe how Bakhtin uses the concept of dialogue in different ways, but none of them have described it as two contradicting ways. From my understanding, it is seen more as different perspectives of the concept of dialogue. Dysthe states that the fact that Bakhtin is opposing dialogue toward the monologue and that he moreover is claiming that every utterance in dialogical can be seen contradicting. However, Dysthe further explains this by contending that the description of every utterance as dialogical refers to that they have a dialogical relation, described above, to other utterances, both those who came before and those who are expected to come. But at the same time, a text can become only one voice in the sense that it is suppressing other voices. Bakhtin describes the monologue as something that is authoritarian and does not leave any space for doubts, questions, other views and does not open up for contradictions (Dysthe 1999:15).

2.3.5 Summary
The following boxes show the prerequisites, characteristics and outcomes of dialogue. However, one should be aware of that there is a dialogic relationship between the different boxes, for example self-confidence is both a prerequisite for and an outcome of the dialogue. These boxes are an attempt to make a more complex theory explicit.

Prerequesites for the dialogue	Characteristics of the Dialogue	Outcomes of the Dialogue
• The other • Differneces • Outsideness • Mutual trust • Mutual respect • Self-confidence • Our unfinilization	• Utterence • Voices • Responce • The dialogue relation of the concepts above. • Struggle between different voices. • Open and allowing ambiguity.	• Self - conciousness, that one get to know oneself better. • Understanding • Meaning • Self-confidence • Growth • Development

In the analysis, the interviewees' perceptions and experiences are analyzed using the concepts of how Bakhtin perceive the dialogue, understanding and art. Bakhtin's perception of the dialogues prerequisites, characteristics and outcomes, described above, are compared to the interviewees' experiences and descriptions. The applicability of the dialogue's characteristics in the context of artistic meetings are discussed and compared with the experiences of the interviewees.

Bakhtin's theories of the inner persuasive dialogue, in contrast to the authoritative monologue, are used to analyze the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica, and the potential in the artistic meetings.

The four perspectives of the dialogue within and through art described above will be used to analyze the interviewees' experiences and descriptions of the work at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica.

Further, the analysis makes use of Bakhtin's understanding of an artwork to discuss the possible dialogue in the projects and work with artistic meetings at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica.

Along with Bakhtin's theories of dialogue, understanding and art, the theories of intercultural education are used as an analytical tool, mostly to deepen the understanding of how understanding can be increased and how it can take shape. But before we look closer at the theories of intercultural education it is important to clarify a few perspectives based on the understanding of culture and otherness. They give knowledge that is important for this thesis and to better understand the theories of intercultural education.

2.4 Culture

The concept of culture is central in this thesis since it investigates the meeting between artists from different cultural backgrounds and therefore needs to be described closer. It is a concept with many different definitions. In the introduction I have stated the definition of culture that I use in this thesis. However, this part will create a deeper understanding of the concept and its definition.

2.4.1 A historical background
Illman and Nynäs (2005) describe how the meaning of the concept "culture" has changed and how it has been affected by ideas and thoughts throughout our history. They show how the understanding of culture today can be influenced by the thoughts from the past. Therefore, I give a short history of the concept and further on how it can be viewed today. Later I explain how this thesis relates to this. Moreover, this historical background gives the reader a chance to better understand the contemporary understanding of culture and the definition used in this thesis, since it can be contrasted towards former understandings.

The concept "culture" has been influenced by the present ideas of the time. For example the thought of the evolution and civilization influenced our understanding of culture to think that all cultures are developed according to a certain pattern. The idea was that different cultures had reached different levels within this pattern. (Illman & Nynäs 2005:21-23). For a long

time, culture was used within binary opposites as "Us and Them" and "Civilized and Savage". Culture was even perceived as something that only the civilized people possessed. However, this perception changed during the 20th century and rather became a central element in all societies (Illman & Nynäs 2005:24-25). Moreover, culture has been perceived as separate units with an essence that can be scientifically researched and compared to other cultures' essences. Culture was seen as something that is passed on from one generation to the other (Illman & Nynäs 2005:24-27). However, culture has also been perceived as a result of our acts. Out of this perspective culture is something that is created in the meeting of people. It is not a closed system; it is open for change and variation, dynamic and heterogeneous. (Illman & Nynäs 2005:28-33)

After clarifying the historical background from which the contemporary understanding of culture has grown we now continue to look closer at how the concept of culture is understood today.

2.4.2 The contemporary understanding of culture

This part of the thesis will help to clarify the definition of the concept of culture given in the introduction. Moreover, the reader can gain a deeper understanding of the concept. As we have seen above, how we view culture can affect how we perceive the other and, further, can affect the analysis of this thesis.

Hybrid identities
The diversity of our societies today makes it hard to view cultures as separate units. (Illman & Nynäs 2005:28-29). Catharina Eriksson et al. states that people have always transferred themselves over the globe but today the movement of people, goods, symbols and capital are moved in a quantity and speed like never before (Eriksson et al., 2002:13). Illman and Nynäs contend that Internet also is a big part of the spreading of new thoughts and to create new interaction between people. The thought of culture as separate unites implies that every person belongs to a culture and that no one belongs to many cultures, however, it is not a reality we see today (Illman & Nynäs 2005:29). Instead one speaks of hybrid identities. Thorsén explains that a person can belong to and carry different cultures. "*The cultural identity is consequently multifaceted and is defined out of different parameters: ethnicity, nationality, geography, age, gender, religion, language etc.*"[1] (my translation). Kerstin von Brömssen gives hiphop, mandarin pop/mandopop, Punjabi pop, muslim fashion shows, Angered- and Rinkeby Swedish as examples of hybrid phenomenon (Brömssen, 2006:62).

Gerd Baumann describes something he calls the "cross-cutting cleavages". This he describes as an ever-changing web. One person can, like described above, have many cultural identities according to where we live, a particular language community, a social group, interests and so on. These cultural cleavages do not run parallel but are crosscutting each other according to Baumann (Baumann, 1999:84). Consequently *"…the categories they define and the groups that people may form will cut across each other, too*." (Baumann, 1999:85).

Individuality contra culture
If someone expresses that our behaviors are typical for our culture we often get a little bit offended, since we view our behaviors as a result of our identity and personal choices. We often forget this when we look at others. When we study cultural meetings it is easy that the

---

[1] URL: http://stigmagnus.blog.com/2010/05/14/mangkultur-varldskultur-och-andra-kulturer/
Date of access: 2010-05-17

individual's role is toned down. Instead of seeing two (or more) human beings meeting we see a meeting between two abstract impersonal principles without any will or responsibility. Though there is also a risk of the opposite, that everything is viewed as an individual choice or act and not connected to culture. (Illman & Nynäs 2005:30-31)

Thus, a question is how we can see the human being as multidimensional as she/he is. Illman and Nynäs describe that when we think of our friends or family it is natural for us that they have different personalities that make them into unique individuals. We view them as so much more then just a member of a culture. This is something we should not forget in the study of others. We have to balance the aspects of culture and the individual at the same time. The human being is unique at the same time as she/he is participating in a context. (Illman & Nynäs 2005:35-36). Our identification is not necessarily bound by the culture that we share with our social group. Illman and Nynäs gives the example that an environmental activist might feel that she/he has more in common with an environmental activist in Japan than to her sister who advocates nuclear power (Illman & Nynäs, 2005:37). Mikael Kurkiala contends that if we only look to the categories there is a risk to forget about the human being and we easily dehumanize our equals. He gives the example how the Nazis during the Second World War lumped together a very diverse group of people under the label Jew (Kurkiala, 2005:27).

Baumann describes two ways of viewing culture; the essentialist and the processual theory. The essentialist approach regards culture as something that one has, a fixed object that has been worked out through long historical processes. Culture is here something that one is a member of. This perspective we have discussed above. The processual theory of culture, on the other hand, regards culture as something that one shapes and creates. We all participate in keeping up and remarking cultures. According to Baumann, the essentialist theory of culture cannot explain why and how cultures change over time. It also disregards the fact that one person can have a lot of different identities and can participate in more than one culture (Baumann, 1999:83-95).

According to Illman and Nynäs, culture is viewed as a creation of the human being. This guides the understanding of culture away from former understandings of culture as square, genetic and ruled by laws, since that is not the nature of the human being. Instead, it is a question of interpretation and identification. This makes the studies of culture into a hermeneutic science. It is a science that is focusing on the creation of meaning and understanding. The view of the human being is that she/he is interpretative, reflective, diverse, unique but yet affected by her context. Since culture is seen as a creation of man, culture is viewed as web of diversity, which is interpretative, searches for meaning and is constantly changing. It is a process of creation of meaning taking into consideration the balance and aspects of the individual versus the group, the awareness versus unawareness and the diversity versus unity. The borders of cultures are also complex, changeable, dynamic, and open for interpretation. The human being's cultural identity is a composition, it is complex and a person can vary between different cultural "systems". The concept of culture is used as a tool to understand different sides of the creation of meaning and collected relationships between man and the diversity surrounding her/him. Clifford Geertz initiated this way of perceiving culture already during the 1970's (Illman & Nynäs 2005:38-41). Kurkiala extends this argument that culture are changeable and dynamic by writing that if a native American boy eats a hamburger instead of his traditional native food, perhaps the hamburger is Native-Americanized instead of that the boy is Americanized (Kurkiala 2005:85).

In the analysis, the view of the human being as a carrier of many different cultural identities, hybrid identities, is used as a starting point. This goes hand in hand with the perspective of the processual theory of culture, which corresponds with the definition of the concept of culture presented in the introduction. This perspective is also used as a foundation in the analysis. Moreover, since this thesis is investigating in what way meetings between artist from different cultural backgrounds can increase dialogue and understanding, it is important to be aware of the balance that a person is both an individual as well as part of and affected by a context. I contend that if one forgets one of those aspects there is a risk of, at one hand, falling in to viewing the Other as a stereotype, by forgetting the individual's diversity and uniqueness, or, on the other hand, to misunderstand the person by forgetting that the person is shaped from her/his context.

2.4.3 Other aspects of the use and understanding of the concept of culture

The coexistence of the processual perspective and the essentialist perspective
Baumann points out the necessity of not totally write off the essentialist theory of culture. Since this way of viewing culture often is the understanding of culture of the people studied in social science, one cannot neglect it. It partly shapes the reality we want to understand. Baumann further describes how some people often profess the essentialist theory of culture but act the prossecual theory of culture. He gives the example if a leader of a group wants to create a stronger unity and solidarity within the group she/he would do this by convincing the group of the unity through their culture. She/he would portray this unity as a heritage from the past, remaining dormant until present time. The leader talks about culture as something unchangeable from the past, corresponding with the essentialist theory of culture, by saying something similar to: *"Our group will act and will be, and deep down always has been, united in its thinking and identity"* (Baumann, 1999:91). But the leader's act refers more to a processual understanding of culture; she/he hopes to create unity and solidarity because she/he knows that culture in pliable and open to change and new consciousness. Hence, there is a great logic to need the essentialist theory of culture as a partial truth even if there is no logic in it in itself. We are used to the natural science where two opposite theories cannot both be correct. Therefore, Baumann suggests the use of the word discourse instead of theory. When it comes to this discourse of culture, most people practice what Baumann calls a double discourse competence, developed when one exposes oneself for multicultural practice. Some people can in one situation talk about culture as a tied and tagged baggage and in another situation as something like something pliable, something we make and shape (1999:83-95). Baumann (1999) states: *"Culture is thus not the tied and tagged baggage that belongs with one national, ethnical, or religious group, nor is it some spur-of-the-moment improvisation without roots or rules"* (Baumann, 1999:95).

The encounter of cultures – the need of differences and outsideness
Just as Bakhtin states that another epoch or culture can find new treasures within a piece of art he also states that one culture can find new treasures within another culture. Bakhtin seems to have an older understanding of culture as units that can meet, however, he still has some useful thoughts that I find relevant. Every epoch and culture will find new values and so forth within another culture. According to Bakhtin, the idea that one has to enter another culture and as much as possible forget one's own culture to truly understand the other culture is a very one-sided concept. Instead, Bakhtin claims, the necessity of standing outside the item one wants to understand. Once again he emphasizes the concept of Outsideness. To illustrate this he describes that no person actually sees her own appearance or interpret it in a bigger picture, no mirror or photographs can truly help. Only other people can actually see and

understand our appearance because they are outside us. So only through the eyes of another culture can a culture's depth come into light. A meaning reveals its depth in the meeting with another foreign meaning; there will be a dialogue between them. We will, according to Bakhtin, ask the foreign culture questions that it has not asked itself and we will look for answers within the foreign culture, which will respond by opening itself up even more. Within this dialogue the cultures will not melt together but will keep their units and both be mutually enriched. (Bakhtin, 1991a:7-13). This seems to imply an essentialist perception of culture, and that might be the case. But foremost I believe this refers to Bakhtin's theory of outsideness, opposing the Hegelian and Martin Buber's theory that truth is created in the meeting with the other through consensus, synthesis and fusion. They share the understanding that truth is created in the meeting, however, Bakhtin stresses the necessity of the outsideness, of not becoming one (Karlsson, 2000:58). From this point of view Bakhtin's description of culture as units probably have more to do with the necessity of outsideness than the essentialist perception of the concept.

This connect with Kurkiala's description that in Sweden the quest of consensus has lead the need to tone down, hide or taboo our differences (Kurkiala, 2005:23). According to Kurkiala, the differences are perceived to automatically imply an inequality and thereby needs to be fought (Kurkiala, 2005:24). However, according to Kurkiala, as well as Bakhtin and the theories of intercultural education presented below, differences are the foundations of every communication system (Kurkiala, 2005:21).

However, Bakhtin's view upon culture still raises some questions: Are dialogical meetings between cultures possible in all cases or does Bakhtin assume or neglect that there might be an unequal meeting and that there might be different interests driving us in the meeting? And will the units of culture actually keep their units? We will come back to these questions further on in this thesis.

To sum up, Baumann describes the double discourse competence, that a person can talk about culture and base her/his actions on both an essentialist and a processual understanding of culture. Below I describe further why it is relevant for this thesis. Bakhtin's understanding of cultural meeting and understanding is stressing the necessity of Outsideness, that one is different.

2.4.4 The use of the concept of culture within this thesis
There is a contradiction in that I, on one hand, define culture as non-static units, state that an individual can carry several different cultural identities and that cultural identity and appurtenant is constantly being renegotiated, and on the other hand, I study the artistic meetings between Chinese and Scandinavian artists. It implies a risk that I emphasis the cultural fixed units more than the diversity of individuals within. Many times the concept of culture will also be used in that way in this thesis. Sæther discusses Eriksen, who describes the connection between history, myth and identity. He states, in reference to ethnicity, that people identify themselves according to a common history, in spite of the fact that historiography can be questioned or at least problematized. Eriksen states that the myths seems to be of a human character and therefore cannot be dismissed as false consciousness. Instead, the myths are fundamental in the human being's existence and a way of creating fellowship and political legitimacy. In a democratic society we have to acknowledge that there exists several parallel myths. In light of this, Eriksen further claims that one should talk about identification rather than identity. The word "identification" contains dynamic, diverse

and changeable processes as opposed to a thing. Identification occurs in the relational and situational in an interaction with the other (Sæther, 2006:77). This coincides with Bakhtin's theories that our "Self" exists and takes shape in the meeting with the other. In relation to this I find it irrelevant if Chinese and Scandinavians are cultural units or not. The fact that the participants identify themselves as members of these groups, constitute a foundation to discuss a meeting between different individuals of these groups. Moreover, this corresponds with Baumann's apprehension that one cannot completely write off an essentialist understanding of culture since this is how many perceive culture and consequently it is an active part of creating the reality we want to study (Baumann, 1999: 83-95).

This goes hand in hand with Illman and Nynäs' understanding, that the border-crossing meeting must be about crossing the differences that we experience in ourselves. These borders are not necessarily things that have been defined from the outside (Illman & Nynäs, 2005:51). The border-crossing is including several different levels: knowledge, attitudes, values and our personal emotions. The knowledge we have about the other can both help and obstruct the meeting. The attitudes are keys in the meeting; if we are curious, interested and so forth of the other. We all also have our own inner world that we bring into the meeting. This world contains our memories, interpretations and emotions. Consequently, several dimensions interact in the meeting. (Illman & Nynäs, 2005:60-64) Above we can clearly see that the border-crossing takes place between individuals and their perception of the other, of the differences and important cultural units and not between predetermined units. Hence, the border-crossing in the meeting can take place between Scandinavians and Chinese if that is what the participants experience as a difference, possible because of a more essentialist understanding of culture. However, the border-crossing can be between other differences, that the participants experience, and therefore the analysis is made accordingly.

Having explained the usage of culture in this thesis, we continue on to Otherness.

2.5 Otherness

Since this thesis investigate meetings between people from different cultural backgrounds, more specific from the East and the West, it is important to deepen our understanding of Otherness. In the analysis I investigate in what way Otherness can be decreased; how understanding can be increased. Moreover, it is an important aspect when analyzing the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica, especially since they claim to emphasize equality in their work[2]. To deepen our understanding for the concept of Otherness I use the post-structural theory and post-colonial theories including Orientalism and its opposite equivalent Occidentalism. These theories, presented below, can be problematized and discussed themselves but that is not the aim of this thesis. My point of describing them is instead to show that the meeting between the East and the West is not unprejudiced and, hence, needs to be problematized.

2.5.1 Post-colonialism and Post-structuralism

Post-colonialism's fundamental thought is that the colonialism is by no means in the past; it is present today. It is focusing its research on the relation between culture and imperialism. The colonialism has put a mark in the post-colonized countries as well as in the Western countries. Further, according to the post-colonial perspective, cultural research cannot be made if one is

---

[2] URL: http://www.tcgnordica.com/artsnordica Date of access: 2009-06-14

placing the culture outside of the history of colonialism. And every country, whether they were active as colonizers or not, are affected and cannot be analyzed outside of the global process. The prefix *post-* can also indicate that one is trying to see through and behind the borders and identities that were established during the colonialism. The postcolonial perspective is not so much asking new questions, rather it addresses how the questions are approached (Eriksson et al., 2002:14-20). Hence, the artistic meetings at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica must be investigated and analyzed with the awareness of that the meetings are not unprejudiced.

Post-colonialism is closely connected to the post-structural perspective. In the post-structural perspective, the understanding of language is very important. It is not seen as a mirror reflecting the reality or like a simple expression. Instead, one sees the language as the foundation out of which we understand the world. In the language there are binary oppositions that give meaning to its opposite. In this way "man" gives meaning to the understanding of "woman", and "black" gives understanding to "white". In these binary oppositions, there is a relation of power where one is considered the dominant one and the other the weak one, who is depending on the dominant one. In this way, the language and these binary oppositions are helping to create and maintain the hierarchy in the society. These binary oppositions are also a simplified and reductionist way of creating truth, where no grey arias are allowed. Eriksson at el. states that the existing discourses imply power by creating truths that we take for granted. Thus, the discourses set the framework of what can be said and thought. Hence, the post-colonial theory is emphasizing questions of in what way dominant theories and science can suppress and make important aspects of the reality, which they claim to represent, invisible (Eriksson et al., 2002:14-20). When analyzing the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica I will investigate how this theory will affect the work and the possibility for understanding and dialogue to take place. Moreover, this is related to Bakhtin's theory of the need of many different voices for understanding, meaning and truth.

Eriksson et al. also describes how psychological ambivalence, in the sense of having contradictive feelings toward an individual or group, can be suppressed and projected on other groups that are seen as different. It is often the feelings that are taboo in the society, for example sexuality and aggression, that get projected on the Other. According to this point of view the division of the reality into dichotomies has got to do with an inability to handle the psychological ambivalence (Eriksson et al., 2002:37-38). The projections can also be idealized and extolled. Then, the projections that make explicit disparage, despise and discriminate the Other are reversed. However, these stereotypes and projections mean an objectification of the Other that essentialize, naturalize and fix the Other's identity. Hence, the Other can be an object both for projection of taboos as well as an object for fantasy and fascination (Eriksson at el., 2002:38-39). Illman and Nynäs point out that the stereotypes we have often lack nuances and are strongly rooted in how we perceive the world. Hence, as mentioned in the introduction, they become self-fulfilling prophesies (Illman & Nynäs, 2005:107). To sum up, stereotypes say more of the person who holds the stereotypes than the person the stereotypes is directed towards. The stereotypes can be of both a condescending and an extolling and idealizing character. Moreover, the stereotypes can become self-fulfilling. In the analysis of this thesis the maintenance and possible the creation of stereotypes are seen as an opposite to increased understanding between people.

Another perspective of this, outside the postcolonial theoretical framework, is Martin Buber's theory of the I-it and the I-you world, discussed by Illman and Nynäs. Even though Buber differs from Bakhtin, as described above, I chose to present this perspective because their

differences are, as far as I understand, not represented within this theory. When the other becomes an "it", it is seen from the outside and one is categorizing, interpreting and reflecting upon the other. Here the borders are created. When the other becomes a you there is an immediate and present meeting with the other where the borders looses its meaning. We go back and forth between these different states, and both are needed according to Buber. Often they even intertwine (Illman & Nynäs, 2005:48-49). This understanding of the meeting perceives categorization as a necessity for the actual meeting where we become "I" and "You". In the meeting of "I" and "You" the categories and borders become irrelevant. Hence, the categories can be seen both as a sign of stereotypes that prevent an actual meeting and understanding to take place but also as a necessity for the actual meeting. This corresponds with Illman and Nynäs' statement that it is natural for the human being to categories what we experience, and if we had no categories of our surrounding world, there would be chaos. On the other hand, when we have developed stereotypes they are hard to get rid of. Illman and Nynäs further contend, that there is a disagreement of how necessary the stereotypes are (Illman & Nynäs, 2005:106-110). Consequently, categories in themselves cannot be interpreted merely as a sign of stereotypes and stigmatization. Instead, they are a natural part within the meeting. However, they can solidify and create, often self-fulfilling, stereotypes that do not allow the Other to be diverse and changeable.

The postcolonial perspective has been criticized on the grounds that it is a theory that has isolated itself from the reality, with real post-colonial problems and the political struggle. Moreover, it has been criticized, as a result of the post-structuralism, for being relativistic and for being politically unable. The answer to this critic is that discourse analysis is a powerful way of revealing what is taken for granted and held for true. Furthermore, it is pointed out that the critique given is made upon a simplified distinction of the discourse: the text and the language versus the non-discourse, the reality and the practice. Hence, the critique is made upon simplified dichotomies, which is what the post-colonialism and the post-structuralism are criticizing in the first place. Instead, it is argued that there is a discursive aspect to all acts since all social practises is connected to creation of meaning and, furthermore, how we perceive the world affects how we act (Eriksson et al., 2002:21-22).

Having described the post-colonial and the post-structural theories, we continue to describe Orientalism and Occidentalism. They are both examples of when the language and the discourse can affect the perception and creation of the reality and the Other. The aim of presenting these theories is to show the complexity of the meeting between the East and the West. According to Said, Orientalism is present within the meeting and is affecting our perception, interpretation and understanding of the Other. Occidentalism presents, just as Orientalism, the perception of the Other through stereotypes, created more through our need of identification and an antipole than the actual reality. However, Occidentalism is opposite Orientalism in the sence that is discusses the Other's perception of the Western world. In this thesis Orientalism and Occidentalism are viewed as risks within the meeting between the East and the West. Further they strengthen TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's choice to emphasis equality and mutuality in their work[3].

2.5.2 Orientalism

In this part I present the theory of Orientalism. Furthermore, I discuss some critique directed towards the theory.

---

[3] URL: www.tcgnordica.com/about Date if access: 2009-06-14
and URL: http://www.tcgnordica.com/artsnordica Date of access: 2009-06-14

Edward W. Said (1997) describes his theories of how knowledge about the other is constructed in different Western texts about the Orient (Eriksson et al., 2002:20). According to Said, the Orient, often presented as romantic, with exotic characters, lovely memories and landscapes and remarkable experiences, is a European invention (Said, 1997:3). Geographical sectors, such as the Orient and the Occident, are human creations both as cultural units and as geographical units (Said, 1997:6-7). They are ideas "*with their own history and intellectual tradition, their own metaphorical language and their own vocabulary that has given it reality and presence within and for the Western World*" (Said, 1997:7).

The Orient and the Occident support each other and are partly each other's mirrors. Said states that "*... the European culture has won in power and identity by putting itself against the Orient as some kind of replacement for the self or even as a underground self.*" (Said, 1997:5). The Orientalism helps to strengthen West's self-image of being a superior civilization. The West often get characteristics as rational, progressive, democratic and manly while the East often get characteristics as sensual, irrational, retrogressive, despotism and femininity (Eriksson et al., 2002:20-21). Martin W. Lewis and Kären E. Wigen (1997) also point out how Europe for a long time has defined their own psycho-sociological qualities in contrast to those of the East. They further describe how the European civilization is characterized by its keen appreciation of personal freedom, restless desire for development and growth, compulsion to control and manipulate nature, commitment to rational inquiry, a tendency to regard the self as an autonomous agent in competition with others and so on, while the East is characterized in opposite terms (Lewis & Wigen, 1997:73). They state that "*…the essence of east is seen as manifest in communitarian, aesthetic, and other-worldly values, extolling the submission of the individual to a timeless, mystical whole*" (Lewis & Wigen, 1997:73). Said contends that they have a relationship of dominance and a complicated hegemony between them (Said, 1997:6-7). He explains that Orientalism is:

> a way of relating to the Orient that has its foundation in the area's special position in the history of the European Western World. It is not only that the Orient is next to Europe; it is also there one finds Europe's best, riches and oldest colonies, source to its civilization and language, its competitor within the cultural area and one of its most impressed and most frequently returning images of The Different. Thereto has the Orient contributed to the definition of Europe (or the Western World) by being its counterpart picture, counterpart idea, opposite experience.
>
> (Said, 1997:3, my translation)

Anyone who teaches, writes or does research about the Orient is an orientalist and is doing what Said calls Orientalism. Orientalism is a way of thinking that has its foundation within the division between mostly the Western World and the Orient. Many writers have accepted this division as their starting-point. (Said, 1997:5)

Orientalism is a discourse, an enormous system of disciplines that everyone who thought, wrote or did anything in reference to the Orient was limited by. Through this system, Europe managed to govern and even produce the Orient politically, sociologically, militarily, ideologically, scientifically and artistically during the period after the Age of Enlightment (Said, 1997:5).

Said contends that it would be wrong to view the Orient only as an idea and a thought without any reality in the real world. Orientalism is not about whether there is a consensus between the Orient and Orientalism or not, rather it is about its inner consequences and its ideas about the Orient (Said, 1997:7). Orientalism is not just lies that would disappear if the truth would appear. It is more a sign of the European-Atlantic power over the Orient than it is a realistic discourse about the Orient. Orientalism is not fantasies; it is a mass of theories and practice, which generations have made considerable material investments within. It is a system of knowledge about the Orient and has become a filter that lets through knowledge about the Orient to the Western World's consciousness (Said, 1997:8). Said states that to understand the toughness and persistence of such a hegemonic systems as the culture, we have to realize that the inner limitations they are to the writers and thinkers are productive and not only obstructive (Said, 1997:16). Writers presuppose former work about the Orient and knowledge about the Orient that she/he refers to and trusts. Each work connects to other works, a certain audience, to institutions and the Orient itself (Said, 1997:22). Orientalism is not a simple political topic or scientific field that passively is reflected in the culture, it is not a lot of texts, nor is it an expression, representative or an expression for oppression of the Orient. It is a dispersion of the geopolitical consciousness to human science, the aesthetic, history, economy, sociology, and philological texts. Orientalism is a development of the fundamental geographical division of two unequal worlds. Moreover, Orientalism constitutes interests that it creates and maintains through psychological analysis, philological reconstructions, scientific discovers, descriptions of the landscape and sociological descriptions. Orientalism is a will or intention to understand and in some cases control, manipulate and even incorporate what is a different world. In the modern political-intellectual culture, Orientalism is an important dimension and it has got more to do with "our" world than the Orient (Said, 1997:14).

According to Said, Orientalism is most present and is not something that took place in the past (Eriksson et al., 2002:21). Orientalism is mainly a French and British phenomenon. They started their dominance of the Orient and the Orientalism in the beginning of the 19th century. After the Second World War America started its dominance of the Orient and Orientalism and approach it in the same way as France and Britain (Said, 1997:5-6)

Critique
Orientalism has been criticized for presenting a too homogeneous and unambiguous image of the discourse of Orientalism, without taking in consideration historical changes. Said is hence criticized for repeating the homogenization that he is criticizing the Orientalism for doing, by not taking in consideration and showing the differences among the colonial powers that have produced the Orientalism. Moreover, it has been expressed that Said's work has created an image of the colonialized as passive and unable to do resistance themselves (Eriksson et al., 2002:21).

Robert Erwin is one of those criticizing Said's theories illustrated in his book Orientalism. He is criticizing Said's choice and critique of Orientalists, that Said chooses orientalists that correspond with his theories and leave out those who do not. Moreover, Irwin contends that it is a mistake to say that Said was the first to point out that orientalists had hidden intentions and hence started a debate. It has been natural for orientalists to inspect their own work and methods and others have raised the issue before Said. Irwin points out that the orientalists often were pious and dull people locked up in a library and hardly had any representatives for the imperialism. And it was more common that those orientalists who had prejudices about the Orient and who published manifestos, wrote articles and were criticizing the politicians

had prejudices in favor for the Arabs and Islam. Furthermore, Irwin contends that Said draws our attention in the wrong direction. He expresses that no sensible person would deny that there exists a description of the Orient as corrupt, lazy, and so forth, however, he does not think that academic texts are the place to look for it. Instead, he suggests that the best places to search is in the government department, police station, the military barracks, the movie studios in Hollywood, the novels, comic pictures, the raw expressions of the gangs on the street and so on. Further, Irwin does not think that the orientalists' academic work has any major effect on the politicians and the imperialists since that was not the kind of literature that they read. Finally, Irwin criticizes Said for not having the facts straight regarding the history (Irwin, 2007:20-23)

Mohamed Omar (2007) also criticizes Said's theories. Omar states that, according to Said, the Orient does not exist and never actually have existed. Omar refers to how Irwin, contradicting Said, contends that the orientalists' main driving power was not to serve the power the imperialism or the white race, instead it was the lust of knowing (Omar, 2007:30). They were studying the Orient for the purpose of the science without any shady political or imperialistic agenda (Omar, 2007:32). Oriental language studies took place long before there were colonies in the Orient (Omar, 2007:30). Omar gives an example of two Swedish orientalists, H.S. Nyberg and Johannes Kolmodin, who both were convinced antiracists and often spoke in favor of and showed empathy towards "the Other" (Omar, 2007:32). Maybe Said's answer to this would be this quote stated in his book about what he calls imagined overpolitical objectivity:

> What I am interested to do now is to show how the general liberal consensus about the concept that "true" knowledge is fundamentally non-political (and reversed to open political knowledge aren't "real" knowledge) hide the well developed albeit unclear organized political conditions that are valid when knowledge are produced.
>
> <div align="right">(Said, 1997:12, my translation)</div>

Having presented Orientalism let us move on to Occidentalism.

2.5.3 Occidentalism

Ian Buruma and Avishai Margalit's theory, called Occidentalism, is about the dehumanized image of the Western world that are painted by its enemy (Buruma & Margalit, 2008:13). They describe how Occidentalism started in Europe and then spread from there (Buruma & Margalit, 2008:14). It is the equivalence of the Orientalism, just the other way around. In both of these views, the human beings are deprived of their humanity. Buruma & Margalit state that it is one thing to disagree strongly, dislike and to have prejudices against the Western world, but it is another to reduce a whole society or civilization to a bunch of soulless, decadent, greedy, rootless, unfaithful, unfeeling parasites. That is a form of an intellectual wipe out. When the image of other people as less valuable beings gets a revolutionary power, people get annihilated (Buruma & Margalit, 2008:18-19).

During the 19th and 20th century there were ideas in Europe, for example in Germany, against the Western civilization. A successful German social scientist Werner Sombart coined the concept Komfortismus about the Western middle-class as a description of their mentality with values of the French Revolution, commercial ideas, interested only in what life can offer him in terms of material belongings and physical well-being. The merchants' Komfortismus is

infecting everything the merchants do. In these ideas, against the Western civilization, the democracies in the Occident are missing heroism and sacrifice and the democratic leaders are missing a longing for greatness. It was believed that it would be hard to get democratic citizens to risk their lives in war. Since the Westerners cling to their lives they were considered less honest and therefore less than real people (Buruma & Margalit, 56-79).

Having clarified and deepened our understanding for the concept of culture and otherness we continue to the theories of intercultural education, that, along with Bakhtin, constitute an analytical tool for how understanding can be created and perceived.

2.6 Intercultural Education

Intercultural education is a theory of how one can work with a group from a pedagogical standpoint to increase the understanding of the Other and the Self through an interaction. Differences are seen as a prerequisite for the dialogue and creation of understanding and the idea is to use our differences as well as our similarities together in order to create an understanding and to learn more. Hence, I find it relevant since it corresponds well with the aim of the thesis and Bakhtin's thoughts of dialogue and understanding. Therefore, I use the theories of the intercultural education to analyze how understanding can take place. The prerequisites, the characteristics and the outcomes of the theories of intercultural education are compared to the interviewees' experiences and descriptions. Moreover, the theories of intercultural education give valuable insights into how one can work on a pedagogical level to increase understanding that are used when analyzing.

Pirjo Lahdenperä (2004) describes that intercultural education is a broad term including intercultural learning, intercultural communication, intercultural teaching, multicultural school development and intercultural pedagogical science (Lahdenperä, 2004:13). The trademark for the intercultural education over all is that it is including a process of some kind; cross-boundary, interaction and mutuality, often with the goals of respect, tolerance and social justice (Lahdenperä, 2004:15). *Inter* stands for the interplay and the interpersonal interaction, and *culture* stand for the system of meaning that brings order and direction to a person's life (Lahdenperä, 2004:21). Hans Lorentz and Bosse Bergstedt (2006) describe the difference between multicultural and intercultural as a difference of state and action. For example, a multicultural society is a society including many different cultures while intercultural education in describing an action, an interaction and relationship between different cultures (Lahdenperä, 2004:16-17). Lahdenperä describes the term *intercultural* as a mutual interaction process between people with different cultural backgrounds (Lahdenperä, 2004:16-17).

2.6.1 Context
The intercultural education exists within the context of postmodernism and post-structuralism. Because of the industrial revolution during the end of the 19th century man is separated from the church and from the king. This leads, according to Lorentz and Bergstedt, to that new fellowships take place, for example the nation, the family, a political party and ones gender. This is the modern society taking shape. Today, in our postmodern society, another process is taking place; the process of man separating itself from these so-called replacement fellowships of the modern times. The national movement's time is over, which can be seen in for example the decrease of interest for political parties (Lorentz &Bergstedt, 2006:24). In the postmodern era education is seen as a constant process of change. The subject is not seen as a

uniform phenomenon but as something that is changing depending on its context (Lorentz & Bergstedt, 2006:27). Brömssen explains how the identities are "… *created, constantly changing, negotiated and are never completely constructed.*" (Brömssen 2006:45, my translation). Within postmodernism the individual are less keen on accepting or join on to a general truth established in a culture, tradition, association or other group. Instead, the individual are creating one's own truth (Johansson, 2006:161-162).

The intercultural education adapts the post-structural approach, described above. This will affect the meeting with the other. Lorentz and Bergstedt claim that, through the construction of new expressions of language, meanings are constructed in the meeting with the other (Lorentz &Bergstedt, 2006:27). "*These constructions contribute to how we perceive ourselves and how we create our identity and knowledge*" (Lorentz &Bergstedt, 2006:27). This new understanding of knowledge affects education (Lorentz &Bergstedt, 2006:27). The teacher's role, and I would in the context of this thesis add the leader's role, is hence changed because of this; the teacher, or leader, is now seen as someone who is taking part in the different knowledge and learning processes and is coaching and mentoring her/his students' own process of creating knowledge rather than someone delivering already complete knowledge (Lorentz &Bergstedt, 2006:28).

Post-modernism and post-structuralism create a background through which the theories of intercultural education should be understood. Moreover, the need of creating and shaping one's own truth, the need of creating new constructions and the role and perception of the leader and learning are taken into consideration when analyzing TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work.

After having clarified the context and background of intercultural education we shall now look closer at what intercultural education actually means.

2.6.2 What is Intercultural Education?

The prerequisites for intercultural education is that everyone must acknowledge that the multicultural context consists of individuals with different ideas and values often based on ethnocentric ideas and behaviors. We will view and understand our surroundings and the other depending of our own background. We have learnt to think in dichotomies, but we have to learn to see and think beyond that and look to the heterogeneity amongst us. This is needed for the intercultural communication to take place (Lorentz &Bergstedt, 2006:28).

If we recognize that we are the same but yet so different, an opportunity to see each other as equal and at the same time very different from each other arises. Hence, we might get more aware of ourselves as a cultural product, a social constructed being (Lorentz & Bergstedt, 2006:28). One can become aware of one's different ways of viewing knowledge, learning, education and the meaning of life by being aware that things can be viewed from different perspectives. These perspectives are based on experiences and understanding from the students and teachers, in other words the participants (Lorentz & Bergstedt, 2006:28-29). Lorentz and Bergstedt (2006) describe that the intercultural education also must include analyzes of concepts like the construction of knowledge and reproduction, the inclusiveness and exclusiveness of groups in the society, prejudices and attitudes, discussions about integration, segregation, marginalization, racism, sexism and the demand of justice and equality (Lorentz & Bergstedt, 2006:29). We have to understand more of how these things are effecting our communication and social relationships (Lahdenperä, 2004:15).

Intercultural education can create a social and intercultural competence (Lorentz & Bergstedt, 2006:29). We can learn to bridge over different perspectives, interpret, understand and respect others perspective and to be able to question and process our own ethnocentrism. An ability to be open for what is different and a cultural awareness, meaning an ability to critically inspect criteria, products, actions and perspective within one's own and other's cultures, can be achieved. One can develop a cultural sensitivity: to acknowledge and notice cultural differences that in other cases might be neglected or interpreted through one's own culture. (Lahdenperä, 2004:18). Our own ethnocentric ideas and values need to be confronted with other ideas and to be processed emotionally. (Lahdenperä, 2004:19) Lahdenperä describes how intercultural education is striving to find new concepts, understanding and categories to match the intercultural society we are living in today and that are more appropriate to the need of identification that lies there within. Then "… *if one have roots within different parts of the world, one will also feel solidarity with and engagement to improve the living conditions in ones origin country. This might lead to a Cosmo political engagement, where the whole humanity is in focus rather then only national values and the ethno nationalistic upbringing and education appeal to.*" (Lahdenperä, 2004:20, my translation).

The boxes below show an overview of intercultural educatoin, its background, characteristics and possible outcomes. The background are used when analyzing the answers from the interviews. The characteristics of intercultural educatoin will be used to analyze the descriptions given from the interviewees of the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. The outcomes are compared to the interviewees' experiences to analyze and evaluate whether TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work leads to increased dialogue and understanding or not.

Background	Charateristics	Outcomes
• Recognition that we as human beings are the same but different. • A post-structural understanding to our perceptions and an aspiration to see beyond dichotomies. • A post-modern understanding of the world including the individual's need and search for meaning and truth.	• Analysis of relevant concepts. • Confrontation and emotional processing of our own ethnocentric ideas. • Striving to find new concepts, understanding and categories to match the intercultural society.	• Understanding of that human beings are the same but different. • Awareness of ourselves as cultural products. • Awareness of and ability to process ones own ethnocentrism. • Awareness of and respect for different perspectives. • Social and intercultural competence, cultural awareness and cultural sensitivity. • Openness.

2.6.3 Critique

The critique towards interculturalism is, according to Lorentz and Bergstedt, that it is for *the Other*, that it is against the Western world and our democracy, and that it is a threat to our own culture. Lorentz and Bergstedt answer to this critique by describing how the intercultural competence is something that we all need today and that the multicultural education has sprung from a Western scientific context. They also describe how there can be a fear of

questioning the Western ethnocentrism through self-reflection, deconstruction and cultural analyzes, which can create critique. Instead, one should understand that more perspectives stimulate and deepen learning and give the traditional material an increased relevance and meaning (Lorentz &Bergstedt, 2006:30-32).

We now have an understanding of what intercultural educatoin means and will now continue to look closer at two different examples of how one can work within intercultural educatoin that are relevant for the analysis. The first one, friendship, is relevant because TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica state that they work through friendships[4]. The second one is about the importance of working with bigger life questions. This corresponds with TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's vision and ways of working and is therefore useful in the analysis.

2.6.4 Friendship

Marie Småberg (2006) describes friendship as an aspect of creating peace between people with different cultural and religious backgrounds. In this chapter she is describing and analyzing Anglican schools with a British and Christian profile in Palestine comprising of Jewish, Christian and Muslim students during the British legislative period 1920-1948. In the managemant of these schools, friendship was a big topic. The idea was that the children's interest would overcome the differences of ethnicity and religion, hence, friendship would take place. As a part of this concept one thought that if the students would have memories through life of how they played and studied with other students with other cultures and religions, this will shape and influence their character and view of people from other groups (Småberg, 2006:177-194).

Småberg relates this to David Shield who describes how a common history and common memories are important for friendship. The teachers at these school stated that many individual and very deep friendships grew, how the students spent time with each other outside of school and celebrated each other's religious festivals in each other's homes. Småberg further contends that friendship, as a phenomenon, exists all over the world. She refers to Eva Österberg who, in connection to Catharina Stenqvist, raises the question if friendship is something so human that it, just like death, in its core is essential for us. Moreover, Småberg describes how man through history has been having different philosophies about friendship, which could be another indication of how important it is for us as human beings (Småberg, 2006:177-194).

Småberg discusses the risk that friendship can be a way of legitimize unequal power positions; in the disguise of friendship the power becomes softer and less visible. However, she refers to David Shield, who claims that there is a feeling of mutuality and exchange between friends even if they socially are not equal. People that are involved create friendships, however, friendships are also create by the social environment it exists within. Moreover, the friendship can be a part of shaping the environment. In this way, according to Shield, friendships are political.

Småberg refers to Sheild, who contends that a friend is no copy of oneself but friends help us to see the reality through other perspectives than our own. In this way friends can be alike and different at the same time, something that is desirable according to Shield. (Småberg,

---

[4] URL: www.tcgnordica.com/about Date if access: 2009-06-14
and URL: http://en.tcgnordica.com/artsnordica/ Date of access: 2009-06-14

2006:177-194). This corresponds with Bakhtin's theories that we can perceive and understand ourselves through the eyes of another.

Above Småberg describes the importance of friendships, their potential and risks. These will be used when analyzing the interviewees' experiences. We now go on to the importance of bigger life questions.

2.6.5 Spirituality

Margaretha Johansson discusses the importance of spirituality and the big questions of life. She uses Grundtvig's descriptions of spirituality that she understands as something that is not specifically connected to any specific religion or belief, but rather something that is human (Johansson, 2006:157). Johansson states that a spiritual dimension can draw people from different cultures closer together towards peace (Johansson, 2006:157). Our spiritual development is a foundation of wonder and humbleness for all life that is taking shape. This leads to a feeling of responsibility and a fellow feeling with all mankind and living species. (Johansson, 2006:156-157). Johansson quotes Kenneth Ritzén who contends that in these postmodern times, when traditional values and standardizing institutions are deconstructed, the big questions of life have been brought to the fore. One experiences a feeling that the former answers are no longer valid so we all have to create our own understanding and our own answers to these questions. No one else can give some one else the answer. Others can just elicit, promote and provoke (Johansson, 2006:161-162). In a human being's development, with curiosity, respect and understanding for others and our surroundings, lies a spiritual dimension of value for our existence and identity. It is thereby important that there is space for the dialogue of our life questions in a lifelong learning process. In the meeting with the other we can step aside and view ourselves from another horizon (Johansson, 2006:155). Once again this corresponds very well with Bakhtin's theories of the need of the other's outsideness to perceive ourselves.
Johansson discusses Joseph Beuys:

> "*There lies a potential of free power of creating within each individual waiting to be allowed to develop…The human being's and especially the child's way to knowledge and liberation goes through the rhythm and the movement of the body and the senses, through the games and fantasy, the language, the voice…It is by creating meaningful meetings where the learning takes shape in experiences that affects the whole child, that we can liberate the power of creating within the child.*" (Johansson, 2006:159, my translation)

2.7 Artistic meetings

Stig-Magnus Thorsén discusses possibilities, overestimations and risks of using music as a bridge-builder and as a way of working for multiculturalism. Here I see music as an example of one of the art forms that can be used within the artistic meeting. Thorsén brings up several aspects, both of the potential of increased understanding and of the risk of deepened stigmatization, which are valuable when analyzing the potential of the artistic meetings.

Thorsén problematizes music as a bridge-builder between different groups (Thorsén, 2008:99-115). He states that multicultural project's hope of music's healing forces often deepen the stigmatization and exotization of the marginalized minority groups. There is a risk that the music hides injustices instead of revealing and solving them. Thorsén states that music often

is seen as something without a context. Within world music there is a tendency to take a piece of the music, for example a phrase, and put it into a new context. In this way, the original piece looses its meaning and function. There is a risk that the music gets useful first when it has gone incomprehensible. Instead, we should have the interest of learning from the Other, that leads to searching for the comprehensible knowledge about the music's role in the Other's society as a point of departure for our meeting. According to Thorsén, music is never without a cultural and social context and to really understand music one has to see to its special function in an individual person's life and in a group's common life (Thorsén, 2008:99-115). Thus, Thorsén does not believe in music as a universal common language (Thorsén, 2003:21-24). Consequently, Thorsén and Bakhtin share the understanding of the importance of taking in consideration in what context and by whom the piece of art has been created. However, Bakhtin continues by contending that, if we stop there we might miss a lot of important ideas and values. Instead, new epochs and cultures can find new treasures within in the art, as described above. Thorsén's statement contradict Bakhtin by contending that by talking a piece of art from it context it looses its meaning and function. Moreover, Thorsén illustrates that it could imply a risk that this can be interpreted as a lack of interest for the Other and, further, one might miss an opportunity to learn more about the Other and increase one's understanding.

Music can establish and maintain a group's symbolic universe by materializing central and unifying ideas into a sounding shape (Thorsén 2008). Music works both within a group, by strengthening the fellowship and giving security, and outwards, as a mark towards other groups. In this way, music is less useable for multicultural ambitions and can even lead to increased polarization. (Thorsén, 2003:21-24 & 2008:99-115)

On the other hand, intellectual, emotional and physical experiences are emphasized in music in a non-verbal form. Thus, music can create new and different meeting places and even formulate alternative thoughts and ideas. In this way, music can relate to something human beyond everyday life and cultures. Music can convey meetings between dissident individuals and cultures through its directness in the meeting. In this way, music can bridge over social fences and make us rethink our positions. By reaching into other layers within human beings, music can in an unbelievable way bridge over cultural barriers. Moreover, music can have a democratic character by giving a voice to marginalized groups in the society (Thorsén, 2003:21-24)

As described in the introduction, Thorsén describes a research he made of a meeting between South African and Swedish musicians. He found, that in the beginning the meeting was colored of a lot of prejudices about the Other, often influences by our colonial past. He found a curiosity about what was different about the Other and that the differences was prioritized. Although, there was a limitation for the fascination of the differences when it came to things outside the music that collided with the Western values. Thorsén found that within shorter meetings the participants did not really change their understanding and view of each other. The participants symbolized stereotypes to each other. Through experiences of the meeting a platform was created for continued dialogue. Thorsén saw an inequality in the collaboration in the way that the Other had less opportunity to influence form, contents and results in the meeting. Thorsén states that to build a mutual understanding between cultures one has to affirm both similarities and differences (Thorsén, 2008:99-115)

Above I have presented different parts of the theoretical framework that I find important for the analysis of dialogue and understanding between different cultures. Bakhtin, socio-cultural pedagogy along with intercultural educatoin creates a framework to analyze the prerequisites, characteristics and outcomes of dialogue and understanding. Futher, I contend that they create a useful theoretical framework for the analysis in this artistic context. Otherness is discussed to illustrate the risks and the challenges of the meeting between different cultures, in this case the East and the West. To illustrate Otherness I present different theories: post-colonialism, post-structuralism, Orientalism and Occidentalism. Finally, I have presented some of Thorsén's theories discussing the risks, potentials and overestimation of artistic meetings through music. Now, we continue by describing method and material.

3 METHODOLOGY AND MATERIAL

To be able to answer my questions and fulfill the purpose of this thesis I need information and insights both about how the activities of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica are run in practice and how the people connected to TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica experience these ways and their outcomes. Hence, I have chosen to make interviews. Esaiasson et al. describes two different kinds of interviews; an informant-survey, where the interviewees contribute with information, and as a respondent-survey, where the interviewees' own thoughts are more in focus (Esaiasson et al., 2007:257-258). The interviews in this thesis have been of both kinds. I have been interested in their information about how the projects are organized and run, but also of their experiences, opinions and thoughts of the dialogue, understanding and of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work.

3.1 Hermeneutic character

This research is of a hermeneutic character, meaning that it is interpretive. Nils Gilje and Harald Grimen (2007) describes that human beings give different acts and phenomena meaning and interpret them in different ways. This means that when I did my interviews I interpreted something that is already an interpretation. The people I interviewed have their perception and interpretation of how the reality is and the meanings within this reality. When I interviewed and processed the material, I made an interpretation of these interviews. We have different pre-understanding, a term introduced by Hans-George Gadamer, of things. We interpret language and concepts differently and we view the world through these concepts, they make it possible for us to see something as something. This means that different persons with different understanding of different concepts can understand the world and the reality differently. Different perceptions, ideas and believes also affects how we understand the world. We take things for granted; hold some things true about the society, ourselves, others, the nature and so forth. These different ideas will affect what we look for in different situations and how we interpret them. Our personal experiences also affects how we understand and interpret the world. Since the people I have interviewed and myself most likely have different pre-understanding of things I have tried to be aware of this and as much as possible tried to understand their point of view. I have often asked them how they would define words and concepts that I am asking questions about for example what it means to be equals. I have also tried to describe the words and concepts that I used in my questions as clear as possible to decrease the risk of misunderstandings. Moreover, Gilje and Grimen describe Anthony Gidden's idea of double hermeneutics. If we only rely on a person's description of the world we might come short because of misunderstandings, hidden hierarchies and untrue facts. But on the other hand if we do not take in their descriptions and perspectives, their acts and thought can loose their meaning. Therefore, it is of importance to weight the results from the different interviews against each other (Gilje &Grimen 2007:171-209)

3.2 Material – TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica

TCG Nordica started because one Chinese woman and one Swedish woman realized that they shared the same dream: to create a place that would promote greater knowledge of their

respective cultures[5]. 2001 T Café/Gallery was opened but the business grew and 2002 TCG Nordica was opened[6]. TCG Nordica is an international art gallery and culture centre, China's first Sino-Scandinavian culture centre. It is located in Kunming, China, in the heart of the area Chuang Ku/LOFT, a closed down factory area that has turned into an artist community where about 30 Chinese artist have their studios[7]. At TCG Nordica's website TCG Nordica is described as a cross-cultural environment[8] and as a crossroad where East and West meets. TCG Nordica desires to facilitate multicultural understanding and exchange[9]. Through different kind of artistic activities "*new opportunities are created for people to learn more about themselves and others in the spirit of friendship, openness, respect and mutuality*"[10].

ArtsNordica is a network, responsible for developing international art and cultural exchange projects between the Nordic countries and TCG Nordica. It was created through all the relations and connections of all TCG Nordica's exchange project. ArtsNordica is now supporting TCG Nordica and is working as a bridge mainly between Chinese artists, institutions, TCG Nordica and its Scandinavian counterparts. ArtsNordica is trying to spread TCG Nordica's vision of "*Stimulating reflection on human worth as expressed in various Art Forms*"[11] to other countries, for examples Cambodia and Tunisia[12]. ArtsNordica's purpose is to provide "*a platform for dialogue and understanding across different cultures and belief systems, emphasizing human dignity, equality, respect and friendship*"[13]. On ArtsNordica's website one can read that they believe that "*one of the best ways to enhance communication between people and so break down culture and language barriers is through the Arts*"[14]

Over the years about a hundred Chinese artists have come to visit Sweden and over a hundred Swedish artists have come to visit China. To name a few artists: the Swedish poet Tomas Tranströmer (who constitutes the T in TCG Nordica), Tang Zhigang, Mao Xuhui, Maria Solheim, Poing , Stig Larsson, Pia Tafdrup, Linn Fernström, Anna Stake, Dan Fröberg and Laila Kongevold have visited TCG Nordica over the years. [15]

---

[5] URL: www.tcgnordica.com/about Date if access: 2009-06-14
[6] URL: www.artsnordica.com/index.php?page=484e7f377cc66&link_id=4832b53281249&lang_id=0 Date Of access: 2009-06-14
[7] URL: www.tcgnordica.com/about Date of access: 2009-06-14
[8] URL: http://www.tcgnordica.com/gallery/artist-in-residence-programme Date Of access: 2009-06-14
[9] URL: http://en.tcgnordica.com/about/culture-exchange/ Date of access: 2010-05-22
[10] URL: www.tcgnordica.com/about Date if access: 2009-06-14
[11] URL: www.tcgnordica.com/about Date if access: 2009-06-14
[12] Anna Mellergård, personal communication, June 10, 2009 and
URL: www.tcgnordica.com/artsnordica Date of access: 2009-06-14
[13] URL: http://www.tcgnordica.com/artsnordica Date of access: 2009-06-14
[14] URL: http://www.artsnordica.com/index.php?page=484e47055faa1&link_id=484523bfe94c4&lang_id=0 Date of access: 2009-06-14
[15] URL: www.tcgnordica.com/about Date if access: 2009-06-14

3.3 Selection

I made interviews with five people of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's personnel and five different kinds of artists that are involved in TCG Nordica's projects that have involved interaction with artist from another country and culture in one way or the other. The personnel working at TCG Nordica I chose according to their task in the organization.

TCG Nordica's manager and the other personnel helped me to get in contact with different artists. I have tried to find artists that have been involved in different kinds of projects, who work within different artistic expressions and with different genders. Regarding the gender aspect I did not really succeed; amongst the five artists there is only one male. From the beginning there were one other male interviewed but because of problems with the translation and the interpreter's interaction in the interview, which drastically decreased the interview's reliability. I chose not to use that interview. I was able to interview one dancer, one musician, one designer and two artists doing visual art. The thought was that I in this way would be able to get a bigger picture of TCG Nordica's work and the effects of it.

Even though I have two categories of people that I have interviewed there are no clear line between them. Some of the artists have worked at or been a volunteer at TCG Nordica. And some of the personnel are artists who have been involved in different projects. However, I have still chosen to keep these two categories because I have focused on different things in the different interviews.

I have chosen to write about art including various forms of art instead of just music, that is my main artistic field. This choice can be questioned, but I have several reasons for my chose. It would have been very hard to just focus on one of the artistic form at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica since its borders are not very clear. To listen to and talk about only the musician's part in a performance that is an improvisation between a musician and a dancer would be very hard and also not give a whole and truthful picture of what took place. The story would by no doubt be limping. Is the music composed to a visual artist's work placed in the folder named music or visual arts? In addition to this, as you will see below, a part of TCG Nordica's vision is to work with various art forms. This also motivates not separating art forms in this thesis. What support my decision further to talk about all the various art forms within a specific work of art or within art as a more general concept and not just for example music is, like I mentioned above, that according to Bakhtin, who constitute an important frame work in this thesis, *all* cultural phenomenon, for example a picture, a tone or a text, are based on the same principles as the communication.

I am aware of that there are many theories how to relate to and interpret art as a concept within the different art forms. To give all different art form's main theories an account in this thesis would not be possible considering its quantity.

3.4 Introductions of the personnel and artists

Personnel
Wu Yue Rong is one of the two founders of TCG Nordica in 1999. Today she is the manager and since 2006 when they established a Chinese company, she's also the owner of TCG

Nordica. Before she started to work with TCG Nordica she owned a store selling copyright CDs and established a music club.

Anna Mellergård is one of the two founders of TCG Nordica in 1999. 2002 she went back to Sweden. Hyllieparks Folkhögskola (Swedish) and Aeropagos (Norwegian and Danish) hired her to keep working with TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica, the network founded in 2006 as an international cultural coordinator. After studying literature and social anthropology at the University she took a degree within library science. She has been working with different kind of cultural projects.

Luo Fei worked at TCG Nordica the first time 2004 but then only for thee month. At that time he worked with the gallery together with other Chinese and Western personnel. In the end of 2006 Luo Fei has worked as a gallery director and curator at TCG Nordica. Moreover, he handles some management and design for the website. Luo Fei is an artist majoring in printmaking for examples woodcut when he was studying at the Art Institute. Already as a student he started to create exhibitions and work as a performance and video artist. After graduating he is worked for different organizations doing for example design.

Cheng Liangchun has been working at TCG Nordica for two and a half year and her main task is to plan and organize the stage activities. At the university she was majoring in wood carting. After graduating from the University she started working at TCG Nordica.

Jonathan Kearney is an artist from Great Britain. He moved to China for three years 2004 and got involved with working voluntarily with the gallery at TCG Nordica becoming a gallery director doing curating. Moreover, he was involved in some project as a practicing artist.

Artists

Liu Lifen is an artist doing mostly painting, performance and some collaboration with other artists. She was majoring in Chinese painting at the University. She worked six years at TCG Nordica with the stage, out of one year she was on an exchange in Sweden. She has been participating as an artist and organizing different art projects.

He Libin is an artist using many different art forms i.e. oil painting and device decoration. He is a friend of TCG Nordica and has participated in different events for example a solo exhibition, the HIV/AIDS project and en exhibition in Norway.

Wang Han is a designer in the Chuang Ku community and is painting and working with devices. She has been in TCG Nordica's exchange project "Protection Love".

Huang Shan is a musician, playing the Chinese instrument erhu. She has been a volunteer at TCG Nordica for almost six years and has participated in many different exchanges, collaborations and events.

Chen Jia is a dancer. 2003 she became a volunteer at TCG Nordica. She went to Sweden for a year as an exchange through TCG Nordica and after that she worked at TCG Nordica helping out with the stage. Now she describes herself as a friend of TCG Nordica's.

3.5 Interviews

When I interview the artists and the personnel I asked questions regarding their experience of the research questions presented in the introduction. Hence, the questions to the artists and the personnel differed some. The interviews were generally between one hour and one hour and forty minutes each.

When I interviewed the personnel at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica I used some quotes about their work expressed at their websites as a foundation from which my question sprung. After some introductory questions, I started by asking them about how they work, with whom and with what kind of art. I continued by deepen the understanding of their work by asking questions about their goals and purpose, expressed at their website: "…*providing a platform for dialogue and understanding across different cultures and belief systems, emphasizing human dignity, equality, respect and friendship"[16]*. In this way I got a better understanding of the framework for the ways that they have chosen to work. After that I asked questions about the cultural meeting and the cross-cultural environment that TCG Nordica describes itself to have. Further, I asked questions about how they use art as a way of communication based on the quote from their website explaining *"We believe that one of the best ways to enhance communication between people and so break down culture and language barriers is through the Arts"*[17]. I continued by asking questions about the effects that they see from their work when it comes to dialogue and understanding. After a more open question about what effects they have seen and experienced, I asked questions based on the effects Bakhtin describes takes place when dialogue takes place and the quote from TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's websites describing that through different kinds of artistic activities *"new opportunities are created for people to learn more about themselves and others in the spirit of friendship, openness, respect and mutuality"[18]*. Finally, I asked questions about what they find are TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's strengths, challenges and what can be developed. Creating the interview manuals I also used the thoughts within the theories of intercultural educatoin to create questions. I used the theories of Bakhtin and intercultural educatoin while creating the question manual. I used what these theories see as prerequisites, characteristics of and outcomes of dialogue and understanding and made questions that spring from that. With these questions I hope that I, through these people's experiences, will be able to understand more of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work and its effects regarding dialogue and understanding between people with different cultural backgrounds.

When I interviewed the artists connected to TCG Nordica I also used the quotes from TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's websites, thoughts from Bakhtin and thoughts from the theories of intercultural educatoin as a foundation out of which the questions spring. After some introduction questions, I started by asking them about what projects they have been involved in and how these were organized. After that I asked questions about how they have experienced the meeting with artists from other cultural backgrounds. I continued by asking questions about what effects they have experienced as an outcome of the projects. Further, I asked them about their thought on using art as a form of dialogue.

---

[16] URL: http://en.tcgnordica.com/artsnordica/ Date of access: 2009-06-14

[17] URL: http://www.artsnordica.com/index.php?page=484e47055faa1 Date of access: 2009-06-14

[18] URL: www.tcgnordica.com/about Date if access: 2009-06-14

I recorded all my interviews, which all the interviewed persons gave their approval to. During one of the interviews the recorder stopped working. However, since I took careful notes and documented the interview carefully the same day as the interview took place I cannot see any problems with the interview's reliability. During all interviews I took notes as a compliment to the recorder. I transcribed all the interviews carefully, except one passage in one interview where there was a longer passage that had no relevance for this thesis. After that I read through all the interviews and analyzed them according to the questions expressed in my purpose.

3.6 Reliability, validity and generalizable

Staffan Stukát illustrates the importance for discussing the thesis reliability, validity and generalizablity (Stukát 2005:125). Hence, the follow part discusses these concepts in relation to my thesis.

The fact that I have been working at TCG Nordica for circa half a year 2002/2003 is something that possibly can affect the reliability of this study. On the other hand, it is a strength in the way that it has opens up door for me and made this study possible. There is a possibility that my interpretation of TCG Nordica and their work have been influenced by the experiences and perceptions that I have from the last time that I was there. This might lead to that I take some things for granted, hold some things true, and are looking for specific things when I do my research. Before I left for China I thought there might be a problem with keeping the distance since I know some of the personnel at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica personally and that it might affect the quality of the research for the same reasons as mentioned above. Furthermore, there is a risk that I will influence them with my expectations. Though my experience during my stay in China was that I did not find it difficult to keep the distance. I explained my role carefully for the personnel at TCG Nordica in the beginning of my stay so everyone was aware of it, which I think helped a great deal.

The fact that TCG Nordica's manager and personnel was so kind to help me to get in contact with the people whom I interviewed constitutes a risk that the answers given will be shaped in the way that no one will offend any of the ones involved. None of the personnel have however been present during the interviews.

The fact that I am from Sweden and from another cultural background than the people I have interviewed includes a risk of misunderstandings. I might not read people and signals the right way. The fact that my Chinese is poor and I had to do the interviews in English or with an interpreter might also have lead to misunderstanding and wrong facts. There is also a greater risk that we have different pre-understandings of different concepts and words. For example Illman and Nynäs (2005) describes how the meaning of the concept of culture has developed differently in different nations and consequently might not have quite the same meaning that I intended when I use the word (also, see what is written about this papers hermeneutic character above) (Illman & Nynäs, 2005: 24)

Four times I had to use an interpreter. One of these interviews I have, as described above, chosen not to use because of problems with he translation and the interpreter's interference in the interview. The other interviews I found went very well. In two of these interviews the person interviewed knew some English and the interpreter was more like a support when needed.

Esaiasson et al. (2007) recommend making a tryout-interview (Esaiasson et al. 2007:302). I did so with one of the personnel that I considered to new on his position to be used in the study. I evaluated the interview and brought that experience with me when I started the interviews used in this study. Bo Johnsson and Per Olov Svedner state that an interview can be made as a qualitative interview (in contrast to a structured interview), where the areas of questions are decided but where the questions may vary "*…depending on how the interviewed respond and what aspects the interviewed brings up*" (Johansson & Svedner, 2006:43). The idea is to adjust the questions to the situation and the interviewed to get answers as exhaustive as possible. (Johansson & Svedner, 2006:43). Hence, I have used the interview manual as a foundation out of with I have made the interviews but have let the questions varied as described above. The areas for the questions have followed the description made above.

Most of the time I found that the interviews went very well. Sometimes the questions were interpreted in another way than I had intended. That was not always a bad thing, since that sometimes let to valuable information. When I felt that a question was misunderstood I tried to ask it again but in another way. In this way I think that the reliability have been secured.

My judgment is that this thesis validity is good. I have used the definitions and descriptions of dialogue and understanding from the theoretical framework that I have chosen to use to investigate my questions. Of course this study could have been done even bigger, I could have interviewed Scandinavian artists as well to get a more balanced picture, but the scope of this thesis did not allow that.

How generalizable is this thesis? This thesis only describes the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. It is hence not valid in other contexts. However, it can give thoughts and conclusions about how one might or might not be able to work through art to create dialogue and understanding between people with different cultural background that can be useful in other contexts. Johnsson and Svedner state that if the selection is made through personal connections the generalizability is somewhat weakened. I agree with this. However, I have found that the theoretical framework, which I use in the analysis, very useful in the study of increased dialogue and understanding in artistic collaborations. I have found the theories of Bakhtin and intercultural educatoin to be a useful combination. Since the result is analyzed on the basis of this theoretical framework is strengthens the conclusions generalizability.

3.7 Ethical Considerations

When I arrived I gave the personnel at TCG Nordica involved a letter explaining who I am, what my essay is about and how I had planed to do my research. This letter also consisted information about where the essay will be published, their right to say that they do not want to participate and their right to stop their participation up until the thesis has been published (for further information please see attachment). My though were that since they were the one who contacted the artist they needed the information. Now looking back I think I should have given the letter also to the artists personally. However, I did start each interview by informing the person I interviewed about who I am, what my thesis is about and the method I am using.

From an aspect of confidentiality it is important to write that I have chosen not to keep the people I have interviewed anonymous. This because I believe that it would have made it almost impossible to present the results from the interview. Since there are no other or very

few Sino-Scandinavian culture centers located in China it would not had been hard for any one who wanted to figure out where the research was made. Since the personnel I have interviewed have different tasks it would not have been hard to figure out who had said what in many questions. If I would have kept the artists anonymity I could not have revealed anything about what projects they have been involved in, how it had been organized and about the artists work. This would have lead to that it would had been easy to trace who might have been the interviewed artist. Hence, I have chosen to write out their names and identity in the thesis. All the interviewed persons have been asked about this and have given their approval.

4 RESULTS AND ANALYSIS

I have chosen to present the result and the analysis in the same chapter. The result and the analysis will be presented in relation to the research questions presented in the introduction. Each question will be analyzed according to different aspects.

4.1 – In what way TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work to increase dialogue and understanding between artists with different cultural backgrounds.

In this part I start with a short presentation of some facts about TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica from the result of the interviews, which lay a foundation for what will be presented and analyzed further on. Consequently, the first part, "The work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica", only contain results from the interviews. I continue by analyzing the vision of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. Further, I analyze in what way TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica can constitute a platform for the inner persuasive dialogue. After that we go on by analyzing the roles and approaches of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica often work with themes for their projects. Therefore, we discuss this method.

4.1.1 The work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica
Here I present some basic facts about how TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work, whom they include in their activities, what art they chose to include and who visits TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's events. Moreover, I present a few projects arranged by TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica.

How does ArtsNordica and TCG Nordica work?
Anna Mellergård illustrates how ArtsNordica works. Their work is wide, including stage, music, dance and poetry, however, they have an emphasis on visual art and work with exhibitions. She explains that they often do something more of it then just letting one or a few artists exhibit their work. Often they have a theme, gather a group of artists from China and Scandinavia that together work out an exhibition.

Luo Fei describes the the work of the gallery at TCG Nordica in two parts; one part is exhibitions and events and the other part is art exchange including for example their artist in residence program. Artists apply for the artist in residence program to come to TCG Nordica and work in their studio, live in their apartment and possibly do a project with some local artist. He explains that there are one or two art exchange projects between Scandinavian and local Chinese artist every year. Jonathan Kearney and Luo Fei explain that they are a team of people working with the gallery; Chinese staff and one or a few students/volunteers. Jonathan Kearney illustrates that, when he worked at TCG Nordica, they generally had a new exhibition each month; about ten or eleven exhibitions a year. The exhibitions would either be a Chinese or a foreign artist who had applied to do an exhibition, however, if it is a foreign artist who had the exhibition more likely she/he was an artist in residence who ended her/his stay with an exhibition. In the gallery, Luo Fei explains, they show almost all kinds of art for example paintings, installations, videos, sculptures, design works and digital work. Jonathan Kearney contends that he can think of examples of just about anything for examples sculpture, oil painting, video and sound.

Cheng Liangchun describes that the stage work includes both different kind of performances and different projects. She describes that the stage is working with music of different kind for example folk music, classical music, jazz, popular music, Chinese and western music. They also work with drama, dance, movies and poetry.

Now when we have established the foundation for TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work, let us clarify who is involved at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica as an artist and, further, how they decide what art to include.

Who and what does TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica include in their activities?
Wu Yue Rong explains that the artists they chose to include in their activities are divided into three levels, within which they have different activities. The first level is the professional level. When they work with artists on this level they usually are happy to cooperate with for example the University in Kunming to organize some academic activities, for example a master class or a lecture. On this level they can work with different exchange programs at the University and TCG Nordica. The second level contains educated young people that have not yet reached that level of maturity as an artist, however, they are on their way to develop. TCG Nordica helps these young artists to meet with a mature artist circle, both from China and Scandinavia. In this way they can go through TCG Nordica's platform to connect with some professional artists in their own area. Wu Yue Rong explains that, instead of letting them have a performance or an exhibition, they often involve them in their international exchange program. In that way they get to go abroad for different exchanges and get to meet professional artists from Scandinavia. Cheng Liangchun describes that they want to help the young artists to improve, support them, give them space, opportunity and freedom to create. Wu Yue Rong describes that the third level contain people that are interested in the Arts, some of them have an education of different levels in another major than the Arts, however, they have the heart to develop. TCG Nordica gives this group a chance to be involved and together with other artists gain and develop their confidence through different activities within the various art forms.

Anna Mellergård describes that ArtsNordica works with two levels and talks about the two first levels described above; the professional level and the young artists. Moreover, Anna Mellergård explains that she thinks the dialogue is more interesting when people know where they are standing then if they are insecure and unsure. Thus, it is good if at least some of the participants in a project are mature, know who they are and what they think.

Luo Fei explains that TCG Nordica believes that the human being have a value, that there is a positive meaning of life and art. According to this they are very open to build, show and invite to a platform where artists can show their work. Both Cheng Liangchun and Luo Fei describe that they needs to choose artworks and to do that the value of the human being is the standard; if the artwork could encourage people to think about their value, dreams or original value of human being, something beautiful and meaningful. The art exchange is mostly between Scandinavian and Chinese artist but sometimes they also include artist from Cambodia or other Asian countries. Luo Fei describes that some exhibitions are made by female artists, some by male artist, some by artist with different genders, some by art students and some by children. TCG Nordica is not a place only for professional and well-known artists, art collectors or VIP people, it's a place for everyone, Luo Fei illustrates.

Jonathan Kearney explains that when they choose which artists they included in TCG Nordica's gallery they made a value judgment of the quality of the work rather then who the artist was, so they ended up exhibiting a wide range of people.

We will continue by exploring who is visiting TCG Nordica as a visitor. The visitors are not a target group in this thesis, however, they create the environment that the investigated collaborations and projects take place. Hence, I find it relevant to make a shorter presentation of the visitors.

Who visits TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica?
Wu Yue Rong illustrates that she believes that about 80% of the visitors at TCG Nordica is high-educated people mostly between 20 and 50 years old. Luo Fei describes how the visitors are mostly artists, art teacher, art students or friends from artists and others. Cheng Liangchun explain that TCG Nordica is open to everyone to come visit, however, it is mostly students, musicians, artists and other people working in an office that comes to TCG Nordica.

Anna Mellergård explains that the visitors that come to ArtNordica's event is mostly the interested public and others that are working with art like culture workers, artists, musicians, authors, teachers at the university and students. She explains that their target group is students, artists and people with an academic degree; the educated middle class. However, she appreciates if a less common visitor would come to visit.

Projects
The interviewees have described a lot of different project, collaborations and exchanges during the interviews. They have been of various kind and size. Below I have chosen to present a few of the bigger project. I have chosen these for two reasons. First, because they are referred to later in this analysis and, second, because they are good examples of how TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work.

Lui Lifen and Wu Yue Rong describes that the project Sugar and Salt included five artists from China and five artists from Europe. The artists were of different kinds, for example a journalist, a sculptor, a musician, artists within literature, young artists and an interpreter. The project was in two parts; first they met two weeks in Kunming and the second part happened in Sweden a year later. The first half-week, during the first part held in China, they played different games together and tried to get to know each other. After three days they started to play with the material, sugar and salt. In the second week they started to work. Liu Lifen explains that the leader of the project tried to help them to think, but she did not really teach them what to do. The second part of the project was held in Malmö, Sweden. They continued to play with the material for example played with the salty ocean water and went to the forest to record different sounds. In the end they had an exhibition where they showed the work they had done.

Anna Mellergård describes how TCG Nordica arranged a music festival in 2005. Parallel to the festival they had a music and dance project, where young artists joined, for example as an opening band. Furthermore, there was a dialogue between the Chinese and Swedish young musicians. Huang Shan participated in this young musician exchange project, and describes that it included five Swedish and five Chinese young musicians. First, the Swedes went to China for two weeks and then, in the second part, the Chinese came to Sweden for three weeks. They played some Chinese music and Yunnan Folk music.

Anna Mellergård describes a poetry festival arranged in 2004. The festival included both Nordic and Chinese poets. Anna Mellergård explains that it was extra tricky when it is poetry since it is based on the language, in this case English, Chinese and Nordic languages. However, she describes that ArtsNordica tried to make it possible for them to meet. During the festival they also had a youth project parallel, including young artists that had not been published. The young poets got a chance to meet the professional poets, which were some of the Nordic countries' top poets.

Anna Mellergård describes that they have had three connected projects called Sustainable love, Protection love and Contagious love. Wang Han describe the project Love Protection. The project was in two parts, one in China and one in Sweden. It included five artists and designers from Sweden and five from China. None of them had cooperated before and they were from different backgrounds, belief systems and had different ages. Before they met they kept in contact over the Internet. They had all gotten the theme and had started to work. Wang Han explains that they had gotten work to do together to try different materials. Thus, both groups emailed and sent pictures telling the other group what they were doing. Then the Swedish group came and brought the work they had done in Sweden. In China they had a workshop together where the aim was more to try out things that to create a piece of art. The first part ended with an exhibition held at TCG Nordica. The second part was held in Sweden. The groups had once again prepared in their own countries and this time the Chinese artists and designers brought their work to Sweden, where they continued to work together in a studio. They had a workshop where they all went to a silver studio to do different things. Moreover, they went to many museums and exhibitions together. During this second part they held one exhibition in Örebro and one in Mariannelund in Sweden.

2006 TCG Nordica had a HIV/AIDS project as a part of the project Contagious Love. Luo Fei describes that they brought some artists, poets, people working with literature, and scholars together to let them know more about the HIV/AIDS situation in China and, further, what is going on with HIV/AIDS in Africa and in other parts of the world. Wu Yue Rong describes how TCG Nordica arranged some education for the artists from some doctors/professors within the subject. The artists got a chance to meet with organizations that work with HIV/AIDS related issues. Moreover, Jonathan Kearney and Luo Fei describes that the project included a trip with a group of artists from the LOFT to a village to the border of Burma where about 90% of the people were drug addicts. They shared needles and in that way HIV/AIDS spread very rapidly. Lou Fei describes that the group went there to live together with HIV/AIDS positive people to know how they live, what kind of help they need and what kind of support they could use. Jonathan Kearney describes that the visit was mostly for education, they had had a series of lectures about the disease, but they also did a small art project at the place.

After having presented these basic facts about TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica we continue to look closer at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's vision, that constitute a foundation for their work. From now on the result and the analysis on the basis of the theoretical framework will coexist.

4.1.2 Analysis of TCG Nordica and Arts Nordica's vision

The vision of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica :
"Stimulating reflection on human worth as expressed in various art forms".

Anna Mellergård explains how they choose to work with different themes to help people to reflect on the human being's value. With Bakhtin and Vygotsky's word maybe one could say that one wants to create an intermental dialogue through the intramental dialogue, through the artwork and collaborations at TCG Nordica. Anna Mellergård gives the exhibition China Girl, Sustainable Love, Protection Love, Contagious Love, the HIV/AIDS project and the Logbook as examples. The exhibition China Girl is working with the fact that a lot of Chinese girls disappear and dealing with men and women's, each individual's, equal value based on the fact that we are human beings. The three connected project Sustainable Love, Protection Love and Contagious Love were about different ways of responsibility and what love means for us; what we put into that word. The HIV/AIDS project was a part of the Contagious Love project, and was working with the equal value and life of HIV/AIDS positive people. Logbook, reflecting the everyday life of the Scandinavian and Chinese women involved. The artist had a dialogue where they sent pictures and texts to each other and then they met and had one exhibition in Sweden and one exhibition in China. Anna Mellergård explains that through this one can see different values and see one's own values. Luo Fei also gives the HIV/AIDS project as an example of how the gallery is emphasizing human dignity in their work. Cheng Liangchun states that TCG Nordica can lead people to think about what human dignity really is. She explains that she thinks most Chinese people has not really thought about it, and explains that she herself had not when she started at TCG Nordica.

The personnel explain how this vision makes the standard through which they decide what artwork to include at TCG Nordica. Anna Mellergård describes that the theme is wide but still gives some guidelines and directions to their work and, moreover, it helps them to reflect on what they are doing. Anna Mellergård explains that the human being's value is interpreted both as human rights but also on a more existential level. This corresponds with Wu Yue Rong's description that they have chosen to highlight human dignity, human rights and human worth. She explains that they want different people to come to TCG Nordica to connect and to combine their differences. Luo Fei describes that they want the artwork to encourage people to think about their value, dreams or original value of the human being, something beautiful and meaningful.

This is the foundation out of which TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work. We can clearly see that their aim is to create a dialogue between different people where their differences can be combined. This corresponds with both Bakhtin and intercultural educatoin's statements that differences are needed for dialogue to take place. Furthermore, their value creates a foundation for people to deal with important questions. This is in accordance with Johansson's understanding of the importance of dealing with the bigger life questions together. Hence, the vision creates a foundation out of which otherness and stereotypes can be fought. I do not state that the vision automatically implies a reduction or repeal of the dichotomies and stereotypes, however, it creates a useful foundation for the work to increase dialogue and understanding. These matters will be discussed further on in this chapter.

Now, we continue by exploring in that way TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work with art to increase dialogue and understanding.

4.1.3 Art as a dialogue in itself and as a reason and a springboard for dialogue

At ArtsNordica's websites we can read the following quote: "*We believe that one of the best ways to enhance communication between people and to break down culture and language barriers is through the Arts*". Through my study of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work I have found that art is used in two different ways: as a dialogue in itself and as a reason and a springboard for conversation. By expressing oneself, reflecting a certain theme through ones art, creating together, viewing/listening to each other's work and so forth, art is used as a dialogue. The other aspect, art as a reason or a springboard for conversation, is taking shape in the face-to-face meetings taking place at or through TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica between the artists and, moreover, between anyone who visits TCG Nordica.

Art as a dialogue in itself
In what way can art constitute a dialogue and increase understanding between people with different cultural backgrounds? We can express ourselves in different ways: through a word but also through art. In the same way as, according to Bakhtin, a word, a sentence or a book can constitute an utterance, I contend that a tone, a fraise, a movement, an exhibition, a concert or a choreography constitutes an utterance. This is strengthened by Bakhtin's theory that all cultural phenomenons, including art, are based on the same principles as communication. Consequently, the art is a tool for mediation.

According to Bakhtin, the thought takes shape in the dialogue and is not merely an expression. Consequently, in the artistic creative process the thought takes shape rather than merely being an expression for what someone wants to mediate. In that way, art and its creative process can help us to perceive and comprehend ourselves, our feelings and our thoughts. According to Bakhtin, there is Outsideness, required for dialogue to take place, between the artist and the art. Chen Jia explains that sometimes she cannot express what she is feeling in words, even in Chinese, however, she can feel it exactly on stage. Her experience is that then people understand. Here we can see how her feelings, thoughts and message are mediated through her dance. Moreover, we can see how the thought, or in this case feeling, is not only being expressed but also shaped in the dance. This is clear in Chen Jia's statement that when she is on state she can feel exactly what it is she is feeling.

The art can be a meeting place for many different voices in different ways. First, the art is a tool for mediation, as stated above. Through the art we mediate our feelings, message, questions and so forth. Here the dialogue takes place between the artist and the audience, the addressee. Second, the art can constitute different voices by being polyphone; being dialogical and allowing other voices and perspectives to coexist and struggle. Third, the tools and materials we use to create art, for example a brush or a musical instrument, are also mediating in the sense that they carry traditions, values, cultures and so forth. Thus, these tools are constituted by former voices, which have formed value, tradition, culture, context and so forth. He Libin and Luo Fei both give examples of how the tools carry values, cultures, traditions and so forth that we recognize and interpret in different ways. Luo Fei describes that they had written poems of Thomas Tranströmer on long white paper that was hanging from the ceiling at TCG Nordica during an exhibition. The Westerners thought is was beautiful while the Chinese people asked if someone had died since this reminded them of a Chinese tradition taking place when someone has passed away. He Libin describes how the Eastern influences in a Swedish artist's art, made him feel close to the art. This can be perceived as an example of how the symbols carry culture and understanding that communicate to us and that we recognize.

Bakhtin states that the borders of who says what in a dialogue are not clear since what is said is shaped by former voices but also by the expected response. Chen Jia's description of a collaboration she had with a Japanese guitar player is a good example of this. She explains how they improvise together and how they both follow each other. If they both follow each other, give and take impulses, would any of them alone be able to take credit for the outcome? Would it be possible to divide the performance into pieces depending on whom of them it was who created that specific part? Of course not! The performance is created together, the dialogue takes place in the moment and they are both senders and receivers at the same time. This illustrates Bakhtin's statement that the borders of who says what in a dialogue, here taking shape in how the borders are vague of who creates, or mediates, what in an artistic collaboration.

In the tension of taking in both the artist's contextual and individual level, following Bakhtin, I contend that there is a possibility for a fruitful meeting that can lead to dialogue and understanding. If art can carry both the artist's context and her/his individuality there is a potential to see the differences as well as the similarities, both on an individual level and a contextual level. Through the individual level we can recognize ourselves and perceive the other as a "you" instead of an "it", using Buber's terminology, and therein lies possibilities of increased understanding and friendships. Through the individual level there is a possibility to recognize the humanity that connect us. Thus, there is a possibility to perceive the other as the same but different that, according to Lorentz and Bergstedt, implicates a potential of perceiving the other as different but equal.

Art as a reason and a springboard for dialogue
Luo Fei describes that when there is an exhibition, art event, workshop, or some other cultural event people can meet and dialogue face to face. Luo Fei describes how the gallery often arranges a meeting or a discussion in relation to an exhibition mostly including artists, personnel and possibly also students. Sometimes the artist holds a workshop or the artist is invited to English Corner, discussion evenings in English. Moreover, the gallery sometimes arranges seminars or lectures at the university in relation to an exhibition. According to Luo Fei, all these are to support the dialogue. Another example is how TCG Nordica, during the HIV/AIDS project, arranged some education and arranged a trip to go visit a village where HIV/AIDS positive people lived.

Luo Fei states that the artists always find a starting-point for dialogue. Luo Fei describes that if, for example, the gallery shows a Swedish or Norwegian artist, the local artists will come and look. Since the artists have different "systems and art educational background" they always find something fresh, that is different from their tradition, for example some special material. The visiting artist will find the casts and the artists and start to talk to them about the art, how they think about it, how they use the material, how life is in Sweden and so forth.

Luo Fei describes how a group of students, who visited the exhibition "Inscape on the spot", sat down and asked some questions. Luo Fei describes how they were not talking about the art pieces, but things that were related to the theme or the topic of the art. The pieces reminded them to think about landscapes around the world and they would raise questions about for example the destruction of the landscapes. This corresponds with Jonathan Kearney's statement that strong visual images can open a space for questions that can lead to dialogue.

Luo Fei describes that after the cultural events some of the artists or the audience and TCG Nordica keep building relationships so that they can be friends, cooperate and the dialogue can continue even after the art event.

According to Bakhtin, it is in the response understanding and meaning comes to fruition. As described in the theoretical framework, response can take shape in many different ways. By creating forums and by supporting the dialogue that spring from the art or the artistic project TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica enhance the internalization, the complex process between the intramental and the intermental level described by Vygotsky. Furthermore, the participants are given the opportunity to encounter with more perspectives by discussing their thoughts and experiences with others. In other words, they encounter not only with the voices within the art. Through these discussions, in accordance with the theories of intercultural educatoin and Bakhtin, there is a potential for the participants to see their own standpoint clearer as well as create an understanding for other perspectives.

Consequently, we can see how art is used in two different ways at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. In the part above, analyzing in what way art is used as a dialogue in itself, we can see in what way Bakhtin's theory are applicable in this artistic context. Further, we can see that it corresponds with the interviewees' experiences. In the part analyzing in what way art is used as a reason and a springboard for dialogue we can see that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica organize different activities, for example workshops, lectures, discussions and meeting to support the dialogue between people. Further, we can see that Luo Fei describes that the artists and visitors often find something to have a dialogue about, either about the art or about issues or questions that spring from the art.

These two perspectives, art as a dialogue and art as a springboard and reason for dialogue, are discussed even further below when we investigate the effects of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work.

4.1.4 TCG Nordica as a platform for the inner persuasive dialogue

I contend that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica can be seen as a platform for this inner persuasive dialogue to take place. Through my study I have found that this takes shape in a few different ways: the cross-cultural environment of TCG Nordica, the structure of TCG Nordica and, finally, the approach of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. These different aspects will be analyzed below.

A cross-cultural environment
TCG Nordica is described as a cross-cultural environment. The personnel illustrate that they want people with different cultural backgrounds, different ethnicities, different theories of life and different belief systems at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. Wu Yue Rong states that they want different people to meet and combine their differences. She wants people to feel free to express who they are, what they believe and their struggles through TCG Nordica. She contends that we as human beings are equal; we have the same struggles and the same dignity. Anna Mellergård states that it does not have to be dangerous to find out that we are different; there are also many things that unite us. This corresponds well with the understanding within the theories of intercultural educatoin that one of the foundations, for the work to create interaction and understanding between different people, is the recognition that human beings are different yet the same. Both Bakhtin and the theories of intercultural educatoin describe differences as a prerequisite for dialogue and understanding to take place.

Bakhtin states that it is in the encounter with the other's perspective and in the struggle between different voices that meaning, understanding and self-consciousness can take place. The description above gives evidence of the aspiration among the personnel to create a platform where different voices can exist and where the struggle and tension between the voices are allowed. The willingness to let people express who they are, what they believe and questions they struggle with indicates that the inner persuasive dialogue, which allows questions, ambiguity, doubts, exchange and objection, may have a platform at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. This corresponds with Wang Han's experience from her participation in the project Contagious Love where she describes how the participants had different cultures, ages, backgrounds and religions.

Moreover, the personnel describe other aspects of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica as a cross-cultural environment. Luo Fei describes that the staff and volunteers comes from both Scandinavia and China. Anna Mellergård describes that the cross-cultural environment also can be referred to that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work with various kinds of art forms. Jonathan Kearney contends that the simple fact that foreign and Chinese artists exhibit in the same space and the fact that foreigners come to TCG Nordica create a cross-cultural environment. Further, TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica include different voices in the sense of artistic level of the participants. They work with professionals, young artists and other people that are interested in art. These aspects help to strengthen and maintaining the diversity at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. Hence, we can see that TCG Nordica does not only perceive cross-culturalism as a meeting between two static cultural belongings, for example Chinese and Scandinavian. Instead, it is describes as an encounter and a crosscutting of many different possible cultural belongings that correspond with the hybrid identities described in the theoretical framework.

In this context Huang Shan makes an important statement. She emphasizes the importance of whom one is cooperating with. She explains that some instruments do not work as good together as others. Hence, it makes a big difference what instruments one chose to be cooperating in an ensemble. We have already stated that the instruments constitute a tool for mediation; they are carrying and mediating tradition and culture. Consequently, the constellation of instruments in the ensemble is reflecting the cross-culturalism described above. Huang Shan states that TCG Nordica should collaborate with the musicians in the process of choosing ensembles. From this perspective the cross-cultural environment should have some restrictions; the rule "the more diverse the better" is not valid here. Huang Shan's statement can be related to Thorsén assertion that there is a risk that the music is only useful when is has gone incomprehensible, robed from its context and meaning. In other words, if one is not considering the instruments character and role when the ensembles are determined, there is a risk to loose the meaning and comprehensibility of the different music traditions represented in the ensemble. However, from another perspective, Cheng Liangchun describes that when they have mixed musicians with different styles, they create a new style together. Huang Shan's describe how collaborations through TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica have helped her to think outside her own frames and become more open. This strengthens the perspective of being in new constellations of instruments. Therefore, I see a need of balancing these two sides; on one hand collaborate with the musicians about which instruments that they know fit together and on the other hand experiment with what happens if a new and unusual setting comes together.

Discussing the cross-culturalism Liu Lifen and He Libin both make a valuable assertion. They both suggest that TCG Nordica should get even more open when it comes to whom they

involve. Liu Lifen contends that TCG Nordica could be more open and not be limited to collaborations with the universities they have. She suggests that, instead of choosing artists through their connections, they should have an open call and let everyone know of it. In that way, she states, they can also get more independent artists. He Libin suggests that TCG Nordica involve Chinese artists that are not only from Yunnan, but rather from different parts of China. He states that in that way TCG Nordica will be able to influence people more widespread. He contends that, as far as he knows, there are different art communities in China with different styles. All these styles together can sum up the Chinese culture, but artists just from Yunnan cannot stand for Chinese culture. According to this perspective, TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica can work to further increase the diversity of voices represented within their activities.

According to Bakhtin, an artwork has to be understood in relation to the author's epoch and culture. However, if we stop there we might miss many important new values, meanings and treasures in the work. Every new epoch or culture will, from its context, find new meanings within the work, and will in that way free the work from its own context. A literature work stands in relation to its past and owns treasures from past times, treasures that will be found within new contexts and new epochs. If this is true, it means both that the artwork, in these collaborations, have to be understood in relation to the artist's cultural background and context, but also that people from another cultural background, that is often part of the artistic collaborations, can find new treasures within the artwork. Luo Fei's illustrate this by expressing that maybe the foreign artist's artwork just looks beautiful in its own culture, however, the artists in China can find something new in it. The "treasures" of the artwork will then be different depending on who is looking at it and what it means to him/her. In this way, the meeting and collaboration between the Scandinavian and Chinese artists can create a deeper and wider understanding of the work. Consequently, the responses within the cross-cultural environment at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica can give the artist new perspectives on oneself and one's creation. An important question to ask in this context is if there cannot also be misunderstandings based on that the artwork is created in another cultural context. An example of this is Luo Fei's description of how the Chinese visitors at TCG Nordica thought that someone had died because of the white papers with poems written on them hanging from the ceiling, as described above. Can the artwork not be totally misunderstood, or maybe even become ridiculous in another context? How can we have any guarantee that a new context, culture or epoch will find new *positive* treasures in the artwork and not see it as laughable or totally misunderstand it, maybe even find it offensive? Maybe it is as Liu Lifen describes, that one can need some time to understand, and sometimes even to like, someone else's work. Through the interaction through the art and within the projects, there lies a potential for a dialogue that creates a possibility to further understand each other. Luo Fei describes that when they have an exhibition they have an introduction and/or have some short written introductions next to the art pieces that the visitors can read. This can be one way to prevent the work to be misunderstood or viewed as ridiculous. In this way, the artwork can be understood in dialogic relation between the new contexts' point of view and the artist's point of view. This corresponds with Bakhtin's theory of not perceiving the art through only one of those aspects.

TCG Nordica's structure
TCG Nordica's different departments support the dialogue between these different voices. Wu Yue Rong describes that TCG Nordica has five different parts: gallery, stage, restaurant and lately they have added one sector working with tourism and one sector working with cultural education. The cultural education department offers opportunities to both foreigner and

Chinese people to learn various cultural things according to the vision of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. The tourism department is to help the financial part of TCG Nordica.

Both Luo Fei and Jonathan Kearney describe how TCG Nordica's different parts together create a platform. The different cultural events take place in the same space. Luo Fei describes that since the space does not only include a gallery, it means that there will be a concert and other cultural events happening during the exhibitions. Luo Fei contends that the artists accept that and find that it gives more meaning to their work and that it gives more opportunities for dialogue. Furthermore, it affects the other events by creating an atmosphere. According to Bakhtin, a dialogue can take place between two pieces of art. By letting the cultural events exist in the same space increase the possibility of letting more voices co-exist and participate in the dialogue.

Luo Fei, Wu Yue Rong and Jonathan Kearney all describe the value of having a restaurant at TCG Nordica where people can sit down and talk. Xiao Rong contends that when people pay interest in different cultural work and in the meaning of the human being, they need a place to sit down together and share their lives. Luo Fei and Jonathan Kearney both describe how the restaurant creates possibilities for dialogue and reflection. Furthermore, it creates a possibility to invite people to have a dialogue with the artist or with people from another culture. In this way, TCG Nordica increases the possibilities for the face-to-face dialogue to take place between different people.

Approach
Anna Mellergård describes how she thinks one has to stand up for the values and beliefs one has, but to respect other opinions as well. Anna Mellergård continues on by stating that one is trying to lift the opinion one has, not give a lecture or preach one's opinion but to work with the question together, often in an artistic way through an art project. This statement indicates an understanding and willingness to work for an openness for different voices to be allowed to struggle within TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work. Further, we can see that the aim is not to find consensus by preaching for others but to lift one's voice and one's point of view.

Consequently, we can see that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work as a platform for the inner persuasive dialogue. The aspiration for a cross-cultural environment of people with different cultural backgrounds, ethnicities, with different theories of life, different belief systems and with different artistic levels creates a foundation for the inner persuasive dialogue to take place. Although, since not all constellation might be fruitful, it is important to find a balance of the diversity. Liu Lifen and He Libin contends that TCG Nordica can open up even more when it comes to what artists they invite to their projects. Finally, we can see that letting an artwork be perceived of another culture constitute both possibilities and risks. Hence, it is important to balance the individuality of the artist and the context she/he come from. Moreover, we can see that the structure of TCG Nordica enhances the dialogue by having different cultural events within the same space. Further, the restaurant is an important factor for dialogue to take place. Finally, Anna Mellergård describes an openness towards differences and the importance of standing up for oneself.

During the interview with Huang Shan she repeatedly describes how she has tried things for the first time at TCG Nordica; first time she played only with a vocalist, first time she tried gospel music and first time she cooperated with dancers. I contend that this is an indication of an openness from TCG Nordica's side that allows people to try new things. Bakhtin describes

how it is important to be allowed to try new things within the inner persuasive dialogue. Consequently, Huang Shan's description indicates that TCG Nordica constitutes a platform for the inner persuasive dialogue.

Perhaps what is written above can be summed up in this quote form ArtsNordica's website:

>*"ArtsNordica is a network established with the purpose of providing a*
>*platform for dialogue and understanding across different cultures and belief*
>*systems, emphasizing human dignity, equality, respect and friendship'."*

This quote does not only tell us that ArtsNordica strive for a diversity of cultures and belief systems. It also describes that ArtsNordica emphasizes human dignity, equality, respect and friendship. These areas, along with a few other areas, that are presented below, are discussed in the following part.

4.1.5 TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's roles and approaches

The follow quote can be read at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's website:

>*"New opportunities are created for people to learn more about themselves and*
>*others in the spirit of friendship, openness, respect and mutuality."*

These two quotes above bring up different aspects emphasized in the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica: human dignity, equality, respect, friendship, openness and mutuality. These aspects are analyzed below. Furthermore, TCG Nordica is described as a bridge by the interviewees. Hence, this is also analyzed below.

Openness
Many times during the interviews, "openness" was brought up in relation to TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. Wu Yue Rong and Anna Mellergård both describe the importance of openness. Wu Yue Rong explain that since the world and people are changing it is very important to be open, listen to each other, reshape the projects and to be creative when organizations are working together. Anna Mellergård describes that one needs to be open both to others' worlds and to changes in one's own way of thinking and perceiving things.

Cheng Liangchun describes how TCG Nordica has an open approach as an organization. She describes that when they are organizing something, everyone brings their ideas and mix them together, focusing on what is best for the project. This corresponds with Jonathan Kearney's description of how Wu Yue Rong has an open approach and creates a dialogue with the personnel as a group, something that he states is unusual in a Chinese context. He contends that TCG Nordica's start, through the connection of Wu Yue Rong and Anna Mellergård, is the foundation of TCG Nordica. They have a deep friendship between them so they show human dignity, equality, respect and friendship, which is the foundation.

Cheng Liangchun describes that the stage is working with various forms of art and that they are open for different ideas and are willing to listen. This correspond with Chen Jia's experience of how TCG Nordica always is open and that she has been able to do what she

wants there. Cheng Liangchun describes how they give the participants clear frames, however, they give them freedom to work within these frames. She describes that they talk to the artist about the purpose and organization of the project. Further, if the participants have an idea they can talk to each other. TCG Nordica gives them space to create as long as the artistic performance corresponds with TCG Nordica's vision. Wang Han support this approach by expressing the importance for TCG Nordica to have an open attitude; to allow artists to communicate and inspire each other and to give the artists some freedom. Then, she contends, something just happens.

TCG Nordica as a bridge
TCG Nordica is described as a bridge, mainly in two different ways. Luo Fei illustrates that TCG Nordica often work as a bridge connecting people, groups and many other different parts, for example the university, the government, organizations and communities. Luo Fei explains that it can be about introducing one friend of TCG Nordica to another friend. TCG Nordica then works as a bridge to connect people and initiates communication. Furthermore, being a bridge can be about facilitating communication by explaining and clearing up misunderstandings. Luo Fei explains that during the collaborations TCG Nordica is trying to explain the cultural differences and how people think, because there are often misunderstandings. Cheng Liangchun describes how TCG Nordica is trying to support the collaborations by being in the middle and trying to help from there. If a problem arises she illustrates that they talk to the participants directly. She explains that they cannot tell them exactly what they should do, however, they can tell them which part they should work on. Wu Yue Rong describes how TCG Nordica has to go in and explain and help out when there have been misunderstandings. She illustrates that the challenge in working with different cultures is how TCG Nordica can help the participants to understand and to open their mind to another culture, another thinking, value or belief. Anna Mellergård describes that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica help if the preparation process within the Chinese group does not go forward before the meeting with the Scandinavian group (see further below). He Libin also describes TCG Nordica as a bridge. This corresponds with the intercultural educatoin's description of the teacher, in this case the leader, as a coach or mentor rather than someone who is telling the other how things should be. Further, Cheng Liangchun describe that that during the process of working with various kinds of young artists, TCG Nordica learn something from them and at the same time the young artists get influenced by TCG Nordica. This corresponds with the description of how the teacher, or leader, within the theories of intercultural educatoin, as someone who is taking part in different knowledge and learning processes. Further this indicates openness from TCG Nordica's side to be in a process of development and change.

Wu Yue Rong, Luo Fei and Cheng Liangchun all talks about that there is a third culture at TCG Nordica, a mix of the Chinese and the Swedish culture. Wu Yue Rong describes that, after many years of interacting, learning and conflicts, TCG Nordica has a third culture that is constituted by neither totally Scandinavian nor Chinese thinking and understanding. Hence, they can, as a bridge, help totally different cultures to meet each other. Cheng Liangchun and Luo Fei strengthen Wu Yue Rong's description by explaining that you cannot only use the Chinese or the Scandinavian way. Cheng Liangchun explains that when you work at TCG Nordica you learn how to cooperate with foreigners, how they work, how to treat people and some of their background. She explains that it is often the small things that makes a difference and give the example of how Chinese greet each other by saying "Have you eaten?" and foreign people can find that rude and that is not someone else's business.

Mutuality
Anna Mellergård emphasizes the importance that it is a mutual exchange. She describes that they are emphasizing that it is not a group of Swedish artists coming to China with an idea that they will run and take responsibility for. When the project is located in China, the Chinese artists are responsible and vise versa. She contends that this is important, because in the practical area other things can be reflected. She contends that it is important that the whole group, both Scandinavians and Chinese, take a mutual responsibility for the consequences, good or bad, and that there is a mutual respect in the group. This corresponds with Bakhtin's description of mutual trust and respect as a prerequisite for dialogue to take place. Furthermore, Anna Mellergård's description corresponds with Liu Lifen's story of the Sugar and Salt project. She describes that when they were in China she was responsible for a lot of the practical things, for example buying the material, invite people to the opening and help the Swedish people with trips, shopping and so on. However, she found it hard to be a participating artist when she also was responsible for all those things. Anna Mellergård's description above is more about an interpersonal level, how we view each other as human beings and how that is reflected in the organization. Liu Lifen's states that her experience is that she was treated equal in the group during the project. Liu Lifen's experience described above is more of a practical problem.

Within the post-colonial and post-structural theory the binary dichotomies, through which we perceive and reshape the world, imply a hierarchic relationship. Hence, there is a risk in these collaborations to imply a hierarchic relationship within the categorization of Scandinavians and Chinese, representatives from the West and from the East. I contend that if there is dominance implied in the meetings that constitute a limitation for the dialogue and for the diversity of voices and differences to exist. The dialogue then risks becoming a monologue. Hence, I contend that it is of a great importance to work for mutuality in the work for dialogue and increased understanding at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. Mutuality implies equality and that there is a mutual need, contribution and responsibility to the collaboration. Now let us investigate in what way TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica is working with equality, a concept that is very closely related to mutuality.

Equality
As described above, the meeting between the East and the West implies a risk of inequality based on a post-colonial understanding and dichotomies. According to these dichotomies there is a risk that the other is perceived according to a stereotype. Hence, I contends that it is of importance to constantly work with equality to create a possibility for an exchange and collaboration where everyone's voice is allowed to be heard on equal bases and are respected equally. The interviewed personnel described how TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work with equality from different perspectives.

Luo Fei explains that the gallery is emphasizing equality by not merely showing well known artists in the gallery. They also show many young artists, meaning artists who just graduated or artists who just started their art life. They even show children's art. Almost every year they have an exhibition with female art. "*We want to show how female artist they work with and what kind of there's feeling so their's exhibition always give us a very big surprise*", Lou Fei describes. Cheng Liangchun describes how TCG Nordica is emphasizing equality by treating everyone equal and with respect whether they are poor or rich or whether you like them or not.

Jonathan Kearney explains that, since he believes that we are made in the image of God, that makes us different but equal. He states that God is so big and vast that he cannot be represented in one person; there must be a diversity of people to represent the breadth, depth and multifaceted nature of God. Anna Mellergård describes how she, after living in China for about a year, realized that there is a huge difference between Sweden and China when it comes to equality of men and women. She found it interesting and thought they would be able to make an important contribution. This aspect is connected to the human being's worth, Anna Mellergård explains.

All of the interviewed artists contend that their experience is that they have felt equal with the other artists during the collaborations; the collaboration has been on equal terms, where everyone has been treated and listened to in the same way. This strengthens that TCG Nordica is successfully working for equality. Thorsén contends that there is a risk of hiding unequal power positions in music collaborations. If there are hidden power-positions that are taken for granted by both sides within the projects at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica cannot be concluded in this thesis.

Five interviews with artists, and moreover only with Chinese artists, cannot be considered a sufficient foundation to make a conclusion about if there are any inequalities within TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's meetings. Neither has that ever been the aim of this thesis. However, since equality is one of the things TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica emphasize in their work, I want to discuss a few results that give an indication about their work with equality.

Several of the interviewees describe how the Chinese has learnt from the Swedes through the collaborations. This will be described closer further down. This could imply that the Scandinavian way of working and reasoning is the norm that the projects are organized according to. If so, it could be that the Chinese participants are expected to work and learn according to this. In that case, the unequal power-positions, describes in the post-colonial and post-structural theories of how the discourse determine and influence how we perceive the world and what we take for granted, can be hidden even for the participants. On the other hand, it is also described that the Scandinavians learn from the Chinese, which would indicate equality. However, since I have mostly interviewed Chinese artists and personnel it is mostly described how the Chinese participants have learnt from the Scandinavians. Many of the interviewed personnel members describe how TCG Nordica has what they call a third culture; a culture that is not Swedish nor Chinese but rather a mix of the two cultures into a third culture. This description reveals a processual understanding of culture. This third culture described to exist at TCG Nordica indicates that the organization of the projects should not favor any of the cultural belongings more than the others through hidden patterns and norms.

Once again I want to point out that this thesis does not make any claims to make any final conclusion about if there are any inequality hidden (or visual) within TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's projects. However, the interviewees' experience indicates that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's emphasis on equality has been successful. If there are hidden unequal power-positions within the projects can be discussed where different perspective can indicate different conclusions.

Human dignity
Human dignity has already been discussed in relation to TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's vision. Below I want to add Wu Yue Rong and Jonathan Kearney's definition of human dignity. Their definitions are connected to their faith and view of the world. The conclusion

we can draw in this context is that they perceive all human beings as equal and the human being's value is determined beyond the human being's control. In other words, we have a value because we are human beings.

When I ask Wu Yue Rong about how she defines human dignity she explains that it comes from the Christian concept. God created something very beautiful: the human being. When God evaluated his creation he said that everything was good, including the human being. We were given responsibility to manage his creation, she illustrates. Jonathan Kearney illustrates that he thinks of human dignity based on that the human being is made in the image of God. All human beings carry something very powerful that is giving them; a dignity and worth that are beyond the material worth of money or what we can or cannot make or produce.

Respect

Luo Fei explains that in the Chinese culture young people respect elderly people. Thus, it is no problem for the gallery to show elderly people's or well-known artist's work. However, TCG Nordica's gallery also arranges a lot of exhibitions by young artists. They want to arrange opportunities for them so they invite the other artists and elderly people to the young artists' exhibitions. Through this and through the dialogue taking place between these different kinds of artist, they want to encourage the young artists to grow. Luo Fei illustrates this as an example of how the gallery emphasizes respect in their work. Jonathan Kearney states that he thinks that respect is different from tolerance. He explains that one can tolerate someone on the other side of the road even. One do not have to engage with someone to tolerate her/him, you just have to put up with her/him. However, he contends that when you engage with someone that might take you to a place where you get uncomfortable with someone else's opinions and thinking, the way they speak or how they act. Then you respect the differences, you are equal and you respect the value of the human being because they are made in the image of God. Once, again we can see a willingness to be open to differences and, moreover, not only let them coexist but to let it be a struggle between different perspectives and, to use Bakhtin's terminology, different voices.

Friendships

In the quotes from TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's website above, we can see that they aim to work through friendships. Wu Yue Rong describes that they work with friendship in their daily work. I can see two ways of working with friendships at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. The first one is that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica build friendships with different artists and other people being a part of or surrounding their activities. This aspect I find not so useful in relation to the aim of this thesis. However, the second aspect, that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work to enhance friendships between the artists participating in their projects, is relevant in this analysis.

Småberg describes that one aspect affecting the creation of friendships are that one has a common history and memories. These will be shared with others and influence one's character and view of other people. Hence, these experiences contain a possibility to prevent stereotypes and prejudiced interpretations that goes hand in hand with the Orientalism and the Occidentalism. Through the creations of friendships, one has gotten an understanding of the other person as a human being. One can become a "you" instead of only an "it", using Martin Buber's words. Småberg describes how a friend can help us to see reality through another perspective. This corresponds with Bakhtin's theory that the other is necessary for the creation of meaning and understanding. In other words, the friendship can help us to encounter with another perspective and through mutual trust and respect have a dialogue.

On the other hand, Småberg points out the risk that friendships make unequal power positions less visible and softer; it becomes a way to legitimize inequality. This is an important aspect in the work of artistic meetings between artists mainly from the East and the West; in the disguise of friendship, prejudice, dominance, ethnocentrism and inequality can exist. In the theoretical framework the post-colonial perspective has described how the colonial times affect the world today. Further, Said, Buruma and Margalit describe how the Other, in relation to the East and the West, can be perceived according to stereotypes and dichotomies. Therefore, I contend, one should never perceive friendship as an ultimate proof that stereotypes and prejudice do not exist. Instead, one should always be aware of that this is an implied risk in meetings like the ones described at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. I want to suggest that one should turn it around and look at it from the other side. I contend that in meetings and collaborations, like the ones taking place at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica, ethnocentrism, dominance and prejudice exist more or less. If we acknowledge that these risks are implied and, further, are a human issue to deal with, we can see the need of constantly processing and problematize the relationships within the interaction. The friendships that take place might then be a way of working with the inequality instead of hiding it. This corresponds with David Shield's statement, described by Småberg, that even is the friendships contain inequality there is a feeling of mutuality and exchange. Towards this, I contend that friendships can be a way of decreasing prejudice and stereotypes, even if they at the same time can be a way of hiding just that.

We have now studies on what way TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica emphasize and work with several different areas to create an environment to support dialogue and understanding. We now continue to look closer of one of the methods that the interviewees, both artists and personnel, has described often are used at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica.

4.1.6 Themes
The interviewees describe that the project are often organized in a way that a group of artists, often from different countries, work together with a specific theme, for example Contagious Love and Sugar and Salt. This method we have also seen in the descriptions of a few projects in the beginning of this chapter. Wu Yue Rong describes how many different understandings there can be of for example the word "freedom", to explain how important it is to interact with another culture to realize different things. She explains that the word has a very wide meaning and many sides to it; it is not merely about what she calls self-time, it is also about dignity and respect. This goes hand in hand with the post-structural understanding that language, a word, is not merely a mirror of the reality, an expression. Instead, the language lays a foundation through which we understand the reality and our context. The meaning of the word is not constant; instead it is reinterpreted and reconstructed. Further, this corresponds with Lorentz and Bergstedt's statement that we construct meaning in the meeting with the other through constructions of new expressions of language. Hence, working with themes creates a possibility for the participants to catch sight of themselves and how they perceive the theme, understanding the others' perspective and through this hopefully gain a changed or broaden understanding of the theme, word or concept. Furthermore, this corresponds with the contemporary understanding of culture where the human being is constantly renegotiating meaning.

According to Bakhtin, our utterances are carriers of former voices as well as it is shaped by the expected response. In the interaction between the voices of the participants in the

dialogue, including the former voices within the utterances made in the interaction, is where meaning and understanding takes shape. Since in TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's case the collaboration often takes place between people with different cultural backgrounds in terms of ethnicity, age, artistic expression, gender and so forth, one can draw the conclusion that the voices in the interaction has a potential of great diversity. Let us repeat the quote from Igland and Dysthe written earlier in this thesis:

> *"Meaning is in other words not something that exists in the individuals consciousness or is created by the individual. Meaning is created and recreated by parties that collaborate within particular contexts and get life by different integrated voices. Those who converse or communicate with the help of writing or other medias cooperate hence in the creation and recreation of meaning."*
> (Dysthe 2003:101, my translation)

Thus, we need others to create meaning and understanding. Furthermore, we need differences for dialogue and understanding to take place. Bakhtin states that the struggle between different voices is needed for meaning to take shape. In the interaction of these different voices, individually and externally, the creative element lies. Consequently, since there are both an interaction with others and a great diversity of voices at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica there is a great potential for dialogue and understanding to take place.

Within the theories of intercultural educatoin, it is important to analyze different important concepts that have got to do with how knowledge are constructed and reproduced, and how we organize ourselves and behave towards each other. By working with a theme, that in one way or another reflects the vision of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica, there is a possibility to deepen and broaden ones understanding of several important concepts. Hence, this can create an opportunity to increase understanding of different perspectives and to see ones own perspective in relation to that. In this way one's own point of view and understanding can become clearer and, further, be put into perspective through the interaction with others within the different artistic projects.

He Libin raises another important aspect of working with themes that corresponds with Bakhtin's statement that mutual respect and trust are prerequisites for dialogue to take place. He Libin states that to show respect to everyone that is participating in a collaboration, it is important to find a point that all participants can accept and recognize as a starting point for the cooperate and dialogue. There must be a specific theme so that people from different cultural backgrounds can start from there and cooperate. He Libin's perspective once again brings up perspectives of equality and mutuality of the collaboration. There must be something that everyone can relate to as human beings, not in the same way but to the same extent. If not, there might be a risk that one part of the group feels like they have to, and maybe also are expected to, tell the other one how something should be perceived. Then, suddenly, it is no longer a mutual exchange where both parties need the other one for the creation of understanding and meaning. This is reflected when Anna Mellergård contends that one should try to lift the opinion one has, not give a lecture or preach one's opinion but to work with the question together.

Wu Yue Rong expresses that TCG Nordica want people to discuss and to stimulate people to concern about the inner life. This corresponds with Johansson's description of the importance to dialogue about life questions. I contend that the themes, corresponding with TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's vision, have a potential to open up for life questions and create a great

platform for them to be processed. Johnsson claims that by working with questions of a more spiritual kind one can connect people from different cultures. Furthermore, according to Lahdenperä, our ethnocentric ideas and values need to be processed emotionally. Vygotsky state that imagination is an "*…ability to communicate experiences, feelings and thoughts*" (Dysthe & Igland, 2003:87). Hence, I contend that there is a potential to process our ideas and values by working with these themes in a creative and artistic process.

4.1.7 Summary
I have now described and analyzed in what way TCG Nordica works to increase dialogue and understanding between people with different cultural backgrounds. We have seen that the vision of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica creates a foundation for their work. The vision indicates an aspiration to create dialogue between different people, where their differences are essential. Further, the vision creates a foundation for important life questions to be processed. We have seen that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work with art and dialogue in two different ways: art as a dialogue in itself and art as a springboard. I described how the dialogue, according to Bakhtin's definition, are taking place at TCG Nordica through the art and, further, what potentials I find there within. I have described and analyzed in what way TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica support dialogue that are provoked by the art, but is not taking shape as a dialogue through the art itself. I have argued that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica have the potential of functioning as a platform for the inner persuasive dialogue through its cross-cultural environment, structure, and approach. I have analyzed TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's roles and approaches. I analyzed TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work when it comes to openness, mutuality, friendship, human dignity, respect and friendships, all claimed to be worked with and through at TCG Nordica or ArtsNordica. Further, TCG Nordica was described as a bridge. In the end I analyzed the method of working with a theme.

By analyzing the results from the interviews through the theoretical framework I contend that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica to have a great potential to create dialogue and understand between people with different cultural backgrounds. However, as argued in the introduction, it does not tell us so much if it is not put in relation to what affects the interviewees have experienced of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work. Hence, I now continue by presenting and analyzing the outcomes of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work when it comes to dialogue and understanding.

4.2 – TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's experiences of the outcomes of their work in terms of dialogue and understanding.

In this part, I analyze the outcomes that can be found from the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica, in terms of dialogue and understanding. The analysis is based on what effects the interviewees have experienced. I start by analyzing the phenomena that we, according to Bakhtin, always have an addressee when we communicate. Then we move on by analyzing what could constitute a response in this artistic context and, further, how these responses correspond with the interviewees' experiences. The response indicates if dialogue and understanding has taken place. After that, I analyze the influences that have been found within the participant's art and in what way this indicates a dialogue. This is followed by an analysis of if there has struggle between different voices at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. We have already concluded that they have the aspiration to let different voices struggle. Here, we analyze if it actually has taken place. We continue with a discussion of different factors that

can influence the outcomes, and, further, the relation between these different factors. Finally, we analyze the experience of the interviewees when it comes to friendships.

4.2.1 To have an addressee

In difference to that a message is sent from a sender to a passive receiver, Bakhtin describes how the sender and the receiver create the message together. The expected response is actively taking part in shaping the utterance. The addressee, the one who gives response, can in this context be the audience visiting TCG Nordica taking part of an artwork, or other artists within the collaborations. We will now investigate in what way the interviewed artists related to the audience.

To have an addressee

Bakhtin said that the sender always expects a response of some kind. When I have asked the artists if and how they thought about the audience when they were creating, all of them said that they did not, some said that they used to but did not anymore. However, when I asked them what they wanted the audience to experience, everyone, except He Libin, expressed that they wanted the audience to be touched in one way or another. Liu Lifen explained that she wanted the audience to feel happy and joyful. Wang Han described that she would be very happy if someone understood what she tried to say, although, she did not want to tell them, she wanted them to think for themselves. She contends that she "…*send(s) a message to the audience*" and that she *"hope(s) that they have their own thoughts"*(through interpreter). Chen Jia, who, like the others, first answered that she did not think about the audience, continued "… *in another way…I want my art to tell them something… in that way I think about them"*. Huang Shan express that she wants the audience to be touched by her music. The fact that they all of them first contended that they do not think about the audience is simply because they interpreted the question in different ways. For example Liu Lifen interpreted it as if I asked if she listen to the audience opinions and changed after that, and Huang Shan interpreted it as if I asked about the number of the audience. He Libin expressed that he was not thinking about the audience at all, that he did not have time to. Though in his answer we can see that at least he was expecting some emotions from the audience: *"When I finish my work, when I put it there, then it has no relationship with me. When audience see it, how they feel, what they feel is their business. And the most important thing for me is that I have something to express, that's why I made an artwork."*(through interpreter). To sum up, we can see that they all expected some response, one way or the other, from the audience. Some of them had a more clear idea then others of what they wanted the audience to experience. Consequently, the artists have had one or several addressee in their artistic process. This strengthens that art can be perceived as an utterance.

4.2.2 Responses found within TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's activities

First, we begin by defining what we mean with response in this context. Bakhtin explains that response can be of various kinds. It can be a verbal or a non-verbal response. For example it can be that someone agrees, objects, fills it out, applies it, prepares to execute, contradicts, completes or builds upon the utterance made or executes a command. Moreover, it can be a silent understanding of the present that sooner or later will be answered through a verbal response or through a change of behavior. He Libin thinks the response to art can be subtle, something in you heart, or it can be a change of behavior. This goes hand in hand with Jonathan Kearney's statement that art communicates to the heart rather than the mind. Wang Han contends that emotions are a very direct response to art, and through the emotions we can get some thoughts. Huang Shan states that enjoying music is a response as well. Liu Lifen

contends that when you look at an artwork, whatever art form, one might feel pain, sadness, joy, happiness or even meaningless; all kinds of feeling can speak from the art.

Vygotsky describes how internalization comes about through a complicated process between the intramental level and the intermental level. Thus, if we have received an utterance of any kind, including an artistic utterance, the understanding will be created on an inner level but also through an outer dialogue. Consequently, a response to art can be that new thoughts are provoked, that a person's perception has changed or a change of behavior. Hence, I contend that everyone who is affected in any way by a piece of art, whatever art form, has given a response. Bakhtin claims that understanding comes to fruition in the response. Further, response is an essential part in dialogue. Hence, response is both an indication of increased understanding and an indication of dialogue. Thus, by studying the responses at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica we can learn more about the outcomes of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work when it comes to dialogue and understanding. Let us now move on and investigate if and in what way this corresponds with the interviewees' experiences of the outcomes of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work? Of course, it is impossible to detect all the different kind of responses given at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. However, the following examples give us an indication of the outcomes of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work. We have already concluded that there are verbal face-to-face dialogues taking place at TCG Nordica, something that can be perceived as a form of response. Below I analyze a few other responses found at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica.

Change of behavior
Wu Yue Rong describes how the participants in the HIV/AIDS project Contagious Love changed. She describes how those who had what she calls an "against attitude" in the beginning were those who gave the people who were infected with HIV/AIDS a big hug in the end. This is a change of behavior, something that Bakhtin considered a response. Lahdenperä (2004) states that becoming open to what is different is one of the outcomes of the theories of intercultural educatoin. Wu Yue Rong said that she thought this change took place because the participants learnt that they were the same, they were human beings. This corresponds with Lorentz and Bergstedt's statement that there is an opportunity to see each other as equal but different if we recognize that we are the same but different. Moreover, we can see clearly that knowledge helps to decrease the cleft between different people. Jonathan Kearney describes how one of the participants expressed *"I didn't realize you could touch someone with AIDS and not catch it",* after the trip. The fact that TCG Nordica arranged some education as well and created a platform for the participants to be able to ask questions about a theme that is not often spoke about in China, created a greater knowledge and understanding. This means that voices, which otherwise would not be allowed to be heard, were given an opportunity to join the dialogue.

Moreover, Wu Yue Rong describes how two artists that participated in for example the project Contagious Love, started to recheck their lives and made a change in their living. Wu Yue Rong describes how they were successful in their business and were affluent. They started to get involved in some volunteer work for projects working with poverty issues, environmental issues and protection of minority cultures, and now they have established an NGO. This is very clearly a change of behavior and a sign of a new understanding. This corresponds with Bakhtin's statement that understanding and response goes hand in hand.

Anna Mellergård illustrates how a Chinese artist, who was in an exchange project, changed her behavior as an outcome of the collaboration. The participants of the project had met in

China once and now, about eight month later they met in Sweden again. They sat in a circle and talked about their experiences from last time and expectations of what was to come. This Chinese artist told the group that before they met last time she and her husband had decided to get divorced, they had big problems in their communication. However, after being a part of this project she had thought that if this group, with so many differences, can meet in such warmth and love and have dialogue it would be odd if her and her husband would not be able to communicate. So she had returned home and they had solved their problems. This story indicates a change of behavior. Moreover, is indicates growth and development in a person. This aspect will be analyzed further below.

Self-consciousness, awareness of other perspectives, development and growth
One of the outcomes of a dialogue, Bakhtin states, is that one get to know oneself and can see oneself better through the eyes of the other. Moreover, growth and development are, according to Bakhtin, outcomes of the dialogue. Liu Lifen, Huang Shan and Chen Jia all express that they have found their way and grown as an artist through TCG Nordica. Liu Lifen describes that she, during her first project, did not feel like an artist or curator, she felt more like a student. She further describes how she got the opportunity to go to Sweden for a year through TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica and how that changed her. Now, she expresses, she knows that she is an artist and curator. Thanks to TCG Nordica she found her way and learnt many things valuable for her profession. Chen Jia expresses that she has grown up through the different projects and collaborations with different people. She states that the fact that TCG Nordica is always open and have let her do what she wants and, moreover, have always encouraged her, have lead to that she has found her own dance style. Huang Shan contends that TCG Nordica has given her a platform to mature from a student to a professional musician. He Libin describes that his art has been influenced, but not changed, through the participation at TCG Nordica. He contends: *"…communication between different culture…on one hand help you to see the other culture but on the other hand it helps you to know your own culture. And you know what specific path you want to take, you see yourself more clearly."* (through interpreter). This corresponds with Liu Lifen's experience of going to Sweden for a year. She describes that you *"…get to know Scandinavian culture at the same time you recognize your own culture"*. These stories illustrated by the interviewees can be perceived as a fruition of dialogue. Consequently, we can draw the conclusion that these artists have been participating in a dialogue.

Huang Shan describes how she has become more open through the collaborations. She describes how it helped her to break out of her frames and realize that there are other ways to think about playing music. She explains that her biggest challenge has been to improvise. Lorentz & Bergstedt describe how intercultural educatoin creates an awareness of different perspectives, and Lahdenperä how we get more open for various things that are different. Moreover, openness is seen as an outcome of the intercultural educatoin. Hence, we can draw the conclusion that Huang Shan has, through the interaction with others, increased her understanding both of her own standpoint and others'. To become more aware of ones own standpoint is what Bakhtin would call to gain self-consciousness, and is described as an outcome of the dialogue.

Anna Mellergård describes how many Chinese artists have expressed how it has been an experience for them to see how the Scandinavian artists work together, something that the Chinese artists have a harder time to do. Luo Fei describes the same phenomena. This corresponds with Wang Han's description that the Swedish group showed the Chinese group how to work together and that their spirit of teamwork was impressive. Anna Mellergård

explains that this experience has lead the Chinese participants to ask questions about why they do not dare to disclose themselves to the group in the same way as the Scandinavians do. Here we can clearly see how these Chinese artists have increased self-consciousness through the collaboration and dialogue, through the eyes of the other. Moreover, Luo Fei describes an example where the Chinese artists learnt from the Scandinavian artists' collaboration, and changed their own way of working in another collaboration project that followed with Cambodian artists. Once again we see a change of behavior that, according to Bakhtin, is a response.

This corresponds with Wu Yue Rong description of the collaboration in the project Sugar and Salt. She illustrates that the participants first divided up into different groups, however, during the activities and interaction of the first week something changed and during the second week many emotions came out. Wu Yue Rong describes that the Chinese artists started to open their heart and even cried during the practice hours because the participants of the project had helped them to look back on their childhood, and thus many things came up. They started to describe how they thought about the material, about human beings' relationships and their own value. Wu Yue Rong describes that the process during these weeks opened something and made them connect with each other, even if they had different backgrounds and ages. Once again, we see how the participants got to know themselves and could perceive themselves better through the eyes of the other.

Luo Fei gives an example of when he thinks the Western side learned from the Chinese side. When they were trying to find a suitable English name for the exhibition, which now is called "Inscape on the spot", Luo Fei had found the word "inscape", that was an old English word used during the 16th hundreds to describe an artist's inner landscape. The Chinese name was already set and they were now trying to find a good English name. Luo Fei was very satisfied with the word "inscape" but when he introduced it to some Scandinavian people at TCG Nordica they found it very strange and thought that no one would understand it. Luo Fei believes that maybe the reason why the Scandinavians could not understand it was because they could not find it in an ordinary dictionary. On of the European personnel at TCG Nordica suggested using "Inner Landscape" instead, contending that the English version should be very correct so that everyone understands it. Inscape and inner landscape has the same meaning, however, Luo Fei illustrates that the word "inscape" most people could feel but maybe not understand completely. Luo Fei claimed that it would not matter, explaining that in Chinese culture the feeling of the word is enough. So after a long discussion the European personnel member stated that he thought the Chinese culture could teach them something, because mostly the Westerners use very correct words but forget about the feeling of the word. This indicates that someone has gotten to know herself/himself better through the eyes of another and, moreover, learned something about another perspective.

Lahdenperä describes how one through the intercultural educatoin can get more culturally aware, meaning an ability to critically inspect criteria, products, actions and perspective within once own and other cultures. Lorentz and Bergstedt describe how intercultural educatoin creates an awareness of different perspectives. Both Wang Han and Liu Lifen illustrate this. Liu Lifen describes how she has learnt a lot from foreign artists, how to preserve, display and talk about art. Moreover, she describes herself in this context. She describes that there are many different ways to explain one's art and, further, explain her own way and contrasts that toward another way. Liu Lifen expresses that when you work together you can learn things from different angles. She thinks this is a good way to find a good solution. She gives the example that when Chinese people get an idea they always want to do

it immediately, while foreigners always plan, and she states that one can learn from each other. Once again, we can see an increased awareness, both of one-self and of other perspectives. Wang Han explains that when one cooperates with people from other cultures, one can see things from different perspectives; how others might do their work in another way, and how others think and solve things. She describes that the most important thing for her is that one try new things when you work in a team. She explains that is was very interesting how they, in the project Love Protection, were ten people with different cultures, ages, backgrounds and religions, which made them all have different perspectives of the theme. She contends that she has learnt a lot from the group she worked with. Consequently, the method to let a group of artists with various cultural backgrounds, not only in relation to ethnicity, has lead to increased understanding. Wang Han shows an increased cultural awareness by describing that she has found that something is the same in different cultures and something is different. She elaborates this by expressing that one uses different words but mean the same thing. This corresponds with the post-structural understanding that a word is not merely mirroring a reality.

Anna Mellergård illustrates that they have experiences of how something new is created when you develop in the meeting with others. She explains that many of those who have been in their exchange projects, even if it was many years ago, describes that it was a turning point for them. She explains that many of the artists in the project Sugar and Salt says that during that project something turned for them, they understood something. Anna Mellergård's description indicates that people have grown and developed through the collaborations. Growth and development are, according to Bakhtin, outcomes of the dialogue. Moreover, the story indicates increased understanding.

Decreased prejudices
Chen Jia describes that she though that all foreigners were like an American she once had met, however, after meeting other foreigners through TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica she found out that was not the case. This indicates increased understanding between people with different cultural background. The postcolonial theories describe that we often create stereotypes, where the other often are seen as a very homogeneous group without nuances. As we can see Chen Jia describes how she used to think that all Westerners were like this one person she had met. Although, Chen Jia continues by explaining that by meeting other foreigners through TCG Nordica she got a better understanding of Westerners, her perception got more heterogenic and diverse. Hence, we can see that the understanding for people with another cultural background has increased and prejudice has decreased.

Wu Yue Rong described how the participants in the HIV/AIDS project stared to reevaluate the HIV/AIDS positive people that HIV/AIDS positive people changed and donated money and gave them a hug in the end. This also indicates that prejudices have decreased. Hence, understanding has been increased.

4.2.3 Influences on the art – an sign of dialogue
Bakhtin describes how one is the sender and the addressee at the same time. In the same act of doing an utterance one also respond to former utterances made, present or historical. Moreover, one is creative by using something old (former utterances, the different voices and understanding within the language and symbols) and adding something new to it. In the light of this it is useful to study the fact that many in the interviewees describe how the artists' art change in different way through the collaborations and exchanges at TCG Nordica and

ArtsNordica. Both Wu Yue Rong and Anna Mellergård describe a Chinese artist that changed her art a lot when she was in Sweden for a year. Wu Yue Rong explains that she was educated in traditional painting for four years. Through the exchange and her work and participation at TCG Nordica both Wu Yue Rong and Anna Mellergård illustrates that the artist found a very special way: a mix of traditional Chinese painting and western painting. Anna Mellergård describes that being in Sweden for a one-year exchange, changed the artist's art a lot in terms of chose of colors and style. Moreover, Anna Mellergård describes another Chinese artist who went to Scandinavia for three month for an exchange. Before he went his art was very traditional, however, when he returned back he had changed his expression. Now he painted a lot of cloths. The artist contended it was because he saw many beautiful and special cloths in Sweden compared to China. Luo Fei describes how most artists are influenced by Chinese culture by visiting TCG Nordica through the artist in residence program. They use and try a lot of things with local art material. He describes a Swedish artist that practiced Thai Qi when she visited China and continued back in Sweden. Luo Fei states that this changed her art. Furthermore, Luo Fei describes how a Chinese musician moved to Sweden three years ago, and when he came back his music was changed. Anna Mellergård illustrates that you can see traces of what Scandinavian artist, who goes to China, have experienced in their art for years after they have returned back to Sweden. He Libin describes that he knows a Swedish artist, who has spent a lot of time in China. He describes how one can see Eastern influences in the Swedish artist's work and that the art now contains a mix of two cultures. Many of the artists express that their own art has changed through the collaborations at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. Why is this useful in relation to Bakhtin? This thesis are not focusing directly on how the art is affected by TCG Nordica and ArtNordica's activities, it is focusing on how the meeting can increase the dialogue and understanding between people on a more interpersonal level. However, since Bakhtin contends that we are both a sender and a receiver and, moreover, in the creative process of using something old and adding something new, what is mediated through the art indicates something about this process. Since the artists' art has been affected by the collaborations and exchanges that indicate that a dialogue has taken place; new things have been brought into this complex chain and process of dialogue and have been added and mixed with old things in the artists' lives. On the other hand what is considered being Chinese and what is considered Scandinavian might be an orientalist misinterpretations of what is really Chinese and Scandinavian.

After having studied different responses at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica we continue by investigating the struggles of different voices. Earlier, I have showed that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica aim and strive to include diversity and let differences exist at TCG Nordica. I will now investigate the interviewees' experiences and descriptions if there actually exist struggles between different voices.

4.2.4 Struggle between different voices
As we have read above, Bakhtin states that meaning and understanding is created through the struggle of different voices. Further, the struggle between different voices is essential for the inner persuasive platform. Hence, the struggle between different voices both indicates increased understanding and meaning, and that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica function as a platform for the inner persuasive dialogue, as suggested earlier. Therefore, we will look closer at the process of the collaborations.

Wu Yue Rong explains the usual process of the collaborations is that when a Scandinavian artist comes to China she/he is first very excited about meeting another culture, to meet

Chinese people in the streets and they like the atmosphere they meet. Then comes another period, when they start to check their own culture, habits, life, decision-making and so forth. This will make both sides very uncomfortable and both sides think that they should not have to change. Instead, this or that is because of the others. However, when things keep moving on and when the door is kept open people will realize that actually the others' thinking is ok, it is good, and then they fall in love with the different culture and the people with that cultural background, Wu Yue Rong describes. Earlier, we have read about conflicts and friction within the Sugar and Salt project. This corresponds with Luo Fei's experience that in most of the exchanges there are many misunderstandings; there are questions and things can be very hard. However, after one or two weeks, or in the second part of the project, the dialogue always improves. Wang Han explains that is was an experience for her how the group got to know each other. She describes how it first was difficult because they were strangers to each other and, moreover, the Swedish artists had some difficulties and worries because they were in China for the first time. However, slowly they started to get to know each other through meetings and a lot of conversations, workshop and by eating together almost everyday. She states that after about a week, they started to get to know each other. Liu Lifen, Jonathan Kearney and Anna Mellergård all describes that most of the time the collaboration between the artists work well, however, sometimes there are conflicts and friction.

As we can see, many of the collaborations have contained struggle and friction when different cultures have come together to create and work together. This could be perceived as a lack of dialogue and understanding. However, the interviewees describe how the collaborations has not stayed in this state of conflict and, moreover, out of these struggles we have read that the interviewees' experience is that the understanding has increased; things has gotten a new or a deeper meaning. Consequently, the projects of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica described above, have allowed struggle and tension between different voices. Consequently, this indicates that understanding and meaning have increased and, moreover, that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica have functioned as a platform for the inner persuasive dialogue.

These processes seem to have taken place both on a collective level and on an individual level. An example of this is what has been described in the Sugar and Salt project: that Chinese participants, through the meeting and struggle of different voices with the other within social activities (collective level), has started to see themselves clearer (individual level), opened themselves up to the group (both individual and collective level) and, further, how that affected the dialogue positively (collective level). This corresponds with Vygotsky's theory of how meaning is created through a complex process between the intramental level and the intermental level, through a constant movement back and forth between these two levels. Furthermore, this corresponds with Dysthe's description that, according to Bakhtin, we create awareness of ourselves both internally and externally.

4.2.5 Discussion about various factors and their interrelation
All these outcomes, described above, can of course be the outcome of various factors, and they probably are. How much of these affects, described above, that is the outcome of the artistic collaboration and how much that are the outcome of the surrounding circumstances of eating food together, being in another country and so on is not possible to say. However, this question is not so important in this thesis. I have already described how art is used both as a dialogue in itself and as a springboard and a reason for dialogue. All the surrounding factors and circumstances that are not specifically painting, playing or dancing in the project is thus a part of the meeting. What is important is rather what constitutes the difference between an artistic cultural meeting at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica, and for example a business

meeting. Perhaps these two perspectives of the meeting, art as a dialogue and art as a springboard and reason for dialogue, are so intertwined that they are not even possible of separate. Maybe they are in constant relation to each other. What is experienced and realized in the artistic process is reflected in the verbal dialogue and social activities, and what is expressed in the verbal dialogue and social activities will leave a trace in the artistic expression, or effect our response and the understanding of the encounter with someone else's artwork. According to Bakhtin, a word, and in this context a piece of art, is not merely a self-expression. Instead, the thought is created in the art. Further, since we define ourselves in the relation to others, the word, or the piece of art, becomes a dialogue. Consequently, the art as well as other social activities and verbal conversations is a part of the same complex chain of dialogue; of being a sender and giving a response at the same time.

An important question to ask in this context is if one can always expect a response of one's artwork? Or is that a utopian reality? Does it not ever happen that someone hears or sees a piece o art and do not get affected in any way, do not give any response? Here we can connect to Ken Hirschkop's critique of Bakhtin and the dialogism. He criticized Bakhtin of not being able explain the failed and sour conversations. How would Bakhtin explain if someone would not give a response of any kind to an artwork? However, even if the dialogue is not always taking place we can, by listening to the stories and experiences from the artists and the personnel establish that some kind of dialogue has taken place. If it always takes place or not is maybe not so important.

4.2.6 Friendships
All of the interviewees describe how they have gotten friends through TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. This corresponds with Cheng Liangchun and Luo Fei statements that many of the participants become friends. However, there is no guarantee that friendship takes place. Liu Lifen describes how her experience from Sugar and Salt was that the Chinese artists were acting on an individual basis and did not behave like friends. On the other hand, Wang Han describes her experience that the group collaborating within the Love Protection project, after some time got really close. She describes: "*The inside of us is very similar when we…say goodbye you feel so connected one a few of them even without words you feel you know everything about them*". Moreover, Wang Han describes that when they met in Sweden for the second part of the project they were all friends because of their common experience in China. This corresponds with Wu Yue Rong's description of how the participants in Sugar and Salt, after a struggling first part in China, met in Sweden and had a much better cooperation. This confirms David Shield's statement, as discussed by Småberg, that a common history and memories are important for friendships. The fact that all of the artists express that they have felt equal with the other artists during the collaborations indicates that the friendship has not been a way of hiding unequal power positions like discussed above.

4.2.7 Summary
According to Bakhtin, the sender of an utterance always has one or several addressee, who has an active part in shaping the utterance. By studying the artists' experiences I established that all of them had an addressee. I argue that if someone has been affected in any way by a piece of art, they have given a response to the art. I discussed different responses to an utterance found within the experiences of the interviewees. From this analysis we can draw the conclusion that many responses can be found at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica in form of changed behavior, increased self-consciousness, increased awareness of other perspectives, growth, development, decreased prejudices and the repeal of stereotypes. Further, I stated that the fact that the collaborations and exchanges have influenced and changed the art of the

artists participating, indicates the creative process in a dialogue of taking something old and adding something new. Hence, the changes and influences of the art itself indicates that a dialogue has been taken place. By studying the collaborations' process we conclude that different voices are allowed to struggle within the activities at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. This indicates dialogue, and an increase of understanding and meaning. After discussing the different factors that can affect the different outcomes that we are studying and I stated that the dialogue through art itself and the dialogue that spring from the art are intertwined and both exist within the same complicated chain of utterances within the dialogue. Earlier it has been described how TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica aim to work through friendships. By analyzing the experiences of the interviewees I state that friendships are created among the participants at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica.

We have now investigated in what way TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica work to increase dialogue and understanding and, further, the outcomes of their work. We will now continue by studying different aspects that can affect the outcome of the collaborations.

4.3 Aspects that affect the outcome of the artistic meeting when it comes to dialogue and understanding, according to the experience from the personnel and the artists.

We have already discussed a lot of different aspects that affect the dialogue and understanding in the collaborations at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. Differences, crossculturalism, balance of diversity, balance of individual and contextual aspects when perceiveing the artwork, give support and help to dialogue, the structure of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica, approaches, openness, mutuality, equlity, respect, friendships, the method of working through different themes, processing important life questions and allowing different voices to struggle has been described as important aspects for dialogue and understanding to take place. There is no point in repeating the analysis of these factors here. Instead, this part complement the other parts in this chapter by bringing out a few other aspects that have been expressed to be important for the outcome of the collaborations.

4.3.1 Time
Several times during the interview time came up as an important factor for dialogue and understanding to take place. Many of the interviewees described the process of the collaboration change over time; there were often struggles in the beginning, however, after a week or so the group starts to open up and connect. Luo Fei explains that it takes time to let the communication improve and that is takes time to understand each other. Liu Lifen also illustrates that time is an important aspect for the project to increase dialogue and understanding. She explains that if you get time, sometimes that can help you to understand someone else's art that you have not liked from the start. She contends that a good thing with the art projects at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica is that there is always a certain amount of time that you have to work with the group. Liu Lifen describes the project Logbook, that she was part of organizing. She believes this project was very successful because the participants had a lot of time to get to know each other. They dialogued for a year before they actually met. She illustrates that the Swedish artist already had cooperated with each other for ten years so they were good raw models for the Chinese artist.

4.3.2 The leader
The leader of the projects was described as an important aspect for dialogue and increased understanding. Wang Han's experience is that they all improved because they had a great leader. Liu Lifen contends that the leader of a project is very important. She illustrates that it is important that the leader knows a little bit of both cultures. Liu Lifen describes that she has found that foreigners are better to speak out than Chinese people. However, she states that this did not lead the foreigners to take over in the process. She contends that this was because the leader of the project had lived in China for many years and knows Chinese. Thus, when Chinese people have ideas, even though they are silent, she was good to explain and encourage them to express their ideas. Once again we can see how the description of the leaders role within the projects at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica corresponds well with the description of the teacher's role within the theories of intercultural educatoin. The leader is described to function more as a mentor and a coach than a person who shows the others how things are to be done. Instead, the leader Liu Lifen describes has used her knowledge, her own cultural awareness and sensibility, to help the different perspective to be allowed to exist and to be heard. In this way, I contend, she has been increasing the possibilities for dialogue and understanding to increase. By allowing and helping different voices to be heard the projects have the potential of working as a platform for the inner persuasive dialogue.

Anna Mellergård describes that they have found that the collaborations work better if the Swedish and the Chinese groups have met before they all meet, to prepare, get to know each other, and discuss and reflect upon the theme together. Anna Mellergård explains that even if they explain to both the Swedish and the Chinese group that the project are not suppose to be run by one or a few leaders, that it is something they are suppose to do together, the Swedish and the Chinese group reacts very differently. For the Swedish group it is natural to meet before they meet the Chinese artists, however, that is not the case in the Chinese group. Anna Mellergård explains that the Chinese need a leader to make the process to forward. Anna Mellergård explains that one cannot try to make the Chinese artists change, instead TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica have to adjust. Thus, they pick a leader for the Chinese group to take responsibility for the preparation process and involve everyone in the group. TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica step in and help the preparation process if needed. Anna Mellergård illustrates that it is different with the Swedish group; there, it is good if someone is responsible for calling to the first meeting but then everybody shares the responsibility. Luo Fei also describes how the Swedish and the Chinese groups work very differently. However, in difference to Anna Mellergård, Luo Fei describes how the Chinese artists does not think that there should be a leader while the Swedish group set a leader from the beginning. Luo Fei contends that the fact that the Swedish group chose a leader, make their work go very smoothly. We can see that Anna Mellergård and Luo Fei's description of the different groups does not correspond. However, these different descriptions have in common that they describe that the lack of a leader is negative for the collaboration in the Chinese group. Hence, we can draw the conclusion that the leaders role can be important in the collaboration.

4.3.3 Culture preparation
Above we read that Anna Mellergård states that their experience is that the collaboration work smoother if the different groups prepare before the all meet. Wu Yue Rong confirms this and describes the importance of culture preparing. She explains that before the project starts, TCG Nordica have a dialogue with the participants to help them prepare. Moreover, TCG Nordica gives them guidance about the project and its aim. Wu Yue Rong states that this phase is very important for the collaboration and cannot be missed.

4.3.4 Adjustment

Anna Mellergård's description above of how they pick a leader for the Chinese group instead of making them change shows the importance of adjusting. This indicates a cultural sensibility from the organization. The openness described above also indicates a constant adjustment to the participants.

Moreover, Anna Mellergård describes that one does not gain anything by being provocative in China. Instead, she contends, it is better to create a dialogue. Some subjects are sensitive and if one provokes, there is a risk that it get closed down and then you are not listen to anyway. Wu Yue Rong also talks about the importance of avoiding topics that are too sensitive in the society.

4.3.5 The attitude of the participants

Wu Yue Rong expresses the importance of the attitude on an individual level amongst the participants in the project. She explains that, for a good and fruitful meeting to take place, it is important that the participants have an open mind. She illustrates that they cannot be too selfish, too critical or thinking that there is only one good way. Wu Yue Rong continues by explaining that an open attitude is important for the creation of friendships. She explains that if you have an open heart you will benefit a lot and have a chance to become more mature than if you only have one mind. He Libin also describe the importance of the participants. He describe that the meeting and dialogue start with the interest in another artist's work. This corresponds with Illman and Nynäs' statement that the attitude of the participants in the meeting is the key. Curiousity and intrest in the other are important factors.

4.3.6 Summary

Time is described to be an important factor for understanding to take place. The leader and her/his ways of working with the group and competence are described to affect the dialogue and understanding. That the groups prepare in different ways before they meet in the collaboration is very importance for how the collaboration will run, according to both Anna Mellergård and Wu Yue Rong. Further, it is described to be important to adjust to the surroundings of the collaborations. Finally, it is stated the attitudes of the participants will affect the outcomes of the artistic meetings.

5 CONCLUSION AND FINAL DISCUSSION

In the result and analysis we can see many successful outcomes from the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. We can see responses in terms of increased self-consciousness, increased awareness of other perspectives, growth, development, change of behavior, decreased prejudices, repeal of stereotypes, increased openness to what is different and, moreover, face-to-face verbal dialogues provoked by the art. These responses indicate both that a dialogue and increased understanding has taken place. We can see how the participants' art have been influences by the collaborations. This also indicates that dialogue has been taken place. Furthermore, we can see that struggle between different voices has been allowed. Finally, we can see that friendships are created through TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. Consequently, the interviewees' experiences indicate that dialogue and understanding has taken place through the activities of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica. If this has been the case all the time is not possible to conclude. However, we can see that is has happened in several cases. This corresponds with Cheng Liangchun's description that: *"Different kind of project we use art, I cannot say influence most of the people but I can say at least influence some of the people."* Hence, I contend that one can learn a lot from TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's way of working. Through the investigation of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's work, certain aspects have been found important for dialogue and understanding to take place. These aspects are laid out below.

In the analysis we see different factors that is a part of determining the outcome of the meeting, whether it increases dialogue and understanding or if it increases monologue, stigmatization and stereotypes. Above, I state that art can be used both as a dialogue in itself and as a reason and springboard for dialogue. We have seen how art can constitute a dialogue. Art is then not merely perceived as an expression, instead thoughts, emotions and so forth are taking shape in the artistic process. In this way, there is a dialogue between the artist and the art, helping the artist to perceive herself/himself better and gain increased self-consciousness. Moreover, art is a tool for mediation that creates a dialogue between the artist and the audience, in this case constituted by visitors at TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica's events and artists participating in the collaborations. We have stated that the art contains former voices from former utterances. These former voices can be mediated through tools being used in the creative process, for example a brush, a word or a musical instrument. Hence, the art constitute a platform for several different voices to meet. When discussing TCG Nordica's structure, we can see how different cultural events exist in the same space and, hence, there is a potential for a dialogue between different artworks. Moreover, we can see the importance to interpret and perceive a piece of art both in relation to the artist's individuality and the artist's context. If so, there lies a potential in both seeing the differences and the similarities of the other through the art. This can, according to Lorentz & Bergstedt, lead to insight of that we are equal but different. Further more, the interviews show that art often function as a reason and a springboard for dialogue. TCG Nordica has shown the importance of supporting this dialogue by creating forums for the dialogue to take place and develop. Through this dialogue, understanding can increase. These two perspectives of art and dialogue should not be perceived as two different and opposite ways of using art to increase dialogue and understanding. Instead, they are intertwined and support each other. The dialogues taking place within the art itself are affecting the dialogue taking place in for example a discussion group and vice versa. Consequently, we can see that art and its creative process are useful in terms of increasing dialogue and understanding.

Above we have seen great potential in using art to increase dialogue and understanding. However, working with artistic meetings does not automatically guarantee an outcome of increased dialogue and understanding. Differences among the participants and a struggle between different voices are important factors for this outcome. We can see that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica aim to let differences coexist within their activities. These differences are not merely in regard of ethnicity. Instead, TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica are aiming for differences in accord with the hybrid identity. TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica aim to create a cross-cultural environment, including people with different cultures, ethnicity, ages, levels of profession, and different believes and theories about life. Many of the interviewees' experiences correspond with this description of diversity. However, TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica are also challenged to open up even further in terms of what artists they include. Moreover, we see the importance of balancing these differences and choosing the participants both with the aspiration to combining differences to create something new, and with the respect of different traditions and values. Further, we can see the importance of understanding an artwork both in relation to the artist's own culture, but also from the point of view of the other's culture. These two perspectives need to be balanced. We can see a great potential of working with art in collaborations including different cultures. Through this encounter the art can be freed from its context and new treasures can be found within the art. In this way, the art can get a broader and deeper meaning and, hence, the artist can perceive herself/himself through the dialogue with this new point of new. However, the artists' own context must also be taken into consideration. Otherwise there is a risk of misunderstandings. We can see the importance of allowing struggle between different voices, questions, ambiguity, doubts, exchanges and objections for dialogue and understanding to take place. Moreover, we can see an importance of the space that is used for the art events and collaborations. The space at TCG Nordica creates, as mentioned above, coexistence between different arts and, hence, creates a potential for dialogue. Further, to have a space, in this case a restaurant, for people to dialogue at are important, according to the experience of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica.

Through the work of TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica we can see the importance of working with openness, mutuality, equality, human dignity, respect and friendship, as a foundation for the work to increase dialogue and understanding between people with different cultural backgrounds. TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica shows the importance of being open for changes, differences, ideas, different kinds of art, and open to give the artist freedom to create. They show the importance of working for mutuality between the participants in the projects, where the participants share the responsibility together. Through mutuality there is a possibility for dichotomies, and their inherent hierarchy, to be repealed. Further, they show the importance of working for equality and respect by treating everyone the same, regardless of their background and currant status. It is about engaging in another person even if one risks to encounter with something that one finds uncomfortable. This goes hand in hand with the human dignity, which is described by the interviewees as a fundamental and unnegotiable equal value of the human being. Moreover, TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica have shown the importance of working for the creation of friendships. By creating common memories there lies a potential for friendships. Through the friendship there is a possibility to become a person to each other and not merely a stereotypes. Friendships can both create and be created from a mutual trust and respect, that are described as prerequisites for dialogue and understanding to take place.

TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica shows the importance of helping the collaboration by talking to the participants and try to explain differences if there are misunderstandings. Further, it is

important to not only help the existing collaboration but also to initiate new collaboration and connect people, groups, organizations and other parts with each other.

We can see that TCG Nordica and ArtsNordica often use a method where artists with different cultural backgrounds, often from China and Scandinavia, collaborate together around a theme, which accord with their vision. This method has shown great potentiality to increase dialogue and understanding among the participants. First, meaning is created in collaboration with other voices. Second, when the participants work with one of these themes in a creative and artistic process together with others, there is potential for a dialogue about life questions to take place and, further, that these questions are processed emotionally. Then, both understanding for the other and self-consciousness can be gained. Furthermore, a theme that all human beings can relate to create a common starting point where the participants can meet as equals.

Time has been found to be an important aspect for dialogue and understanding to take place. In other words, one should not stress these collaborations. Moreover, the leader has been described to be an essential part in the creation of dialogue and understanding within the collaborations. The artists' experiences indicates that it is valuable that the leader has cultural awareness and sensibility, that she knows at least a little bit about both cultures collaborating. Through this knowledge she/he can help everyone in the group to be heard. We can also see that it is important that the leader works more as a mentor and a coach instead of showing the participants how things are to be done. Instead, she/he participates in the search and creation of meaning and understanding. Moreover, to prepare the participant to the collaboration has been found important for the outcome. Finally, we can see the importance of being flexible and being able to adjust to the situation and the cultures participating.

I do not believe that there are only way right way to create dialogue and understanding between people with different cultural background. There is no formula that can guarantee that outcome. After all, in participants' attitude are also described to influence the outcome of the collaboration. This thesis has illustrated some factors that are found to be important for the outcome of the meeting.

Further, I have found the theories of Bakhtin, Vygotsky and intercultural educatoin very useful to enhance the understanding in what way dialogue and understanding can be increased through artistic collaborations. They have been useful both in regard to this artistic context and as a combination of theories. I have found that they have the same foundation, making them easy to combine, and they complement each other by emphasizing different things.

6 REFERENCES

PRINTED SOURCES

Bakhtin, M. (1990). *Art and Answerability: Early Philosophical Essays by M. M. Bakhtin.* Austin: University of Texas Press

Bachtin, M. (1991a). *Det dialogiska ordet*. Gråbo: Bokförlaget Anthropos.

Bachtin, M. (1991b). *Dostjevskiljs poetik*. Gråbo: Bokförlaget Anthropos.

Bachtin, M. (1997). Frågan om Talgenrer, In E. H. Aurelius & T. Götselius (Eds.), *Genreteori.* (pp. 203-239). Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Bakhtin, M. (1984). *Problems of Dostoevsky's poetics*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press

Baumann, G. (1999) *The Multicultural Riddle. Rethinking National, Ethnic, and Religious Identities.* New York: Routledge.

Brömssen von, K. (2006). Identiteter i spel – den mångkultruela skolan och nya etniciteter, In H. Lorentz & B. Bergstedt (Eds.), *Interkulturella perspektiv: pedagogik i mångkulturella lärandemiljöer.* (pp. 41-69). Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Buruma, I.& Margalit, A. (2008). *Occidentalism. Fiendens syn på Västerlandet*. Stockholm: Bokförlaget Natur och Kultur.

Clark, K. & Holquist, M. (1984). *Mikhail Bakhtin.* Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press

Dysthe, O & Igland, M.A. (2003). Vygotskij och sociokulturell teori, In O. Dysthe (Ed.), *Dialog, samspel och lärande.* (pp. 95-117). Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Dysthe, O. (1999). Mikhail Bakhtin – ein kort presentasjon, In O. Dysthe (Ed.), *The Dialogical Perspective and Bakhtin. Conference Report.* (pp. 6-16). Bergen: Universitetet i Bergen

Dysthe, O. (1999). Dialogic perspectives on teaching and learning, In O. Dysthe (Ed.), *The Dialogical Perspective and Bakhtin. Conference Report.* (pp. 73-88). Bergen: University of Bergen.

Emerson, C. & Morson, G. S. (1987). Penultimate words, In C. Koelb & V. Lokke (Eds.), *The Current in Criticism. Essays on the Present and the Future of Literary Theory.* (pp. 43-64) West Lafayette, Ind: Purdue University Press.

Eriksson, C., Baaz, M. E. & Thörn H. (2002). Den postcoloniala paradoxen, rasismen och "det mångkulturella samhället". En introduction till postcolonial teori. In C. Eriksson, M. E. Baaz & H. Thörn (Eds.) In *Globaliseringens kulturer. Den postkoloniala paradoxen, rasismen och det mångkulturella samhället*, 2nd ed. (pp. 13-53). Nora: Bokförlaget Nya Doxa.

Esaisasson, P., Gilljam, M., Oscarsson, H. & Wängnerud, L. (2007). *Metodpraktikan. Konsten att studera samhälle, individ och marknad.* 3rd ed. Stockholm: Norstedts Juridik AB.

Gilje, N. & Grimen, H. (2007). *Samhällsvetenskapernas förutsättningar*, 3rd ed. Göteborg: Bokförlaget Daidalos AB.

Haynes, D. J. (1995). *Bakhtin and the Visual Arts*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Hirschkop, K. (2000). It's good to talk: myths of dialogue in Bakhtin and Habermas. *The Future of Dialogue.* (pp. 83-93).

Holquist, M. (1990) *Dialogism, Bakhtin and his World.* London: Harvard University Press

Illman, R. & Nynäs, P. (2005). *Kultur, människa, möte. Ett humanisktiskt perspektiv.* Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Igland, M.A. & Dysthe, O. (2003). Mikhail Baktin och sociokulturell teori, In O. Dysthe (Ed.), *Dialog, samspel och lärande.* (pp. 95-117). Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Irwin, R. (2007). Said förfalskar det förflutna, *Axess magasin*, 6:20-23

Johansson, B. & Svedner, P. O. (2006). *Examensarbetet i lärarutbildningen. Undersökningsmetoder och språklig utformning.* Uppsala: Kunskapsföretaget i Uppsala AB Läromedel & Utbildning

Johansson, M. (2006). Andlighetens betydelse för den pedagogiska dialogen, In H. Lorentz & B. Bergstedt (Eds.), *Interkulturella perspektiv: pedagogik i mångkulturella lärandemiljöer.* (pp.155- 176). Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Karlsson, J. (2000). *Predikans samtal. En studie av lyssnarens roll i predikan hos Gustaf Wingren utifrån Michail Bachtins teori om dialogicitet.* Skellefteå: Artos Bokförlag.

Kurkiala, M. (2005). *I varje trumslag jordens puls. Om vår rädsla för skillnader.* Stockholm: Ordfront förlag.

Lahdenperä, P. (2004). Interkulturell Pedagogic – vad, hur och varför?, In P. Lahdenperä (Ed.), *Interkulturell pedagogik i teori och praktik.* (pp.11-31). Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Lorentz, H. & Bergstedt, B. (2006). Interkulturella perspektiv – från modern till postmodern pedagogik, In H Lorentz & B. Bergstedt (Ed.), *Interkulturella perspektiv: pedagogik i mångkulturella lärandemiljöer.* (pp. 13-39). Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Lewis, M.& Wigen, K. (1997). *The Myth of Continents. A Critique of Metageography.* Berkeley: University of California Press

Lärarförbundet (2006). *Lärarens handbook: skollag, läroplaner, yrkesetiska principer, FN:s barnkonvention.* Stockholm: Lärarförbundet

Omar, M. (2007). Drivna av kunskapstörst, *Axess magasin*, 6:30-33

Said, E. (1997). *Orientalism*. Stockholm: Ordfront förlag

Sæther, E. (2006). Hybriditet och gränsöverskridande musiklärare, In H. Lorentz & B. Bergstedt (Eds.), *Interkulturella perspektiv: pedagogik i mångkulturella lärandemiljöer.* (pp. 71-85). Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Småberg, M. (2006). Interkulturell vänskap som motdiskurs – ett historiskt perspektiv, In H. Lorentz & B. Bergstedt (Eds.), *Interkulturella perspektiv: pedagogik i mångkulturella lärandemiljöer.* (pp.177- 194). Lund: Studentlitteratur.

Stukát, S. (2005). *Att skriva examensarbete inom utbildningsvetenskap.* Malmö: Studentlitteratur.

Thorsén, S-M. (2003), Musikundervisningens fötter och rötter, *Invandrare och minoriteter,* 5:21-24

Thorsén, S-M. (2008), Musikens negativa verkningar. In R. Nejadmehr. S.E.Liedman & D. M. Doust (Eds.), *Befria oss från mångkulturalismen*. (pp. 99-115). Stockholm: Natur & Kultur

OTHERS SOURCES

TCG Nordica, URL: www.tcgnordica.com/about Date of access: 2009-06-14

TCG Nordica, URL: http://www.tcgnordica.com/gallery/artist-in-residence-programme Date of
access: 2009-06-14

TCG Nordica, URL: http://www.tcgnordica.com/artsnordica Date of access: 2009-06-14

TCG Nordica, URL: http://en.tcgnordica.com/artsnordica/ Date of access: 2009-06-14

TCG Nordica: URL: http://en.tcgnordica.com/about/culture-exchange/ Date of access: 2010-
05-22

ArtsNordica, URL:
www.artsnordica.com/index.php?page=484e7f377cc66&link_id=4832b53281249&lang_id=0
Date of access: 2009-06-14

ArtsNordica, URL:
http://www.artsnordica.com/index.php?page=484e47055faa1&link_id=484523bfe94c4&lang
_id=0 Date of access: 2009-06-14

ArtsNordica: URL: http://www.artsnordica.com/index.php?page=484e47055faa1 Date of
access: 2009-06-14

Thorsén, S-M. (2001), *Mångkultur, världskultur och andra kulturer*, URL:
http://stigmagnus.blog.com/2010/05/14/mangkultur-varldskultur-och-andra-kulturer/ Date of
access: 2010-05-17

Mellergård, Anna. "Re: Uppsatsen på Nordica", Email. 8 June 2009.

7 APPENDIX

7.1 ATTACHMENT A: Interview Manual, Personnel, Manager

Introduction questions
How long have you been working with TCG Nordica?

What is your task here at TCG Nordica?

Do you have background in cultural work?
Organizational?
Practicing artist of any kind?

How
Can you tell me how you work at TCG Nordica?
What different activities are there?
What made you chose are these activities?

Who and what
Can you tell me about what kind of people one can meet at TCG Nordica?

What artists do you include at TCG Nordica? What criteria settle this decision?

What people come to TCG Nordica as visitors?
Does this correspond with whom you aim to attract?
What visitors do you aim to attract?
Can you define in what way these are interesting for TCG Nordica?

What art forms do you include at TCG Nordica?

What art do you include? What criteria settle this decision?

Purpose – Dialogue and Understanding
Can you tell me about the goals and purpose with the work of TCG Nordica?

On your webpage it says that ArtsNordica's purpose is:
"…*providing a platform for dialogue and understanding across different cultures and belief systems, emphasizing human dignity, equality, respect and friendship*'"
Can you describe this further?
How does this take shape at TCG Nordica?
How would you define the concept dialogue?
In what way do you work to increase the dialogue and understanding of people?

How would you define human dignity? In what ways are TCG Nordica working for human dignity?
How would you define equality? In what ways are TCG Nordica working for equality?
How would you define respect? In what ways are TCG Nordica working for respect?
How would you define friendship? In what ways are TCG Nordica working for friendship?

What is the background to this purpose?

On your website it also says that your vision is to "*Stimulating reflection on human worth as expressed in various art forms*".
Can you describe this further?

The cultural meeting
TCG Nordica is described as a cross-cultural environment, can you elaborate on this?
What do you mean with a cross-cultural environment?
How do you work with the cultural meetings that occur at TCG Nordica?
What is the background to the choice of working with different cultures?
What are the benefits and what are the challenges?
In your opinion, how can the artists involved at TCG Nordica learn from each other?

How would you describe a good and fruitful culture meeting?
What are the results of such a good and fruitful culture meeting?
What are the prerequisites for a good and fruitful meeting?
Organizational?
Individually?
In you opinion, in what way does TCG Nordica work to create these prerequisites?

Art as a way
At ArtsNordica's website is says: *"We believe that one of the best ways to enhance communication between people and so break down culture and language barriers is through the Arts"*
Can you explain this further?
In you opinion what makes Arts are such an efficient way of working?
In your opinion, is art important for human beings? In what way?
In you opinion, is a place like TCG Nordica is important? In what way?
Do you think one can have a dialogue through art?
Can you describe the process taking place?
Can you give an example?
In your opinion, can one get and give response to art? In what way?

Effects
Can you tell me about the effects that you see of the cultural work at TCG Nordica?

On your website one can read that through different kinds of artistic activities "*new opportunities are created for people to learn more about themselves and others in the spirit of friendship, openness, respect and mutuality*".
Can you explain this further?

How would you define openness? In what ways are TCG Nordica working for openness?

How would you define mutuality? In what ways are TCG Nordica working for mutuality?

What do you think are the reasons for artists to take part in TCG Nordica's work?
From your experience, what do you think the artists learn?
About oneself? Ones culture?
About the other? Their culture?
About art?
What would you want them to learn?

How do you think their art get affected/influenced by the cross-cultural environment at TCG Nordica?

How does the cooperation work?
                Between artists?
Between artists and TCG Nordica?
Do you think the cross-cultural environment affects these cooperations in any way?

What do you think are the reasons for the visitors to come to TCG Nordica?
From your experience, what do you think the visitors learn?
About oneself? Ones culture?
About the other? Their culture?
About art?
What would you want them to learn?

Strengths and weaknesses
What do you find is the strengths of the way you are working at TCG Nordica?
What are the challenges?
What do you want to develop?

Other
- From your experience, what aspects are important for dialogue and understanding to take place within the cooperations?

-Is there anything you want to add that you think is important that we haven't covered yet?

7.2 ATTACHMENT B: Interview Manual, Personnel, Gallery/Stage

Introduction questions
How long have you been working here at TCG Nordica?

What is your task here at TCG Nordica?

Have you had any other tasks at TCG Nordica before your current one?

Do you have background in cultural work?
Organizational?
Practicing artist of any kind?

How
Can you tell me about how you work with the gallery/stage at TCG Nordica?
What different activities are there?
What made you chose are these activities chosen?

Who and what
Can you tell me about what kind of people one can meet at TCG Nordica?

What **artists** do you include? What criteria settle this decision?

What people come to the gallery's/stage's events as **visitors**?
Does this correspond with whom you aim to attract?
What visitors do you aim to attract?
Can you define in what way these are interesting for TCG Nordica and the gallery/stage?

What **art forms** do you include at the gallery/stage?

What **art** do you include at the gallery/stage? What criteria settle this decision?

Purpose
Can you tell me about the goals and purpose with the work of the gallery/stage?

On your webpage it says that ArtsNordica's purpose is:
"*…providing a platform for dialogue and understanding across different cultures and belief systems, emphasizing human dignity, equality, respect and friendship*'"
Can you describe this further?
How does this take shape at the gallery/stage?
How would you define the concept dialogue?
In what way do you work to increase the **dialogue** and **understanding** of people through the gallery/stage?
How would you define **human dignity**? In what ways are the gallery/stage working for human dignity?
How would you define **equality**? In what ways are the gallery/stage working for equality?
How would you define **respect**? In what ways are the gallery/stage working for respect?
How would you define **friendship**? In what ways are the gallery/stage working for friendship?

On your website it also says that your vision is to "*Stimulating reflection on human worth as expressed in various art forms*".
Can you describe this further?

The cultural meeting
TCG Nordica is described as a cross-cultural environment, can you elaborate on this?
How does this apply to the gallery/stage?
How do you work with the cultural meetings that occur at the gallery/stage?
What are the benefits and what are the challenges to work with different cultures?

How would you describe a **good and fruitful culture meeting**?
What are the results of such a good and fruitful culture meeting?
What are the prerequisites for a good and fruitful meeting?
Organizational?
Individually?
In you opinion, in what way does the gallery/stage work to create these prerequisites?

Art as a way
At ArtsNordica's website is says: *"We believe that one of the best ways to enhance communication between people and so break down culture and language barriers is through the Arts"*
Can you explain this further?
In you opinion what makes Arts are such an efficient way of working?
In your opinion, is art important for human beings? In what way?
In you opinion, is a place like TCG Nordica is important? In what way?
Do you think one can have a dialogue through art?
Can you describe the process taking place?
Can you give an example?
In your opinion, can one get and give response to art? In what way?

Effects
Can you tell me about the effects that you see of the cultural work at TCG Nordica?

On your website one can read that through different kinds of artistic activities *"new opportunities are created for people to learn more about themselves and others in the spirit of friendship, openness, respect and mutuality"*.
Can you explain this further?

How would you define **openness**? In what ways are TCG Nordica working for openness?
How would you define **mutuality**? In what ways are TCG Nordica working for mutuality?

What do you think are the reasons for **artists** to take part in TCG Nordica's gallery/stage?
From your experience, what do you think the artists learn?
About oneself? Ones culture?
About the other? Their culture?
About art?
What would you want them to learn?

How do you think their **art** get affected/influenced by the cross-cultural environment at TCG Nordica?

From you experience, how does the **cooperation** work?
            Between artists?
Between artists and TCG Nordica?
Do you think the cross-cultural environment affects these co-operations in any way?

What do you think are the reasons for the **visitors** to come to TCG Nordica?
From your experience, what do you think the visitors learn?
About oneself? Ones culture?
About the other? Their culture?
About art?
What would you want them to learn?

Strengths and weaknesses
What do you find is the strengths of the gallery/stage at TCG Nordica?
What are the challenges?
What do you want to develop?

Other
- From your experience, what aspects are important for dialogue and understanding to take place within the cooperations?

Is there anything you want to add that you think is important that we haven't covered yet?

7.3 ATTACHMENT C: Interview Manual, Personnel, ArtsNordica

Introduktionsfrågor
Hur länge har du arbetat med ArtsNordica och TCG Nordica?

Vad är din uppgift?

Vad är din bakgrund när det gäller kulturarbete?
    Organisatoriskt?
    Praktiserande konstnär av något slag?

Hur?
Kan du berätta för mej hur ni arbetar på ArtsNordica och TCG Nordica?
Vilka olika aktiviteter har ni?

Vem och vad?
Vilka kulturarbetare inkluderar ni i erat arbeta? På vilka kriterier tas de besluten?

Vilka konstformer inkluderar ni i ert arbete på ArtsNoridca?

Vad avgör vilken konst ni väljer att ta med i ert arbete?

Vilka människor kommer till ArtsNordicas events som publik?
Stämmer detta med vilka ni önskar ska komma?

Syfte – Dialog och förståelse
Kan du berätta om ArtsNordicas mål och syfte?

På er hemsida star det att ArtsNordicas syfte är:
”…*providing a platform for dialogue and understanding across different cultures and belief systems, emphasizing human dignity, equality, respect and friendship*’”
Kan du beskriva detta vidare?
På vilket sätt gestaltar sig detta?

Hur skulle du definiera begreppet dialog?
På vilket sätt arbetar ni för att öka dialog och förståelse mellan människor med olika kulturell bakgrund?

Hur skulle du definiera **human dignity**, e**quality**, **respect** och **friendship**?
På vilket sätt arbetar ArtsNordica för detta?

Vad är bakgrunden till detta syftet?

På er hemsida står det att er vision är att: “*Stimulating reflection on human worth as expressed in various art forms*”.
Kan du beskriva det vidare?

Kulturmöten
TCG Nordica är beskrivet som en "cross-cultural environment", kan du berätta mer om det?
Vad menar ni med en "cross-cultural environment"?
Hur arbetar ni med dessa crosscultural möten?
Vad är fördelarna och vad är utmaningarna?
Hur skulle du beskriva ett bra kulturmöte?

Utifrån din erfarenhet, vad i hur ett kulturprojekt är organiserat kan öka dialog, förståelse och ett gott samarbete mellan de olika kulturarbetarna?

Utifrån din erfarenhet, vad i hur ett kulturprojekt är organiserat kan försvåra dialog, förståelse och ett gott samarbete mellan de olika kulturarbetarna?

Art as a way
På ArtsNordicas hemsida kan man läsa: *"We believe that one of the best ways to enhance communication between people and so break down culture and language barriers is through the Arts"*
Kan du berätta mer om det?

Vad, enligt dig, gör konst av olika slag ett så bra sätt att arbeta för dialog och förståelse?
Tror du man kan ha en dialog genom olika konstformer?
    På vilket sätt gestaltar sej denna dialog?
    Kan du ge ett exempel?
Enligt din åsikt, kan man ge respons på konst? På vilket sätt?

Enligt din åsikt, är konst viktigt för människan? På vilket sätt?

Resultat
Kan du berätta om vilka resultat ni ser utav ArtsNordicas och TCG Nordicas arbete?

På er hemsida kan man läsa att genom olika konstnärliga aktiviteter: *"new opportunities are created for people to learn more about themselves and others in the spirit of friendship, openness, respect and mutuality"*.

Kan du berätta mer om detta?

Hur skulle du definiera **openness** och **mutuality**? På vilket sätt arbetar TCG Nordica för detta?

Vad tror du är anledningen till att konstnärer av olika slag vill vara en del utav ArtNordicas projekt?

Utifrån din erfarenhet, vad tror du att konstnärerna lär sig?
    Om sig själva och sin kultur?
    Om de andra och deras kultur?
    Om konst?

Vad skulle du vilja att de lärde sig?

Hur påverkas deras konst utav cross-cultural environment som beskrivs på TCG Nordicas hemsida?

Hur fungerar samarbetet?
    Mellan olika konstnärer?
    Mellan konstnärerna och ArtsNordica?
    Tror du att denna cross-cultural environment påverkar samarbetet på något sätt? På vilket sätt?

Utifrån din erfarenhet, vad lär sej de som besöker ArtsNordicas events?
    Om sig själva och sin kultur?
    Om de andra och deras kultur?
    Om konst?
Vad skulle du vilja att de lärde sig?

Styrka och svagheter
Vad tycker du är styrkan med ArtsNordica och TCG Nordica?
Vad är utmaningarna?
Vad skulle du vilja förbättra?

Övrigt
Är det något som du skulle vilja tillägga som vi inte har pratat om än som du tycker är relevant?

7.4 ATTACHMENT D: Interview Manual, Artist

Introduction questions
What do you do as an artist?
What is your relation to TCG Nordica?
How long have you been working with TCG Nordica?

What projects and events have you been working in at TCG Nordica?

Cooperation
Who have you been cooperating with at TCG Nordica?
In what way did you cooperate?
How did that cooperation work?
What was good and what was challenging?

Organization
How was the project/projects organized?
From you experience, how is a cultural project organized to benefit a good cooperation between artists with different cultural backgrounds?
        Can you give an example?
From your experiences what make the cooperation between artists with different cultural backgrounds difficult?
        Can you give an example?

Meeting
In your opinion, in what way can one show **respect** to each other as **artists** cooperating?
In your opinion have this been the case?
In your opinion, in what way do you think **TCG Nordica** can show **respect** towards the artists?
In your opinion have this been the case?

Have you felt that you and the other artists have been **equals**?
How would you define equals?
Have you worked on equal basis?
Have everyone been listen to in the same way?

Have you developed any **friendships** through TCG Nordica?
How did you become friends?
How would you define friendship?

What have you appreciated about the cooperation with TCG Nordica?
From your experience are there anything that can be approved? What?

Effects
What do you feel that you have learnt through your work at TCG Nordica?
Do you think you've learnt something about **yourself** through your work at TCG Nordica?
        What?
        As a human being?
        As a artist?

About your culture?

How do you think you learnt this?

Did you learn anything about the **others artists** your cooperation?

In what way?

How do you think you learnt this?

Do you think the other artists learnt anything **about you** through your work at TCG Nordica?

In what way?

How did you thought of them develop through the cooperation?

Why do you think the **visitors** come to TCG Nordica?

What do you think the visitors learn?

About themselves and their culture?

About others and their culture?

About art?

Do you think about the **audience** when you work? In what way?

Does the audience affected your art and artistic process in any way?

Do you think the fact that the audience might be from different cultural backgrounds affects your art? In what way?

What would you want the audience to experience from your art?

Art

What are reason that you've chosen to do art?

Do you think one can have a **dialogue** through art?

In what way?

Can you describe the process taking place?

Can you give an example?

Can one get and/or give **response** to art? In that case how? (If no: why not?)

What?

How?

From?

Has that affected you? How?

Have your **art** and your **artistic process** been affected by your work at TCG Nordica?

In what way?

What affected you?

Through interaction with other cultures?

Other

What **benefits** do you think there is to be a part of TCG Nordica's work?

- From your experience, what aspects are important for dialogue and understanding to take place within the cooperations?

Is there **anything** you want to add that you think is important?

7.5 ATTACHMENT E: Letter of information

To whom it may concern,

My name is Emanuelle Brandstöm and I am a student at the University of Gothenburg, Sweden. I am attending a four and a half year program at the Academy of Music and Drama to become a singing-, improvisation- and music teacher. I am graduating in August 2009. I was a volunteer at TCG Nordica 2002/2003 working primarily with the Stage program.

I am here in Kunming and TCG Nordica to do research for my final paper for my University degree. I have received a scholarship called "Minor Field Study" administrated by the International Programme Office and financed by the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida. For more information see letter attached from the Internationella Programkontoret.

I will study if and how music- and other aesthetic cultural meetings can increase dialogue, interaction and understanding between people with different cultural backgrounds. I will do this through interviews with staff, artists and visitors at TCG Nordica. I will possibly also do observations. I hope to learn more about the affects of TCG Nordica's cultural work, how they've chosen to work and why. I believe that dialogue, interaction, communication and understanding between people are prerequisites to create a fair and positive development, both globaly and locally.

I am very grateful to everyone who participates and who allow me to learn from their work and experiences. But every one has the right to say that they don't want to be a part of the research. The people that have agreed to participate in my research have the right to stop their participation at any point up until the paper has been published if they, by any reason, find that they don't want to be a part of the research any longer. Everyone who participates will be treated with anonymity in the paper if not other agreements has been made. The material I acquire during my research will be treated with confidentiality; only my advisor at the University of Gothenburg and I will access it. The material I acquire during my research will only be used within science. The paper will be published at the University of Gothenburg and can also be accessed through the International Programme Office.

If any questions arise during my research please feel free to ask me!

Emanuelle Brandström
Student at the university of Gothenburg, Sweden